



Mapping the construction of justice and justice related tensions in Europe – A comparative report of National Media Debates on (Minority) Education in Six Countries

Dorota Lepianka

This Report was written within the framework of Work Package 4 “Political, advocacy and media discourse of justice and fairness”



Funded by the Horizon 2020
Framework Programme of the European Union

Acknowledgements

This report would not have been possible without the contribution of researchers who have prepared country reports (listed in the Bibliography section): Wanda Tiefenbacher and Livia Perschy (ETC-Graz, Austria), Agnes Kende (CEU, Hungary), Mara Bicas, Maria Paula Meneses and Laura Brito (CES, Portugal), Duygun Ruben and Oğuzhan Hışıl (Bogazici Universitesi, Turkey), Susan Divald (University of Bristol, the United Kingdom) and Jing Hiah, Simon de Jong (the Netherlands). Their contribution, patience in answering questions and advice have been invaluable.



Want to learn more about what we are working on?

Visit us at:

Website: <https://ethos-europe.eu>

Facebook: www.facebook.com/ethosjustice/

Blog: www.ethosjustice.wordpress.com

Twitter: www.twitter.com/ethosjustice

Hashtag: #ETHOSjustice

Youtube: www.youtube.com/ethosjustice

European Landscapes of Justice (web) app: <http://myjustice.eu/>

This publication has been produced with the financial support of the Horizon 2020 Framework Programme of the European Union. The contents of this publication are the sole responsibility of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission.

Copyright © 2019, ETHOS consortium – All rights reserved ETHOS project

The ETHOS project has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement No. 727112

About ETHOS

ETHOS - Towards a European Theory Of Justice and fairness, is a European Commission Horizon 2020 research project that seeks to provide building blocks for the development of an empirically informed European theory of justice and fairness. The project seeks to do so by:

- a) refining and deepening the knowledge on the European foundations of justice - both historically based and contemporary envisaged;
- b) enhancing awareness of mechanisms that impede the realisation of justice ideals as they are lived in contemporary Europe;
- c) advancing the understanding of the process of drawing and re-drawing of the boundaries of justice (fault lines); and
- d) providing guidance to politicians, policy makers, advocacies and other stakeholders on how to design and implement policies to reserve inequalities and prevent injustice.

ETHOS does not merely understand justice as an abstract moral ideal, that is universal and worth striving for. Rather, it is understood as a re-enacted and re-constructed "lived" experience. The experience is embedded in firm legal, political, moral, social, economic and cultural institutions that are geared to giving members of society what is their due.

In the ETHOS project, justice is studied as an interdependent relationship between the ideal of justice, and its real manifestation – as set in the highly complex institutions of modern European societies. The relationship between the normative and practical, the formal and informal, is acknowledged and critically assessed through a multi-disciplinary approach.

To enhance the formulation of an empirically-based theory of justice and fairness, ETHOS will explore the normative (ideal) underpinnings of justice and its practical realisation in four heuristically defined domains of justice - social justice, economic justice, political justice, and civil and symbolic justice. These domains are revealed in several spheres:

- a) philosophical and political tradition,
- b) legal framework,
- c) daily (bureaucratic) practice,
- d) current public debates, and
- e) the accounts of the vulnerable populations in six European countries (the Netherlands, the UK, Hungary, Austria, Portugal and Turkey).

The question of drawing boundaries and redrawing the fault-lines of justice permeates the entire investigation.

Alongside Utrecht University in the Netherlands who coordinate the project, five further research institutions cooperate. They are based in Austria (European Training and Research Centre for Human Rights and Democracy), Hungary (Central European University), Portugal (Centre for Social Studies), Turkey (Boğaziçi University), and the UK (University of Bristol). The research project lasts from January 2017 to December 2019

Executive Summary

The role of media in informing and influencing public discourse is hard to overestimate. By creating, selecting, steering and shaping information for public consumption, media influence public discourse. Through media politics is able to direct public attention toward some and away from other objective or putative condition. Media may also constitute an important outlet for popular discontent with existing policies and practices. Various stakeholders may also mobilize media, and/or public opinion via media, for strategic advantage, for example, during periods of important social reforms.

Against this background, the primary goal of Deliverable 4.4 on (social) media representation of (minority) claims to justice is, in line with Task 4.4, to facilitate the understanding of dominant representation of justice claims through an analysis of (social) media content. Analysis of the media content undertaken as part of our investigation is, therefore, the *means* to (1) shed light on the nature of justice claims evoked in public space; and (2) to identify tensions between different types of justice claims and claims of different social categories. As a consequence, our analysis focuses on mapping the claims of various social categories as discursively constructed in a variety of (social) media and exploring the nature of justice related tensions that – in the light of the media content – appear most pertinent.

Considering the “muddle” of justice debates, the proliferation of ideas about what constitutes justice and injustice, and plurality of justice conceptions circulating in public space (described also in D4.2), in the current study, we have decided to focus explicitly on the discursive construction of justice claims in news media debates on *education*. Our choice was driven by the unique position of education-related debates in public discourse. First, due to universality of ‘educational experience’, educational debates invariably resonate with large sections of any (Western) society. Second, as discussed in ETHOS reports D4.3 and D3.6, the role of education in the realization of *justice* is highly ambiguous. Third, due to its crucial role in the production and reproduction of social identities and positioning, and its significance for the formation (and transmission) of values and the ways to understand common good, education related debates seem to constitute a particularly fruitful site for the exploration of the (discursive constriction of) tensions the realisation of justice can generate.

In each of the participating countries researchers were requested to analyse a collection of carefully selected *news* clips that related to recent or on-going educational controversy or debate touching upon compulsory education. Our interest in *news* media was driven by their relative popularity among various population groups, their strong connection with politics, receptiveness of the most pertinent societal debates, and effects news stories have on activating public expression and increasing individual involvement in public discussion of major social and political issues. The choice of to-be-analysed news media was driven by: the specificity of the media landscape in a given country, the popularity of specific outlets among the different sections of the population, the ideological profile and the format of the various media. The analysis of the selected news clips involved qualitative content analysis with elements of discourse analysis.

While our analysis affirms the usefulness of Fraser’s analytical lens in disentangling the various forms of injustice that take place in the realm of education (and beyond), it also confirms assertions of other researchers that Fraser’s tripartite typology is not necessarily exhaustive to account for all types of injustices. Alternative claims to justice, such as claims based on civil right and liberties, claims to procedural justice, claims understood in the spirit of capabilities and functionings, claims to epistemic justice, historical justice and justice as redress often run across the three ideal-typical facets of redistribution, recognition and representation. Moreover, our analysis shows how

the various education-related grievances extend beyond the school setting and question the entirety of social relations, their normative underpinnings and the power structure that legitimizes them.

The analysis sheds light on the mediated construction of tensions between various claims to justice, tensions between different understandings of justice claims and tensions between the principles that govern the realisation of justice. Particularly striking in the analysed material is the media representation of tensions between justice claims by different groups, or the 'who' of justice. Much of the analysis shows how tensions between the various understandings of justice (the 'what' of justice, or the conceptual dilemmas) and/or moral grounds for the realisation of justice (the 'how' and the 'why' of justice, or the moral dilemmas) are entwined with inter-group conflicts and tensions between justice claims of different groups. It also shows how, especially in the more polarized settings (left-wing vs right-wing media), injustices experienced by different groups tend to be evaluated according to different (moral) standards. Striking, for example, is the presence of a belief, voiced in particular in more conservative or right-wing media outlets, that some forms of inequality are natural, 'deserved' and/or inevitable, and thus no injustice at all. Another important, albeit often unspoken, question revolves around the issue of victimhood.

Interestingly, despite differences between the socio-political and cultural contexts and the fact that in each country a different minority-related controversy in the realm of education was investigated, the themes and arguments evoked in the debates proved rather similar, testifying to the universality of specific justice considerations and commonness of justice-related tensions, at least in educational matters. Strikingly, in comparison to political discourses reconstructed in D4.2, the media discourses with respect to justice in education seem far less eclectic and more polarised along ideological left/right or conservative/liberal divisions.

Table of Content

Acknowledgments	<i>i</i>
Executive Summary	<i>iv</i>
Table of Content	<i>vi</i>
Introduction	1
Analytical framework	4
Methodology	7
Sampling	7
Analytical strategy	8
Overview national reports	9
Results	12
Main controversies underpinning the analysed debates	13
How is Fraser’s typology present?	15
Redistribution	15
Recognition	17
Representation	24
Other notions of justice present in the debates	25
(Civil) rights and liberties	25
Procedural justice & double standards	26
Capabilities & adaptive preferences	27
Epistemic justice	28
Justice as redress	31
Justice as protection (& freedom from ontological fear)	32
Tensions identified	32
Tensions between facets of justice	33
Tensions related to the principles of justice & the moral grounds for justice	35
Tensions between groups	36
Tensions related to the scope of responsibility	39
Tensions & visions of good life and common good	41
Note on framing devices	42
Reason vs emotions	43
Level of engagement with the opponent	46
Use of multimodality	47
Users’ comments	49

Discussion and Conclusions	50
Sex and gender inequality in media reporting on education-related justice	53
Bibliography	55
Appendices I – Background information on debates selected for the analysis, media landscapes and sampling procedure per country	59
Austria	59
Hungary	71
Netherlands	80
Portugal	89
Turkey	99
The United Kingdom	130
Appendices II – Guidelines to Task 4.4	135
D4.4 Media Screening Request – Preparation for TASK 4.4	135
D4.4 Research Guidelines to Task 4.4: Mapping the construction of justice claims in (social) media	138

Introduction

The role of media in informing and influencing public discourse is hard to overestimate (van Dijk, 1988). By creating, selecting, steering and shaping information for public consumption, media generate points of view, influence perceptions, enhance aspirations, strengthen anxieties, feed moral panics, promote social agendas, frame problems and contribute to strengthening or undermining support for specific policies, practices and ideologies (e.g. Anderson, 2007; Fitzgerald and Housley, 2016; Gerstl-Pepin, 2007; McCombs and Reynolds, 2009). Through media, politics is able to direct public attention toward some and away from other objective or putative condition and thus contribute to a specific rank-ordering of ‘social problems’ that demand public attention (see also D4.2 by Lepianka, 2018). Various stakeholders may also mobilize media, and/or public opinion via media, for strategic advantage, for example, during periods of important social reforms. Finally, media, constitute an important outlet for popular discontent with existing policies and practices.

Against this background, the goal of this report is, in line with ETHOS Task 4.4, to facilitate the understanding of dominant/popular representations of justice claims through an analysis of (social) media content. Analysis of the media content is, therefore, the *means* (1) to shed light on the nature of justice claims evoked in public space; and (2) to identify tensions between different types of justice claims and claims of different social categories, with special attention given to justice claims of minority groups. As a consequence, our analysis focuses on mapping the claims of various social categories as discursively constructed in a variety of (social) media and exploring the nature of justice related tensions that – in the light of the media content – appear most pertinent.

As discussed in ETHOS Deliverable 4.2 (Lepianka, 2018), conceptualisations of ‘discourse’ vary. The term is notoriously imprecise and has been used to denote, among other things, a narrative, a text, talk, speech, conversation, interview, debate, policy, political strategy, ideology, knowledge system but also language *per se* and/or language associated with a specific field of social practice (cf. Fairclough, 2010; Wodak, 2008; Wodak and Meyer, 2016). Bergström, Ekström and Boréus (2017) distinguish between three types of meaning of ‘discourse’: in the most narrow sense discourse denotes a cohesive chunk of text (written or spoken), in a broader sense discourse relates to “linguistic aspects of social practice”, and in the broadest sense it encompasses linguistic and non-linguistic aspects of social processes that partake in the creation of meaning (p. 209). Other meanings of discourse encompass: ‘discourse’ as a particular (ideological) perspective on, or an understanding of, a phenomenon and ‘discourse’ as patterns of defining a specific phenomenon in a particular context. It is the latter understanding of discourse that guides our current study into the ‘discursive construction’ of justice claims and justice-related tensions in the media. We thus understand ‘discursive construction’ in terms of narratives employed to convey a specific understanding of justice and injustice, which may or may not be embedded in or correspond to the ‘material reality’ of (in)justice.

Our approach is rooted in critical realism as developed by Bhaskar that builds on the presumption of a dialectical relationship between discourse and other elements of the social world (Fairclough, 2010). Within this perspective discourse is seen as both constitutive of and being constituted by the (social) world. ‘It is constitutive,’ write

Fairclough and Wodak (1997), ‘in a sense that it helps to sustain and reproduce the social status quo, and in the sense that it contributes to transforming it’ (p. 258). In other words, discourse simultaneously reflects and shapes social order and it both limits and enables various ways of ‘seeing’ the ‘material reality.’ Based on our finding in Deliverable 4.2, as well as the assertions of other authors (Connaughton et al., 2017), we assume that public consciousness (manifested, among other things, in media ‘texts’) consists of multiple discourses that are often connected with one another, and potentially influential when brought to bear on material practices. It is therefore the multiplicity of the ‘discursive constructions’ of justice and tensions they imply that we specifically focus on.

For the purpose of the current study, we delimit the scope of our research to the context of education-related debates in broadly understood *news* media. Our interest in the *news* media is driven by their relative popularity among various population groups, their strong connection with politics, receptiveness of the most pertinent societal debates, and the effect news stories have on activating public expression and on increasing individual involvement in public discussion of major issues of public policy and politics (cf. Gerstl-Pepn, 2007; King et al., 2017). As noted by various authors, news media constitute an important site for the practices of ‘monitorial citizenship,’ understood as watchful scanning of the (social, political) environment for events, issues or processes that require attention and engagement (Deuze, 2008; Zaller, 2003). Moreover, through their digital and print materiality, they provide means for political mobilization: for ‘becoming political’ and for ‘acting politically’ (Piotrowski and Ruitenberg, 2015: 345). Relevant for our choice of *news* media as the ‘site’ of our investigation is also the ubiquity of alternative sources of news that offer citizens diverse perspectives from which to construct their worldviews and inform their participation in social issues – *news* is currently transmitted not only through traditional media (print or broadcast) but also through social media (such as thematic (news) blogs, Twitter, or Facebook), in which the media consumers often become media (co-)producers. While this ubiquity is often seen as democratizing, it is also likely to lead to more targeted and individualised news consumption, with individuals reaching out only for the news which they believe will matter for them as individuals or citizens (Deuze, 2008; Piotrowski and Ruitenberg, 2015). Since various news media compete and complement one another in the information and views they provide, studying a variety of news sources is likely to provide valuable insight into the diversity of voices, arguments and standpoints ‘on the market’ of (political) ideas about justice.

Considering the ‘muddle’ of justice debates, the proliferation of ideas about what constitutes justice and injustice (Seddon, 2003), and plurality of justice conceptions circulating in public space (described also in D4.2), in the current study we decided to focus explicitly on the discursive construction of justice claims in media debates on *education*. Our choice was driven by the unique position of education-related debates in public discourse. First, due to universality of ‘educational experience,’ educational debates invariably resonate with large sections of any (Western) society. After all, every adult has the experience of schooling and every (grand)parent has a vital interest

in the schooling of their (grand)children.¹ Second, as discussed in ETHOS deliverables D4.3 and D3.6, the role of education in the realization of *justice* is highly ambiguous (cf. Power, 2012). On the one hand, due to its contribution to the eradication of persistent inequalities, (fair) distribution of life chances, promotion of social mobility and protection against social risks (cf. DiStasio and Solga, 2017; Francis et al., 2017), education is deemed instrumental in the realisation of social justice. Moreover, due to the part it plays in the nurturing and transmission of cultural heritage, education is also seen as a site for the realisation of cultural rights (cf. Salát, 2019). On the other, however, education is frequently considered an important source of *injustice* (cf. Anderson et al., 2018; Buğra and Akkan, 2019; Salát, 2019). The focus on excellence, inherent to most educational systems,² is per definition exclusionary (Walzer, 1983). Moreover, by forming and transforming individual and social identities, and cultivating specific (dominant) ways of doing and being, education is believed to contribute to the (re)production of social identities and positionings (Walzer, 1983; Vincent, 2003). While this might be enabling – education may contribute to the development of a sense of belonging to the society (cf. Buğra and Akkan, 2019), it may also lead to the freezing of particular statuses and unequal power relations (cf. Anderson et al., 2018), and – in consequence – reproduction of social inequalities (cf. DiStasio and Solga, 2017; Francis et al., 2017; Walzer, 1983). Third, due to the crucial role of education in the (re-)production of social identities, and its significance for the formation (and transmission) of values and the ways to understand common good, contemporary debates about education are rooted in and reflective of broader, often fundamental, societal disputes about (and between) conflicting visions of common good and good life.³

All in all, education constitutes an important site of *struggles for justice*, where controversies over the primacy of different types of claims to justice, different understandings of similar claims, moral grounds on which claims are made and/or the claims of different social groups are particularly heightened. As a consequence, education-related debates form a particularly fruitful site for the exploration of the (discursive construction of) tensions the realisation of justice can generate. Appreciating the role of news media in bringing about and reinforcing certain meanings, we believe that focusing our analysis on educational debates that take place, or are reported, in the news media will allow us to tap those aspects of justice and justice-related tensions that have become most salient in various national context, most reflective of the current norms and ways of life, and/or which may become constitutive in shaping social order in the (near) future. Furthermore, through the analytical framework applied, our analysis of the mediated debates on education, which encompasses the content of news reporting as well as the audience's engagement with this content, allows exploring how the tripartite framework of justice developed by Nancy Fraser resonates in debates on one of the most fundamental fields of state policy, and mapping any conceptions of justice that extend beyond Fraser's typology. As such the current work builds on the previous ETHOS output (especially D3.6 and D4.3) and contributes to the overall goals of ETHOS.

¹ This importance of education as a domain of social life and a policy area is reflected, for example, in the strong support of European citizens for increased investments in education, relative to other parts of the welfare state (Busemeyer et al., 2018; Garritzmann et al., 2018).

² Alternative educational approaches, like Waldorf education, also known as Steiner education, that strive to develop pupils' intellectual, artistic and practical skills in a holistic and integrated manner constitute notable counter examples. However, their position within national educational systems is usually rather marginal.

³ Recently, this has been exemplified in heated debates around ideologically driven educational reforms in Austria (see note on Austria in Appendix 1) and Poland.

In this report, we focus specifically on debates related to compulsory education, primary and secondary, and the ways (in)justice within formal educational system affects (the future of) children and adolescents. We focus in particular on tensions that arise in debates on justice for youth belonging to ethnic and cultural minorities, that is groups that are more likely to be affected by school failure, school segregation and educational exclusion (Pantea, 2015), but also groups for whom the negotiation of identities and the manoeuvring between the various value sets, definitions of ‘knowledge’ and the standards according to which the ‘aptitude’ and ‘excellence’ is being evaluated might be most challenging.

Analytical framework

Within ETHOS, distinction is made between analytically separable yet practically interwoven facets of justice included by Nancy Fraser in a tripartite framework of recognition, representation and re-distribution (Knijn et al., 2018). Linked most explicitly to socio-economic arrangements that determine the distribution of burdens and benefits in a society, within the realm of education, redistributive justice is often evoked to denote equality of access to (quality) education and the impact education inequalities exert on the opportunities and life chances of children from various social backgrounds and reproduction of economic dis/advantage. It might relate as well to educational practices and/or pedagogic approaches that via deficit understandings and low expectations about learners from vulnerable groups undermine their academic achievement thus obstructing economic justice. Education policies geared at minimizing maldistribution encompass reallocation of resources (material and non-material) to socio-economically disadvantaged students, or schools serving them, to support these students’ school retention, participation and achievement, for example, via compensatory educational programmes (Keddie, 2012; Power, 2012).

Justice understood in recognitive terms is about the relative standing of a person vis-à-vis others (Knijn et al., 2018). It implies absence of cultural domination, marginalisation in public sphere, cultural and social invisibility, and disrespect and disparagement in everyday life. As noted in ETHOS deliverable 4.3 (Buğra and Akkan, 2019), recognition related injustices in the realm of education might manifest themselves, among other things, in blindness to cultural differences and/or stigmatization of such differences in school settings, for example by privileging of dominant (white) culture and middle class values and by marginalising or even silencing the knowledge of the other (Keddie, 2012: 267-69). They may also reveal themselves in ‘constructed distinctiveness’ of individuals or groups, i.e. ascribing to them (excessive) difference they themselves do not experience.

Finally, as noted in other ETHOS deliverables, the idea of justice as representation touches on effective participation in democratic process and capacity to exercise influence on how society’s norms, laws and regulations are being set. Representative justice can be seen as both an end in itself and as a means to achieve distributive and recognitive justice. Within the context of education, representative justice may take the form of incorporating parental voice in the matters of relevance for the education of their children, such as curriculum construction and organization and management of schools (Cribb and Gewirtz, 2003), or securing equal, or at least proportional, representation of minority teachers in overwhelmingly white middle-class school settings (Keddie 2012). In some research, including ETHOS deliverable 4.3 (Buğra and Akkan, 2019) representative justice is also reflected in respecting parental choice of education for their children – not only in terms of quality but also in terms of education that suits best the cultural

and religious sensitivity of the parents/family. Given the provisions of the *Convention on the Rights of the Child* (1989) representative justice in the realm of education should also relate to respecting the views of the child in matters that affect them and the possibility to pursue education that respects their freedom of thought, conscience and religion, and expression.⁴

The various facets of justice, while analytically distinct, are in real life interwoven in a complex and often tensioned way. While in some cases claims mutually *reinforce one another*, i.e. ‘just’ representation might be contingent on recognition and/or ‘just’ redistribution of resources that enable participation, in other cases the realization of some justice claims ‘*crowd out*’ other claims and/or claims of other members of the community. For example, while parental freedom in choosing “the kind of education that shall be given to their children” is a human right (Art 26),⁵ and as such an embodiment of representative justice, it is also a mechanism that could (and does!) help the privileged classes to extend the educational opportunities to their children, often at the expense of children from more vulnerable social milieus. At the same time, the choice of specific type of education for their children (e.g. a vocational school) by parents with low socio-economic status could reflect their adaptive preferences, that is, aspirations and expectations crafted to their (disadvantaged) circumstances, rather than result from their true freedom of choice (see also Buğra and Akkan, 2019: 4). Yet, interplay and/or ‘crowding’ out may take place also within various understandings of the same type of justice claim. For example, when both inattention to difference (and the denial of the uniqueness of a group it implicates) and hypervisibility of specific minority group, for example via essentializing difference, can be a source of recognitive injustice as well as a source of further inequalities. Especially relevant for an educational setting, is the situation in which recognition as a member of a specific minority group (*recognition of difference*) collides with individual need for uniqueness and longing for self-definition that may or may not encompass the minority status (thus recognition of *concrete individuality*) (cf. Knijn and Lepianka, 2018).

Tensions arise as well with respect to the moral grounds of various claims and/or procedural principles that govern different spheres and domains of justice. For example, within popular conceptions of distributive justice three principles are commonly evoked: equity, equality and need (Deutsch 1975; Schwinger 1980; Miller 1992; Miller 1999). According to Deutsch (1975), which principle is used depends on the nature and goal of social relations. Thus equity (desert, merit) is commonly applied when economic productivity is emphasized; equality in situations when fostering social relations based on mutual respect is prioritized; and need when the goal is the fostering of personal development and personal welfare. Similarly, Walzer (1983) claims that principle of desert/merit is central in the realm of work; equality in the sphere of politics and need in the sphere of security and welfare. However, as discussed in ETHOS deliverable D2.1 (Rippon et al., 2018) and D2.3 (Knijn et al., 2018), none of such principles is unambiguous. For example, when discussing justice in the sphere of education, Walzer (1983, ch. 8) points to unresolvable tensions between the principle of *simple equality* that requires similar treatment for all children, and the necessity of *differential* treatment, either due to their disadvantage (the questions of need) or because of their interests and capacity (related to desert). To resolve the tension between equality and pluralism, Walzer develops a concept of *complex equality* that recognizes the plurality of criteria for justice. Other authors draw attention to multifaceted nature of equality and differences between equality of welfare, equality of resources, equality of

⁴ See in particular the Art 12-14 of the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989).

⁵ Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948).

opportunity for welfare or advantage, or equality of capabilities (for a discussion of the concept of ‘equality’ see Gosepath, 2011). Other moral grounds and/or principles that may govern claims to justice are similarly complex and multifaceted. Miller (1999) distinguishes, for example, between *basic* needs – understood as the conditions required for a decent life in *any* society, and *societal* needs – understood as the larger set of requirements for a decent life in the particular society to which one belongs. While the former is non-negotiable, the latter is variable – its definition will depend, among other things, on dominant conceptions of decent life. As noted by Fraser (1989), what is considered ‘legitimate social need’ is subject to continuous struggles between groups with unequal resources.

This brings to the fore the issue of tensions between justice claims of various groups. Some of the central questions relate to whether or not the claims of different groups are mutually exclusive and/or whose well-being is prioritized. Relevant here become questions of power relations and domination either via exclusion of certain voices (by ignoring them or missing them out) or via misrepresentation of common interest in a way that imposes a specific vision of common good that serves the interests of the dominant group (Pettit 2004 in Buğra, 2018, p. 22). A related issue is the tension, discussed by Walzer in the context of education, between the well-being of individuals in a society and the collective well-being/well-functioning of the group/community as a whole (Walzer 1983, ch. 8).

Finally, tensions may arise in relation to responsibility for in/justice. This is a complex question. On the one hand, it may relate to responsibility for the creation and/or maintenance of a just society; on the other hand, it arises with respect to who should bear responsibility for vulnerable groups. ETHOS deliverable D2.1 (Rippon et al., 2018) discusses a divide between theories that link the existence of politically just society to “political and social institutions” such as the legal system or the economic structure and theories that emphasize the role of principles that shape private, personal behaviour and actions (p. 17). A similar divide seems to exist with respect to responsibility for the vulnerable: while some theorists emphasize the responsibility of the state as a crucial actor in alleviating vulnerability, others think that anyone who can assist bears that responsibility (Rippon et al., 2018: 22). Yet, the question of responsibility in matters of justice relates as well to agency in shaping own life and the lives of one’s dependants and to whether or not, or to what extent, an individual can be held responsible for his/her adverse circumstances or status. Many egalitarians, for example, believe that persons who suffer harm or inequality as a result of their voluntary decisions are themselves responsible and deserve no compensation (other than minimal provisions in case of dire need) (Gosepath, 2011).

The primary goal of this study is to uncover how justice is ‘discursively constructed’ in (social) news media discourse in the context of educational debates, and to identify justice-related tensions inherent in those debates, in six countries: Austria, Hungary, the Netherlands, Portugal, Turkey and the United Kingdom, which participate in ETHOS, characterized by divergent historical heritage, differences in political, social policy and legal traditions as well as dissimilarities in their current socio-economic contexts. While the three Fraser’s conceptions of justice constitute the basic reference point of the current study, attention will be also paid to alternative conceptions of justice and/or conceptions that cut across the Fraser’s taxonomy (for discussion see also ETHOS deliverables D2.3 by Knijn et al. (2018) and D7.1 by Knijn and Lepianka (2018)).

Methodology

The analysis presented in this paper synthesizes the results of studies conducted in six European countries: Austria, Hungary, the Netherlands, Portugal, Turkey and the UK. In each country, the analysis encompassed between 23 and 52 carefully selected news clips/items that related to an educational controversy or debate chosen as most relevant to map the dominant ideas about justice and illustrate justice-related tensions in a given country. The analysis covered the multi-modal content of reporting, that is the 'text' as well as the accompanying photo's, illustrations, graphs, hyper-links, embedded Twitter messages, etc., and a selection of audience's comments. While the researchers were offered freedom to choose a (recent) debate that best reflected justice-related tensions in the realm of education in their country, all were asked to follow similar methodology in multi-staged process of data selection and analysis.

Sampling

In each country, the choice of to-be-analysed media (STAGE 1) was driven by the specificity of the 'media landscape' in that country.⁶ Information taken into consideration included: (1) the popularity of specific outlets among the different sections of the population; (2) the ideological profile of the media sources; and (3) their format – traditional: printed and broadcasted vs digital: in the form of on-line news editions, news blogs, Facebook and Twitter posts. With respect to the format, the boundaries between 'traditional' and 'digital' media are often blurred, as most traditional outlets are also present in the digital sphere and communicate their content off- and on-line, for example, via their own websites or social media accounts. In the media selection process balance was sought between: media outlets representing different ideological stance; mainstream media and media addressing a specific target audience; and traditional media and social media.⁷ Moreover each national research team strived for the inclusion of 'alternative media,' that is media produced by and/or focused on the viewpoints of groups that are generally underrepresented in corporate media, such as blogs and websites that disseminate alternative viewpoints. When selecting/sampling media clips/items (STAGE 2) for the analysis, attention was paid to their

⁶ The selection of the to-be-analysed media and the sampling of media clips was proceeded by a careful screening of the national 'media landscape'. In the course of the screening, the researchers gathered information on the relative reach of the media 'outlets' chosen for the analysis (such as readership and circulation in case of newspapers; number of followers in case of a you tube channel/web blog/etc.); status as 'opinion' leader (i.e. whether specific outlets get the status of the most often quoted medium independent of their actual readership/number of followers); the 'ideological' profile of the media outlets selected; the characteristics of the (target) audience following a specific medium. For guidelines informing the screening of media landscapes, please see Appendix 2.

⁷ 'Social media' are understood here as digital platforms for the creation and sharing of user-generated content (e.g. Boyd, 2014 quoted in Lomborg, 2017).

(footnote continued)

relevance for the debate analysed; the inclusion of media clips which combine different modes of communication (text, photos, graphs, audio podcasts, video reports, etc.); and the presence of the on-line comments made by the audiences. The sampling process in each of the cases could be best described as purposeful and iterative; it involved careful and repeated screening of the to-be-analysed media clips in order to select items that best reflected the various claims to justice raised in the educational debate(s) analysed as well as justice related tensions that emerge. The number of media clips included in the sample differed per country and debate analysed (between 23 in the UK and 275 in Turkey). In addition, in different case studies, with the exception of the UK and Turkey, between 63 and 272 of on-line comments by the audience members were analysed.⁸ (For details on the debates chosen for the analysis, the media landscape, and the sampling procedure per country of study, see the following section and Appendix 1.)

Analytical strategy

The analysis of the selected media clips involved qualitative content analysis with elements of discourse analysis and frame analysis. In the process of analysis, the researchers were asked to identify ‘frames’ used in the media to convey a particular understanding of justice and the legitimacy of various claims and/or claims by various groups.⁹ When reconstructing frames, researchers were asked to focus on the reasoning strategies and framing devices.¹⁰ With respect to reasoning strategies the analysis was guided by a set of questions about: (1) *definitions/discursive construction*, explicit and implicit description, of phenomena, concepts, events and actors involved; (2) *causal interpretations*, explanations and/or attributions of responsibility, e.g. for grievances experienced by a specific group (specific minority or majority); presence/absence of agency (who/what is responsible, if anybody/anything); (3) *solutions* advocated, explicitly or implicitly, e.g. to address the grievances; resolve conflicts; prevent or elevate injustice and/or secure justice; and (4) *moral judgments*, including discursive classification of actors, events, phenomena, concepts (positively or negatively) as well as moral arguments evoked to back-up specific standpoints; justify or question the normative rightness of claims. The researchers were asked to map some of the framing (linguistic) devices used, such as: (a) *semantic devices* including the choice of words to denote evaluative attributions of positive or negative traits; synonyms and epithets; collocations; (b) *syntactic devices*, such as impersonal forms (e.g. as a way to refrain from ascribing responsibility); (c) *rhetorical devices*, including allusions,

⁸ While Turkish data did not include audience comments to ‘mainstream’ content, 329 entries to 5 headings of *Ekşi-Sözlük* – a collaborative hypertext on-line ‘dictionary’ were also analysed.

⁹ The concept of ‘frame’ comes from the work of Goffman (1974), who saw ‘frames’ as a way of organizing experience. Put simply, ‘frames’ constitute a specific representation of a problem or phenomenon; they are conceptual tools used by both senders (e.g. media) and receivers (individual members of the public) of messages to convey, interpret and evaluate information (cf. De Vreese, 2005). While journalists inevitably ‘frame’ the presented reality in order to simplify it and make it accessible to a broad audience, the audience uses frames to give meaning and structure to the incoming information (Valkenburg et al., 1999). The use of frames invariably entails a consistent selection of what is being communicated coupled with the persistent emphasis on some and the exclusion of other elements of the reality.

¹⁰ According to Van Gorp (2005), reasoning devices correspond to the four functions of frames as defined by Entman (1993): they define/describe the problem, they provide the moral evaluation of the problem, offer (or fail to offer) the causal interpretation of the problem and suggest/recommend a solution or treatment to the problem. Framing devices, on the other hand, encompass lexical choices, metaphors, catchphrases and allusions as well as a (thematic) selection of information, its sources, exemplification, choice of stereotypes and dramatic characters (Van Gorp, 2005).

metaphors, illustrations, similes, or irony; periphrases (i.e. indirect ways of expressing ideas, e.g. via extensive use of words); (d) *the content of visual elements*, especially photos but also graphics, cartoons and drawings, short videos and podcasts; and (e) *the presence of content of other texts*, e.g. Twitter and FB messages/entries used as an illustration and/or to structure the story. (See Appendix 2 for guidelines for the analysis of media content.) It is important to note that while rooted in the tradition of discourse analytical studies, our analytical approach is very much sociologically-oriented with only limited attention paid to the linguistic analysis *sensu stricto* (cf. Wodak, 2008).

The richness, context specificity and uniqueness of various clusters of arguments (combinations of reasoning strategies and framing devices) that constitute the ‘frames’ in each of the debates studied, make a comparative analysis and/or synthesis of all the results rather challenging. While the various themes, or even arguments, evoked in media debates in various countries are often similar, the constellations of arguments used, i.e. the way they cluster to compose a specific ‘frame’, differ per country. Therefore, the current report does not synthesize the various frames, but constitutes a critical overview of the various conceptualisations of justice that are evoked in education-related debates, the way the tensions between various justice claims and/or claims of various groups are framed, and the way the ‘ins’ and ‘outs’ of the various conceptualisations of justice are constructed. While some attention is paid to the context (thematic, argumentative, linguistic) in which specific ideas of or claims to justice have been evoked, no attempt is made to construct *meta-frames* that would synthesize the national debates into a few (exclusionary) strands. Analytical challenges encountered in the course of the comparative analysis resembled those discussed in ETHOS D4.2 (Lepianka, 2018): the implicitness of justice in the debates analysed and the pitfalls of trying to understand ideas about justice via studying grievances; the entwinement of the various conceptions of justice in the real-life debates; overcoming methodological nationalism and trying to find common vocabulary that would allow mapping the similarities as well as divergences between the national contexts studied.

Overview national reports

In each of the countries under investigation, the researchers were offered freedom to choose the media debate(s) that best reflect justice-related tensions in the realm of education. While certain themes seemed rather universal: in all countries the debates stem from and/or reflect wider disputes in the realm of education about the role of education in the social system, principles that govern access to education, and responsibilities of various (social) actors in the provision and oversight of education, the tensions around the issues of in/justice uncovered in analysed debates were invariably shaped by the socio-political climate in a given country and the historical salience of certain themes. Also the country-specific media landscape, characterized, among other things, by the level of media concentration, ownership, degree of pluralism and the breadth of the ideological spectrum of the mainstream media, as well as the media consumption patterns, has a great influence on the way justice claims and tensions around them are framed.

In **Austria**, the analysis focused on debates around the educational reform, designed and gradually implemented by the new coalition government (between the conservative People’s Party ÖVP and Freedom Party FPÖ) from early 2018. The accompanying public debates, revolved around the normative underpinnings of the reform and the choice of structural measures necessary to realize it. The various strands of the debate touched, among other

things, upon the importance of academic performance, cultural otherness (reflected in language, identity and religion) as a barrier to educational attainment, and socio-economic background in determining access to education and shaping educational success.

Media clips selected for the analysis came from a variety of traditional and digital news media as well as social media. The Austrian media system is considered to be highly concentrated in the hands of a few media groups and a single state actor. This raises doubts as to the plurality, political/ideological independence and social inclusiveness of the mainstream media market, which – at least with respect to print media – seems to be dominated by outlets representing right and centre-right standpoints. Alternative media sources, both traditional and new, which represent the interests of specific groups, such as LGBTQ, focus on bringing the group-specific issues to the foreground. A separate space in the media market is occupied by ethnic media, commonly produced and addressed at a specific minority group, often in their own language. Alternative community and ethnic media have a strong participatory profile, which gives their users space to create their own content to share ideas and viewpoints via digitalised platforms. In the selection of the media clips attention was paid to the balance between different sources, formats (written, audio, video) and post types (news piece, talk show, blog post, etc.) as well as between majority and minority media (Tiefenbacher and Perschy, 2019).

In **Hungary**, the debates chosen for the analysis revolved around the question of unequal access to quality education of two vulnerable groups: Roma children and children of low socio-economic status. The analysis focused on the problem of increasing selectivity within the school system linked to: (1) the freedom of educational choice, exercised in particular by white upper and upper-middle class parents who tend to choose private, usually church-run schools, for their children (the phenomenon of the so-called ‘white’ and ‘upper- and upper-middle class flight’); (2) preferential treatment of religious schools by the government; and (3) policy of ‘loving segregation’¹¹ that reinforces the development of separate educational settings for Roma and non-Roma children.

Media clips selected for the analysis came from a variety of traditional print media (newspapers and news magazines), broadcast news (news editions, talk shows, news analysis programmes) and digital news media (news platforms, news blogs and on-line versions of the traditional newspapers as well as their Facebook sites). The mainstream media market is highly polarized, with conservative and nationalist voices, which echo the political

¹¹ The notion of “loving segregation” or “affectionate segregation” used by the current Conservative-Christian government reflects the idea that segregation within school settings can be permitted, or even beneficial, in the process of closing the gap between Roma and non-Roma students, providing segregation is complemented with affection, skilled teachers, and good pedagogical methods. At the same time, the critical opinion leaders (civil society organizations, academics, government-critical media, etc.) consider segregation as an obsolete practice, treating it as a zero-sum issue and tending to cast it in a more negative light, associating it with the violation of “equal opportunities,” “equal treatment” and “human rights.”

(footnote continued)

stance of the Fidesz/Christian Democrats alliance, enjoying a near-hegemony in the print and broadcast media, and opposition outlets marginalized through ownership changes, financial pressures or loss of broadcasting licences. The growing concentration of the media in the hands of pro-governmental actors, enhance public demand for independent social media and digital news. Produced by small NGOs and journalism centres such outlets tend to be ephemeral only, vulnerable to financial pressures stemming, among other things, from the exceptionally low trust in the (news) media in Hungary and the reluctance of the public to contribute to independent journalism. The ephemeral character of the independent media made it difficult to follow specific media sources across time. Still, in the selection of the media clips attempt was made to balance between the ideological stance of various media, their reach and the socio-economic characteristics of their audience (Kende, 2019).

Segregation in education was also the leitmotif of the debates analysed in **the Netherlands**. The analysis focused on three interrelated strands of the debate: ethnic segregation, socio-economic segregation, and religious segregation. Similarly to Hungary, the increasing selectivity with the school system was discussed in the context of the freedom of educational choice, state support for religious and 'specialized' schools,¹² and the phenomenon of 'white flight.' Interesting in the Dutch debate is the long history of the controversy around the special status of 'specialized' schools, dated to the so-called school pacification (*de school strijd*) that took place between 1848-1917 over the equalization of public financing for religious schools and the special position the freedom of educational choice enjoys in the national creed.

In the selection of the relevant media clips, attention was paid to balance between the ideological stance of various media (left-centre-right and religiously informed vs. secular), their reach and the socio-economic characteristics of their audience: ethnicity and social-class, in particular. In general, despite high concentration and lack of transparency in media ownership, the Dutch media market seems pluralistic, politically independent and socially inclusive, especially with respect to ethnic minority access to and representation in the media (Rossini, 2018). Interesting in the Dutch news media market is the high popularity of digital news sites and apps, and the digital versions of mainstream outlets, many of which appeal to an equal extent to both ethnic minorities and Dutch natives, and left-wing and right-wing audiences (Lepianka et al., 2019).

In **Portugal**, the theme of segregation of minority groups, was approached via the analysis of debates about the invisibility of racial and ethnic minorities, Afro-descendants and Roma in particular, in the schools system, exemplified by lack of ethnic monitoring, on the one hand, and absences, half-truths and omissions in the school curriculum, on the other. In the analysis special attention was given to minority critique of the assimilationist school system that fails to include minority groups in the national project.

Media clips selected for the analysis came from traditional and new media. Traditional news media are, in the Portuguese context, difficult to associate with a specific political ideology and/or specific type of audience (other than social class). New media, on the other hand, such as online newspapers, web blogs, thematic websites/platforms and Facebook pages, are often used by minority groups to express their perspectives. For the current analysis, selection encompassed social media content published on Facebook pages dedicated to

¹² 'Specialised' schools in the Netherlands encompass denominational schools and schools that apply special pedagogic approaches, such as Montessori, Dalton or Jenaplan. All such schools are financed from the state budget, although they are free to ask additional 'parental' contribution, which arguably contributes to segregation between socio-economic groups.

interdependent and alternative journalism, content produced by minority organisations and social movements as well as content published on websites and platforms of organisations and institutions working with Roma, Afro-descendants and African migrants in Portugal (Bicas et al., 2019).

The issue of minoritisation of large sections of the population is central to **Turkish** analysis. Here, the investigation of media discourse focused on the issue of the proliferation of religiously informed *Imam Hatip* schools that, following the 2012 reform in the compulsory education system, replaced secular schools in many neighbourhoods and, due to residence based enrolment scheme, have become the only educational option for many secularly-minded families. The debates analysed focus in particular on two questions: one related to the (desirability of) values passed on by the *Imam Hatip* schools and the other revolving around the state favouritism towards *Imam Hatip* schools reflected, among other things, in the allocation of resources.

Similarly to Hungary, the media landscape in Turkey is heavily polarized, reflecting the political and social divides in the country. The most watched TV channels and most read newspapers are politically affiliated with the government, which by controlling the mainstream media outlets via, among other things, public procurements and tax fine tactics, effectively limits their editorial autonomy (Inceoglu et al., 2019). Against the conservative pro-government outlets, stand the Kemelist and/or leftist media representing secular values. These comprise rather small-sized TV-channels and newspapers. For the current analysis, the selection of sources encompassed one newspaper from each of the ideological camps and a well-established and a widely used social media platform to map the perspectives of ordinary internet users (Ruben and Hişil, 2019).

Finally, in **the United Kingdom**, the analysis focused on the Trojan Horse controversy that erupted in 2014 when an alleged plot by hardline Islamists to “Islamicise” schools in Birmingham was made public. The allegation, eventually declared false, resulted in a media frenzy, fueled by several government investigations, professional misconduct hearings and the dissolution of an educational trust in Birmingham. The media debates revolved, among other things, around the questions of truth and authenticity in public debates, the position of Muslim community within and beyond the school system, the role of education for attainment and passing on values, and the questions of security and trust.

Media covered in the analyses were chosen based on their ideological profile (right, centre, left), target audience (in terms of educational level, age, profession, cultural background and geographical distribution) and media type (specialised and generalist, tabloids and broadsheets, dailies and weeklies, online and printed). Particularly important in the process of media selection was the balancing of their political profile. In the British context, the political centre usually identifies as liberal, the right as conservative, and the left, which comes in a greater variety of ideological variants, mostly gravitates around the Labour Party (Divald, 2019).

Results

This study aimed at facilitating the understanding of dominant/popular representation of justice claims by analysing the ‘discursive construction’ of justice claims and justice-related tensions in the media. In line with the general tenets of discourse studies, in order to understand discursive construction of any such claims and conflicts, one has to be aware of the broader context of communication (Van Dijk, 2003, 2005; Wodak, 2008). We start, therefore, with an account of some long-standing disputes and controversies in which the debates (and media clips) analysed

are embedded. We then move to the discussion of claims to justice that are evoked in the media items analysed. Here, per justice claim identified, we present its various ‘mediated’ aspects, and show how differently a specific claim might be articulated or applied when voiced with respect to or by different social categories (such as different minority groups vs ethnic, or racial majority). Further, we discuss the ‘mediated’ construction of tensions between various claims to justice, tensions between different understandings of specific justice claims, and tensions between the principles that govern the realisation of justice. In our discussion, we pay particular attention to the media representation of tensions between justice claims by different groups, or the ‘who’ of justice. Much of the analysis shows how tensions between the various understandings of justice (the ‘what’ of justice, or the conceptual dilemmas) and/or moral grounds for the realisation of justice (the ‘how’ and the ‘why’ of justice, or the moral dilemmas) are entwined with inter-group conflicts and tensions between justice claims of different groups. The discussion of cross-country differences is woven into the general discussion of types of justice claims and justice related tensions. Just like the discussion of differences between media sources representing different ideological stance.

Main controversies underpinning the analysed debates

The media debates selected for the analysis, even if related to a specific issue, like proliferation of religiously informed *Imam Hatip* schools in Turkey, or a particular controversy, like the Trojan Horse case in the UK, stem from and/or reflect long-standing disputes in the realm of education, related to three broad issues: the role of education in the social system, principles that govern access to education, and responsibilities of various (social) actors in the provision and oversight of education.

Role education

One of the central controversies underpinning debates in the analysed media relates to the role of education. Is the ultimate, or primary, goal of education to raise the educational attainment and thus the life chances of children or is the primary role of education to pass on values? If the primary role of education is to enhance educational attainment, the attainment of which social groups should be prioritized – should the educational system focus on the educational attainment and life chances of the greatest number and/or focus in particular on pupils from vulnerable groups? If the role of education is the promotion of values, the question often raises: whose values should be promoted – the values of the greater society (e.g. the numerical majority), the socio-culturally dominant group (i.e. the elite), or the values shared by specific religious or cultural communities, which may – on certain points – be at odds with values that are considered to form the ‘normative core’ of the society in question. If the role of education is to enhance the educational attainment of students from ‘vulnerable groups’, which groups are they? After all, ‘vulnerability’ is socially constructed and often a consequence of specific (policy or political) interpretations of socio-economic and historical, but also medical, developments. Moreover, who is considered vulnerable and why might be context-related. While present in all countries under study, the controversy over the role of education seems particularly strong in Turkey and in Austria.

Connected to the above debates are questions about the role of education in enhancing the well-being of the society, or rather, the well-being of a specific *type*, or idealized visions, of society. While some discourses focus on the role of education in promoting inclusivity and embracing diversity as means to achieve social cohesion, other

stress the need to enhance the well-being of specific groups, in particular those who have suffered injustice or may feel neglected by the past or present educational practices. Central here are the questions about whose well-being, if anyone's, is prioritized, on what moral grounds and how it is to be achieved. Especially in Turkey, the highly polarized debates around the role of education stem from a clash between two fundamentally different visions of common good.

Curriculum

Crucial in such struggles are questions about the content of the curriculum as well as who should have a right to contribute to the definition of the educational core. The fundamental question about whose norms and values are promoted is supplemented with questions about how, at what cost and with what consequences this happens. To what extent, for example, does the promotion of a specific, often idealised, vision of the imagined community of value via textbooks and educational programmes take place through omissions of uncomfortable facts, misinterpretation or silencing of alternative perspectives, and discrediting of the critics. While in the analysed material clashes around the content of the curriculum seem most pronounced in Portugal, they are present in all countries under investigation.

Access to (quality) education and segregation

In Austria, Hungary, the Netherlands and Portugal, the debates about whose well-being is prioritized by the educational system, touch upon the issue of un/desirability of educational segregation and the detrimental effect of mixed vs. segregated education on the various groups in society and the well-being of the society as a whole. In Portugal, the debate revolves around the question of acknowledgement vs. denial of segregation in education and/or absence of minority groups – Roma and Afro-descendants in particular – in educational settings that, like general education high schools and universities, enhance educational advancement and social mobility. In Portugal, the Netherlands and Austria, such absence or underrepresentation of vulnerable groups in more prestigious and/or quality schools is discussed in the context of the early education tracking system that channels children into various educational paths based on achievement and disregarding the social context they come from. As will be shown in this report, the debates touch upon the question of principles that govern the distribution of education as public good and the different visions of common good.

A related issue is the role of religious or otherwise specialised schools in the educational system, the freedom such schools enjoy in shaping their admission policy and curricula, and the effects this has on individual access to quality education and segregation within the education system as a whole. Such debates take place in the Netherlands, Hungary and the UK.

Role and responsibilities of various (social) actors in the provision and oversight of education

One of the questions that arises touches upon the scope of responsibility of various social actors and the division of competences between the various levels of governance: national and local authorities and schools as specific institutions. While the role of the state in securing (quality) education is unanimously acknowledged, the question of how the state fulfils that role and to whom exactly it delegates the realisation of specific tasks is an object of heated debates. For example, what is the freedom of local authorities and school boards, including their fiscal capacity, in shaping the enrolment policies, the composition of the student and the teacher bodies and/or school management within particular schools and/or localities? Who has a say in shaping not only the admission policies but also the curriculum of specific (types of) schools? The debates around those issues often touch on the legal

foundation of the educational system, for example in the Netherlands and Hungary, and the accountability of the state for the well-being of citizens, for example in the UK.

How is Fraser's typology present?

Redistribution

As observed by Keddie, a distributive understanding of justice has been significant in shaping the schooling policies and practices in Western countries for some time (Keddie, 2012, p. 266). Unsurprisingly then, in virtually all national contexts analysed redistributive claims to justice seem to dominate, which suggests their particular relevance for the discursive construction of justice. Redistributive claims to justice are evoked, for example, in discussions about access to *quality* education, affected by discriminatory school admission practices and education tracking system that result in the within- or between-school segregation along the lines of ethnicity (in the Netherlands, Hungary, Portugal), culture and religion (in the Netherlands, Austria) or socio-economic status (in the Netherlands, Hungary), and the concertation of pupils from vulnerable groups in notoriously underinvested educational settings.

In Hungarian and Dutch debates, the limited access of pupils from vulnerable groups to quality education is linked to the unique position of religious or otherwise 'specialised' schools, which – through their educational (and/or ideological) profile and (implicit) admission policies, often tailored to meet the expectations of white middle class parents – lead to the creation of socio-economically homogeneous school environments and reinforce the processes of 'white flight', 'intelligence flight' or 'middle class flight'. Depending on the political standpoint represented by the media and their audiences, the ensuing educational segregation is presented either as a source of harm for the vulnerable groups, robbing them of educational opportunities and chances for social mobility (more leftist media), or as a blessing that enables children from various milieus to develop according to their interests and abilities, and in line with the value systems of their parents (more conservative, right-wing media). In Hungary, for example, the pro-government, more conservative, media refer to the governmental policy of "loving segregation" that allows Roma children to avoid the humiliation of "being the stupid of the class" through "forced integration"¹³ (Kende, 2019; cf. Zemandl, 2018).

Grievances about the maldistribution of life chances are present as well in complains, reported in the news reports, about the (early) educational tracking system and especially how the biased perception of minority children by their educators affects their educational careers. For example, in Portugal, as critically observed in *Fumaca* – an independent outlet of progressive and dissident journalism – "[t]here is still the idea that Afro-descendants like more practical things [and] they are thought not to like philosophy, history, mathematics, chemistry, physics,"¹⁴ and that Roma, due to their nomadic way of life, do not value education (Bicas et al., 2019). As a consequence, it is claimed, children with minority backgrounds are more often directed into vocational training than their white colleagues. Also in the media in the Netherlands, attention is drawn to the Dutch education as a missed chance; a system, where social inequalities, instead of being reduced, tend to be *reproduced*, not only directly, through

¹³ Hanthy, Kinga (2016) "Kecskekő, Az igazi problémát Gyöngyöspata szülte." *Magyar Idők* (9/10/2016). Available at: <https://www.magyaridok.hu/lugas/kecskeko-1066615/>

¹⁴ Roldão, Cristina; Abrantes, Pedro (2016) "Racismo na Escola." *Fumaca* (15/09/2016). Available at: <https://fumaca.pt/cristina-roldao-pedro-abrantes-racismo-escola/>

differential (implicitly: discriminatory) treatment of children from weaker social milieus, but also indirectly through tempering their ambitions. Especially the more leftist media, emphasize a discrepancy between the normative ideals of equality and meritocracy, which are supposed to underpin the educational system, and the grim reality, in which privilege is often confused with talent and talent wasted. This paradox is aptly summarized by the following observation in the *Groene Amsterdammer*: “Research after research shows that the Netherlands is an equal society with unequal opportunities.”¹⁵

Important in all those debates is the underpinning belief that educational attainment is a means to alleviate social inequality and to lift particular vulnerable communities (Muslims in the UK, people of colour and/or low socio-economic status in the Netherlands, Afro-descendants in Portugal, or Roma – in Portugal and Hungary) out of socio-economic disadvantage. Education is seen here as a ‘vehicle’ for advancement, a drive for social mobility. A ‘drive’ and a ‘vehicle’, which, according to more leftist media, miserably fail.

Redistributive claims to justice are voiced particularly strongly in media reports discussing the (controversies around the) allocation of state resources among various types of schools and/or schools that accommodate various population groups. Contentious in the controversies reported is not only the choice of specific allocation principles (e.g. achievement vs. need vs. ideological stance of schools) and the visions of justice that underpin it, but also the consequences the prioritization of specific types of schools or pupils may have for other groups of students. For example, in Turkey the allocation of state resources that favours religiously informed schools (*Imam Hatips schools*) and vocational schools at the expense of good-quality (and religiously more neutral) ‘scientific’ high schools, which nota bene are in high demand among students and parents, is presented by more liberal, anti-government media, as limiting the educational choices, and eventually also educational attainment and life chances, of a large number of youth, and especially youth of non-religious background and/or those who – due to their scarce financial resources – are prevented from seeking access to private education. The paradox of the system, fed by the ideologically informed mal-distribution of public resources, is well captured by the following quote from *Cumhuriyet*: “Imam-Hatip school, which was built at the cost of 7 million liras, started the new semester with 45 students.”¹⁶

In Hungary, governmental support for religious schools is presented in the anti-government media as a mechanism that enhances the well-being of the well-off ‘elite’ children at the expense of the less well-off, usually Roma, pupils doomed to poorly financed public schools. On the other hand, however, the allocation of resources to educational setting and remedial programmes that serve the advancement of children with minority and/or migration background are framed by certain, usually right-wing, media and their audiences as undue and violating the principle of equality (the Netherlands) or meritocracy (Austria), and experienced as reverse discrimination by the members of ethnic (white) majority. “Always just adapting to the minorities”, says a Dutch media user, “by which ordinary and talented pupils are [o]ppressed.”¹⁷

¹⁵ Thomas, Casper (2016) “Sociale scheidslijnen in Nederland: Generatie ongelijk.” *De Groene Amsterdammer* (20/04/2016). Available at: <https://www.groene.nl/artikel/generatie-ongelijk>.

¹⁶ “7 Milyon Lira Harcanarak Yapılan İmam Hatip Yeni Döneme 45 öğrenci ile Başladı.” *Cumhuriyet* (20/09/2017).

¹⁷ A comment by a reader to a blogpost “‘Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid’.” *Geenstijl.nl* (07/01/2018). Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5140158/steenhuis-ga-weg-bij-dat-vod/>.

Recognition

Within the analysed media debates education is often framed as “an enabler for (...) integration” into the (greater) society (Divald, 2019: 13). Depending on what exactly this “integration” implies for minority members – assimilation vs capacity to flourish within the majoritarian culture – education may either stand in the way of recognition, understood as respect for and accommodation of difference, or constitute a *condition sine qua non* for recognition. Our investigation shows that while the latter constitutes the craved for ideal, that former remains the grim reality of educational system, at least as represented in the debates analysed. Further, our scrutiny of news media content allows identifying the various forms, or aspects, of (mis-)recognition that, according to the media content producers (including the audiences), exist in the realm of education.

The invisibility and the violence of assimilation

The Portuguese example shows how colour blindness and lack of ethnic monitoring is constructed in the media as a form of making a large part of the population invisible. Such invisibility is interpreted as a denial of identity and history, and as a factor that reinforces distributive injustice, especially in educational settings, where ethnic monitoring might be necessary to secure equal access to *quality* education, e.g., via quotas or additional resource allocations to vulnerable populations or schools that serve them. Ethnic monitoring is construed here as necessary to abolish the myth of educational inequality as rooted exclusively in the social-class structure and to grand the issue of racial and ethnic inequality in education, and beyond, a status of a social problem that requires structural solutions. It is also seen as a form of recognizing the ethno-racial diversity of Portuguese society.

Often, however, albeit frequently only tacitly, the inattention to difference, especially in educational settings, is interpreted in the analysed media content through the lenses of (forced) assimilation, implicit in tendencies towards uniformization and homogenization of language, standards, procedures and (Eurocentric) curricula. In Austrian minority media, for example, attention is drawn to the non-recognition of the multiple linguistic, cultural and religious backgrounds as enrichment rather than viewing them through the lens of norm-crossing and disadvantage. Important here are also debates about values that are to be transferred through educational system and whose (or what kind of) values these should be. In Austria, Britain and the Netherlands, our analysis exposes a concern, widespread especially on the right, about the educational system passing on of the values that are deemed “separatist” or “extremist” and thus at odds with the national core.

The symbolic violence (of the curriculum) and historical non-recognition

By ethnic and racial minorities, especially those whose presence is historically extended (such as Roma in Hungary and Portugal) and/or related to the history of colonial domination and slavery, absences and half-truths in the curriculum are experienced as a form of non- or mis-recognition and a manifestation of continued oppression (for example, in the Netherlands and Portugal). In Portugal, the grievances expressed in the media touch upon the lie inherent in the dominant narratives of Portuguese colonisation as benevolent, missionary and charitable rather than oppressive and inherently racist. The deep-rootedness of the lie is well reflected in the quote from Fernanda Cândia:

It was overwhelming because it was then that I understood that Portugal started the traffic of African slaves to Europe. All my schooling took place after the 25th of April,¹⁸ but we never really talked about slavery. We always talked about the 'Discoveries' and after that, we jumped to being pioneers in abolishing it [slavery]. We never talked about the forced work imposed on Africa until the 60's, we never talked about racism and the legal status of racism that is the 'Status of Indigenous'. I only knew all this when I started research for this work. Because the post-25th of April was not capable to take down the ideas related to the Portuguese colonialism. It maintained the discourse ... of the glorification, of lusotropicalism, the dogma that we are incapable of being racist, that we mixed, that our colonialism was better than of the others.¹⁹

The harm of the Eurocentric curriculum is not limited to the promotion of a smug, albeit false, image of Europeans as brave but benevolent discoverers and the forerunners of civilisation, or to the portraying of Europe as an embodiment of democracy, development, erudition, citizenship and human rights, but extends to the silencing of the testimonies of oppression and the non-referencing of minority groups' contribution to the nation's (or broader: Europe's) development and well-being. In Portugal, for example, attention is drawn to the 'erasure' from collective memory of the atrocities suffered by Roma throughout their over 500-year-presence in the country and the 'never talk' that devalues and silences the legacy of colonialism and a failure to integrate any "process of truth and reconciliation" into the national project of citizenship building. The "rethinking the narratives of the history of Portuguese colonialism as a benevolent process"²⁰ is thus seen as a condition sine qua non of justice (Bicas et al., 2019, pp. 16-17).

Grievances about the Eurocentrism of schools are reflected as well in complaints about the unequal status of Western and non-Western languages, for example, in the Netherlands:

At school, we limit ourselves to European languages, especially English, German and French. Languages used by ethnic minorities rarely make it to the curriculum. Speaking those languages in school is actually forbidden. In case of pupils of colour you rarely speak of multilingualism, but rather about language disadvantage. It looks as if they possessed not more but less social capital because they speak an additional language.²¹

¹⁸ '25th of April' relates to the Carnation Revolution, a military coup on the 25th of April 1974 which overthrew the authoritarian *Estado Novo* regime.

¹⁹ Cândia, Fernanda (2017) "Passado Colonial. "Não sabemos o lado verdadeiro da nossa história." *Diário de Notícias* (01/05/2017). Available at: <https://www.dn.pt/sociedade/interior/o-que-sabem-os-portugueses-do-seu-passado-colonial-6257659.html>

²⁰ Araújo, Marta (2016) "Manuais escolares narram o colonialismo, a escravatura e o Racismo." *Fumaça* (12/10/2016). Available at: <https://fumaca.pt/marta-araujo-manuais-escolares/>

²¹ Agirdag, Orhan and Merry, Michael S. (2016) "Zwarte school is nog niet zwart genoeg." *Trouw* (06/09/2016). Available at: <https://www.trouw.nl/opinie/zwarte-school-is-nog-niet-zwart-geenog~b98aeb15/>.

(footnote continued)

Similar arguments are raised in Portugal, where attention is drawn to the differential status of the vernacular versions of Portuguese, their exclusion from school curricula and how speaking non-standard version of Portuguese, such as Care Verdean Creole is likely to disqualify one as a discursive partner (Bicas et al., 2019: 17-18). Voices that emphasize how bullying and discrimination against minority children are entwined with blindness to the benefits of multilingualism and the value of growing-up in diverse backgrounds are raised also in Austrian media (Tiefenbacher and Perschy, 2019: 20). In all three countries, media, in particular more left-wing or alternative ethnic media, expose the double standards employed to evaluate the linguistic capabilities of majority vs minority children, revealing the recognitive inequality built-into the educational system and cultural patterns this inequality is entwined with.

Yet, harmful, according to the media accounts, is not only the very absence of minority figures, languages and perspectives in the curriculum, but also, or especially, the consequences “the whitening of the programme and the silencing of blacks as thinkers”²² has on the sense of belonging of minority children. This is very well illustrated by a set of rhetorical questions posed by a Portuguese mother and a social scientist in *Jornal Público*:

*‘The central person is always the white child who is showing his world.’ (...) In a geography textbook where cities are being analysed, the idea expressed is that non-whites ‘appeared’ in the country ‘spontaneously’. Non-white children continue to be treated as foreign and not Portuguese. Therefore, ‘a non-white, born in Portugal reads that and questions: why do I need to be integrated?’ (...) Based on what right are non-white children deleted from schoolbooks? The right to exist in your own country? I am supposed to trust my country, not to scrutinize the textbooks that are given at school, and not to think that my daughter is being targeted by racism through the manuals.*²³

The relevance of omissions, half-truths and ‘white’ lies in the curriculum for the realisation of justice, is further emphasised by highlighting their significance for the perpetuation of racism. Since “racism is not individual and exceptional, but the fruit of what [the history textbooks] do not teach us,”²⁴ presence of uncontested colonial references in educational space is seen by Portuguese commentators as interconnected with present day racism, xenophobia, islamophobia and romophobia (Bicas et al., 2019: 8).

On the other hand, however, grievances related to manipulative, false or incomplete curriculum are not exclusive to minority groups. In the Netherlands, similar recognitive grievances are reflected in majoritarian complains about

²² Henriques, Joana Gorjão (2017) “As várias faces do ativismo negro.” *Jornal Público* (16/09/2017). Available at:

<https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/16/sociedade/noticia/as-varias-faces-do-ativismo-negro-1785487>.

²³ Henriques, Joana Gorjão (2017) “Com que direito se apagam as crianças brancas dos manuais.” *Jornal Público* (9/09/2017).

Available at: <https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/noticia/com-que-direito-se-apagam-as-criancas-naobrancas-dos-manuais-1784746>.

²⁴ Rodrigues, António (2017) “Racismo. Isto ‘não é um problema de polícias ignorantes’ mas de impunidade.” *Jornal SOL*

(12/07/2017). Available at: <https://sol.sapo.pt/artigo/571875/racismo-isto-nao-e-um-problema-de-policias-ignorantes-mas-de-impunidade>.

(footnote continued)

a growing number of ‘controversial issues’ that teachers – afraid of radicalizing (ethnic) youth – no longer discuss at multi-ethnic/multi-cultural school: “Until recently, it was the Second World War, the Holocaust, Judaism and terrorism that were not discussed, nowadays this also applies to IS, Syria, Saint Nicolas,²⁵ racism and slavery.”²⁶

In Turkey, a sense of injustice related to the content of curriculum and norms and values imposed by school dwells on both sides of the highly polarized ideological scene. On the one hand, in the secular, leftist *Cumhuriyet*, voices are raised against the symbolic violence in the form of replacement and/or erasure of historical figures, narratives, names and symbols of the secular values of the early republic²⁷ with religious figures, symbols and practices that prioritize the religious norms and values. Grievances include the renaming of schools but also the re-installing of the public character of religious practices. Sense of harm is clearly echoed in the headlines from *Cumhuriyet*: “They are erasing Atatürk”, “*Imam Hatip* principal swears to secularism: All the thieves and bastards are seculars” or “Student Oath is forbidden, praying is free” (Ruben and Hişil, 2019), and accounts of the transforming of important monuments of the republic into religious, medrese-like *Imam Hatip* schools. On the other hand, in the conservative, pro-government *Sabah*, *Imam Hatip* schools are seen as a response to the historical grievance of misrecognition experienced in the times of secular republic by those who adhere to traditional religious values. The sense of injustice underpinning this type of grievances is well captured in a quote from Erdoğan in *Sabah*:

[in times of secular republic] children and young people [were raised] in a way in which they were disconnected from their history, their land, all their national and moral values. Severing a nation, a civilization from their own toots, from their own soul, their essence, their history and ancestry means destroying that nation in its entirety (Erdoğan cited in *Sabah*, 2014).²⁸

The violence of ‘othering’

Recognitive grievances are reflected as well in complains about labelling and ‘othering’ of ethnic minority members, their homogenization and the generalization of negative stereotypes. In the Netherlands, for example, the indiscriminate application of the term *black* to children with Moroccan, Syrian, Iranian, Surinamese, Latin American and African background, inherent in the application of the term *black* to denote schools in which at least 50 per

²⁵ The Dutch tradition of Saint Nicolas (Dutch: Sinterklaas) constitutes one of the most contentious issues in the contemporary Netherlands, mainly due to the controversial figure of Black Pete that constitutes its crucial element, while being also fervently criticized as a symbol of unacknowledged racism that pervades (contemporary) Dutch society.

²⁶ Marbe, Nausicaa (2017) “Politici, voer actie tegen segregatie!” *Telegraaf* (02/02/2017). Available at: <https://www.telegraaf.nl/watuzegt/53696/politici-voer-actie-tegen-segregatie>.

²⁷ Early Republican era in Turkey usually refers to the period from 1920s that the country was founded until 1938.

²⁸ Haberleri, Gündem (2014) “Yeni bir çalışma başlatıyoruz.” *Sabah* (5/7/2014). Available at: <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/07/05/yeni-bir-calisma-baslatiyoruz>.

(footnote continued)

cent of students have a ‘non-Western’ migrant background,²⁹ is interpreted, especially in more left-wing media, as a sign of *mis*recognition and exclusion from the community of value: “By calling specific groups black, you actually say: you’re not really Dutch.”³⁰

In Portugal, the violence of ‘othering’ is reflected, according to the media sources analysed, in the presence (and relative popularity) in the public space of insulting and pejorative images that present Africans as ‘primitive peoples’ with no history of their own. It is echoed as well in the (discursive) inclusion Roma and Afro-descendants, who enjoy full Portuguese citizenship, in the all-encompassing category of immigrants (Bicas et al., 2019, pp. 23-24). Protection offered to those groups of population by the High Commission of *Migration* seems to the commentators painfully ironic; in itself an act of recognitive violence.

In Hungary, the ‘othering’ of Roma is reflected in some of the pro-governmental rhetoric of care and “loving segregation” that attempts to justify the necessity of segregated education by “cultural otherness” and special educational needs of Roma children “to practice the different rules of human co-existence” and “[to learn] how to wash their hands and use the toothbrush.”³¹ Such a rhetoric – supported and reinforced by the pro-government Hungarian media – could be interpreted as a form of naturalization of the supposed inferiority of ethnic and racial minorities, observed also in Portugal (cf. Bicas et al., 2019: 22).

Complaints about symbolic violence are also echoed in the media criticism of the biased administrative structure of schools. While the discussion of the underrepresentation of specific societal groups within the institutional structure of schools suggests some concern with the unequal distribution of power and thus might be more readily linked to representative understanding of justice, the grievances about the under-representation of ethnic or racial minorities in the teacher body and/or the school boards in the Netherlands point as well to the far-reaching consequences of the absence of diversity might have for recognitive justice, namely the implicit message it conveys that pupils “can learn only from *white* teachers.”³² In the media clips analyzed it is actually suggested that, if internalized, such a biased message is likely to negatively affect the self-esteem of the children of colour and/or reinforce their societal mis-recognition.

Indeed, in virtually all countries, media reports include complaints about micro-violence in the form of derogation and/or dehumanization, like in Portugal, where one of the minority pupils complained: “When we were studying the origin of humanity [in school] and there were images of the ancestors of the man they said [the white students] that it was us, that we were like the monkeys.”³³ Telling here is also an example taken from a Portuguese textbook,

²⁹ In the Netherlands a distinction is made between people with Western and non-Western migration background; the latter category comprises persons with roots in African, Latin American and Asian countries (with the exception of Indonesia and Japan) or Turkey (source: <https://www.cbs.nl/nl-nl/onze-diensten/methoden/begrippen?tab=p#id=persoon-met-een-niet-westerse-migratieachtergrond>).

³⁰ van Gelder, Lorianne (2016) “Zwarte en witte scholen, het lijkt wel apartheid.” *Parool* (13/12/2016). Available at: <https://www.parool.nl/nieuws/zwarte-en-witte-scholen-het-lijkt-wel-apartheid~b6b311c1/>.

³¹ Szilvay, Gergely (2015) “Roma-magyar együttélés: mi számít szegregációnak?” *Mandiner.keresztény* (4/06/2015). Available at: https://keresztény.mandiner.hu/cikk/20150604_roma_magyar_egyutteles_mi_szamit_szegregacionak.

³² Agirdag, Orhan and Merry, Michael S. (2016) “Zwarte school is nog niet zwart genoeg.” *Trouw* (06/09/2016). Available at: <https://www.trouw.nl/opinie/zwarte-school-is-nog-niet-zwart-geenog~b98aeb15/>.

³³ Cândia, Fernanda (2017) “É preciso descolonizar Portugal.” *Diário de Notícias* (13/06/2017). Available at: <https://www.dn.pt/portugal/interior/racismo-e-preciso-descolonizar-portugal-8558961.html>.

and reported in the Portuguese media analysed, where the following sentence “H is for Helena, she is black, but she says that she is a brunette” strengthens the derogative meaning of ‘black’ and the apparent non-reliability of assertions made by people of colour (Bicas et al., 2018, p. 22).

Unjustified accusations

One of the central mis-recognition grievances, reported in analysed media, relates to the unjust accusations of misconduct and/or the stigmatization of those (unjustly) accused. Who is considered the actual victim of misrecognition depends very much on the discursive frame used and/or the ideological perspective/colour of the media outlets where the grievances are voiced.

In the UK Trojan horse case, the Muslim community experiences stigmatization through unjustified and indiscriminate surveillance all community members, including children as young as four years old, have been subjected to. Media reports emphasise the feelings of being demonized, scapegoated and exposed to a “witch hunt”; the harm the stigmatizing surveillance causes to the (cultural) identity of Muslims in the UK; and how the mistrust institutionalised in the adopted surveillance measures reflect the symbolic status of Muslim citizens within the British society. As observed in *the Guardian*: “It remains impossible to separate the way the Trojan horse allegations were treated from the wider context of how Muslims are viewed in British society: as a potential threat, a fifth column.”³⁴ The reference to the ‘fifth column’ constitutes here a critique of the inflated, and in essence irrational, fear of Muslim community in British society.

In Turkey, a sense of injustice is conveyed in protests, voiced by the conservative *Sabah*, against the misrepresentation of the conservative sections of the society, the *Imam-Hatip* students in particular:

*The reports and discourses which say that conservatives or Imam-Hatip students are sliding towards ‘deism’ are a dirty operation, a dirty attack and a dirty trap. It seems that those who are disturbed by the [that fact that] generations [are] raised by Imam-Hatip schools and conservatives ... [want to] disrepute them and, in the end, move them away from Islam.*³⁵

What strikes in the quote from Turkish *Sabah* is the repeated use of the word ‘dirty’ which suggests moral corruption on the part of the opponents; the use of words such as ‘operation’ and ‘trap’ suggest, in addition, some premeditation and cold-bloodedness. The defence of the victims of (alleged) misrecognition (the *Imam-Hatip* students) takes here a form of moral attack on their opponents that could itself be interpreted in terms of unjustified accusations and/or misrecognition.

As the above quotes show, important as source of injustice – in the eyes of the media commentators – is not only the very act of forming allegedly unfounded accusations, but also their assumed consequences for the group being smeared.

The minoritization of the (alleged) majority

³⁴ Shackle, Samira (2017) “Trojan Horse: The Real Story behind the Fake ‘Islamic Plot’ to Take over Schools.” *The Guardian* (1/09/2017). Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/01/trojan-horse-the-real-story-behind-the-fake-islamic-plot-to-take-over-schools>.

³⁵ Haberleri, Gündem (2018) ‘Bekir Bozdağ:Deizm iddiaları kirli bir operasyon.’ *Sabah* (22/4/ 2018). Available at: <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/04/22/bekir-bozdag-deizm-iddialari-kirli-bir-operasyon>.

Against the recognitive grievances of minority members stand the feelings of misrecognition experienced by the members of the alleged (ethnic, religious, cultural) majority. Interestingly, majoritarian grievances usually find their channel of expression in the more-right wing or conservative media, and/or in audience's comments. Majoritarian sense of misrecognition, as traceable in the media analysed, results from the (perceived) disdain with which (ethnic, religious, cultural) minorities treat (supposedly) majoritarian values and their way of life, and the undue recognition of the minority claims by the government and/or state institutions – either now or in the past. On the one hand, attention is thus drawn to homophobic comments and/or unfair treatment of girls and women by Muslims that violate the (supposedly) majoritarian values (for example in the UK and the Netherlands). On the other, majoritarian grievances are underpinned by a feeling of having been abandoned by policy and politics overwhelmed with the consequences of the insufficiently regulated migration and the inadequate (too lenient) integration policies that often result in the apparent 'surrender' of the authorities to minorities' sense of entitlement (Lepianka et al., 2019, p. 20). One of such consequences is the alleged minoritization of national values, culture and language by 'foreigners' in schools. In Austrian media, concerns are raised about Austrians who are becoming de facto 'outsiders' in 'foreign classes', that is school classes dominated by foreigners. This concern is well captured in some of the readers' comments: "Alright, so now half of the students [in classrooms overall] are not Austrians! That means that in a couple of years, the real Austrians will be a minority!"³⁶ or "It won't take very much longer and we will be foreigners in our home country."³⁷

In a similar vein, in the Netherlands, some media attention was offered to the case of Mees – a 13-year-old Dutch boy discriminated against by his classmates as "the only boy with blond hair and blue eyes" in a 'black' school.³⁸ Added to this are the claimed grievances of misrecognition experienced through 'misplaced' and thus unjustified, in the eyes of the racial majority, accusations of racism:

*The allochthon never goes further than always pointing the finger at the native Dutch and crying out [about] discrimination and racism in relation to circumstances they themselves have created in the past 50 years*³⁹

A different type of recognitive grievance, yet in a twisted way related to the processes of 'minoritization', is related to the rejection of the secular values, and especially values of gender equality, in Turkey. Discriminatory treatment of women in *Imam Hatip* schools, where mixed sex education has been abolished, separate corridors have been created to isolate male and female students, and instances of sexual harassment against girls are ignored, pushes secular social groups, women in particular, into the margins of social life and deprives them of the status they acquired in the times of the secular republic. The worsening position of women is a part of the broader process of the minoritization of secular segments of the population via depriving them of educational opportunities that would match their values, norms and the way of life.

³⁶ A comment by a reader to article "'Müssen die finden, die Gift in Schulen tragen.'" *Kronen Zeitung* (12/9/2018). Available at: <https://www.krone.at/1769553>.

³⁷ A comment by a reader to article "Deutsch nur bei Hälfte der Schüler Umgangssprache." *Kronen Zeitung* (13/09/2018). Available at: <https://www.krone.at/1770642>.

³⁸ Duin, Roelf Jan (2016) "Mees (13) trekt het niet meer als enig wit kind in de klas." *AD* (18/10/2016). Online version of the article available at: <https://www.ad.nl/nieuws/enige-kaaskop-in-de-klas~a8e0a98a/>.

³⁹ A comment by a reader to the blog post "'Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid'." *Geenstijl.nl* (07/01/2018). Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5140158/steenhuis-ga-weg-bij-dat-vod/>.

Representation

Within the realm of education, claims to representative justice are not particularly pronounced (Choules, 2007). Also in the media debates on selected educational issues analysed for this study, representative claims to justice seem to be voiced rather sparingly and often indirectly. Interesting here are the debates in Portugal, where the inequality in educational attainment and underrepresentation of students of colour in higher education settings is interpreted, in some media, in the context of their (future) absence from decision-making bodies (Bicas et al., 2019).

Most often, however, representation related claims that are reported in the media take the form of demands for incorporating parental voice in the matters of relevance for the education of their children and/or calls for diversity in school boards and the teachers' body. Especially in the Netherlands, the discussion of the underrepresentation of specific societal groups, usually ethnic, religious or cultural minorities, within the institutional structure of schools reflects concern with the unequal distribution of power.

For representation, the issue of who is actually given the opportunity to participate in the (educational) debate, to determine its content and to exert influence (on par with others) on the solutions adopted is central. Nevertheless, even though being given voice constitutes a necessary condition for a meaningful participation, it does not necessarily imply equal participation in the process of deliberation. In Portuguese media, the non-recognition of minorities as population groups with own identities and needs, including educational needs, is identified as a reason for their reluctance to participate in a national project that is not-of-their-making.

Indeed, in most of the discussions analysed, it is not only the inclusion/exclusion of specific voices in the debate that is being problematized, but also the value – in terms of importance and legitimacy – of specific voices as well as the scope of their influence. Our analysis of the media content shows that in most countries under study, the issue of the incorporation of minority voices to co-determine the *content* of mainstream curriculum and/or its *moral foundation* is a serious bone of contention, mainly due to the alleged incompatibility of minority norms and values with the national 'core.'

The issue of legitimacy of the voices included became relevant in the UK case, where – in the light of the media material analysed – much of the Trojan Horse controversy revolved around the presence in the debate of biased and untrustworthy actors, whose distorted accounts made the task of establishing the "truth" that would permit a "just" resolution impossible (Divald, 2019). The UK media focus on the actual working of the national debate draws attention to the procedural aspects of deliberative justice: the importance of transparency, avoidance of procedural irregularities and errors. As stated by Divald (2019), "if procedural justice is breached, justice as representation is difficult to achieve" (p. 23). As discussed in one of the subsequent sections, the issue of just procedures and fair treatment in a communicative process is also strongly linked to epistemic justice.

With respect to representation, the UK case highlights, more than other country cases, the importance attached to state institutions as "legitimate representatives" that are "supposed to exercise their authority legitimately, impartially and competently for all segments of the population" (Divald, 2019, p. 23) and are guardians of justice procedures. The apparent failure of the UK authorities to respond fairly to the concerns of different groups seems to put into question their capacity to act as genuine representatives of the whole population. Also in other countries, the alleged failure of the authorities to perform according to what is considered 'the general will' (which *nota bene* differs per frame adopted) is seen by the media commentators as a breach of social contract and a failure of representation. While not always explicit, the grievances of non-representation by the authorities seem

particularly strong in the media which stand in the ideological opposition to the authorities, current or past, whose decisions negatively affect(ed) the part of the society whose perspective the particular medium (or a self-proclaimed representative in case of audience members) claims to reflect. In Turkey, this is well illustrated in the content of pro-governmental *Sabah* which praises the current government for “listening to the demands of the citizens” and – via active facilitation of *Imam Hatip* schools, restores past injustices suffered by the religious part of the society, the students and graduates of the *Imam Hatip* schools in particular. On the other hand, the oppositional *Cumhuriyet* accuses the government of ignoring the wishes of vast population who demands adequate access to secular ‘scientific’ schools and true freedom of choice in educational matters.

Other notions of justice present in the debates

As noted in previous ETHOS reports D2.3 (Knijn et al., 2018) and D7.1 (Knijn and Lepianka, 2018), Fraser’s tripartite typology of justice is not necessarily exhaustive; alternative claims to justice and/or claims that run across the three ideal-typical facets of justice are also identifiable in the media debates analysed: claims based on civil right and liberties, claims to procedural justice, claims understood in the spirit of capabilities and functionings, claims to epistemic justice, historical justice and redress and understandings of justice as freedom from fear and (ontological) insecurity.

(Civil) rights and liberties

The notion of *freedom* is at the heart of education-related debates viewed through the lens of media reporting. This is hardly surprising considering that the right to education is in itself a freedom right, with a strong element of free choice and free exercise, and that it is strongly related to both freedom of religion and freedom of expression (cf. Salát, 2019). The language of freedom in the realm of education is particularly often used in media reports in the Netherlands, where freedom of education is frequently construed as a core democratic value, closely related to freedom of choice and general suffrage, and complying with the principles of the liberal rule of law. In Turkey, the proliferation of the religiously informed *Imam Hatip* schools, at the expense of secular schools, is claimed, in the more liberal media, to have limited the right of parents to choose (secular) education for their children. In the light of media reports analysed, the fact that the limitations of choice affect disproportionately families that are already financially disadvantaged further adds to the injustice by conditioning the exercise of civil rights on financial resources. The violation of freedom of choice is thus intertwined, in the Turkish debates, with recognitive and redistributive claims to justice. Forcing children and their parents to make educational choices against their convictions is seen as a form of misrecognition; the de facto conditioning of freedom of choice upon parental resources constitutes a form of redistributive harm.

Interestingly, in Hungary the right to freedom of (educational) choice and exercise is presented by pro-government media as in opposition to the ‘oppressive’ human rights rhetoric that misrepresents the position and interests of minority groups, Roma in particular. While the government-critical media accuse the government of the unequal treatment of minority groups and the anti-democratic “limitation of minority rights”, the pro-government media condemn human rights lawyers for being dogmatic and missing the problem of Roma non-integration and general, also normative, incompatibility with the dominant Hungarian culture and way of life. Interesting in those debates is the implicit conflict around the autonomy of Roma population – while the more liberal, government-critical media through the use of human rights rhetoric subscribe to a vision of Roma, and other vulnerable groups, as an

autonomous subject capable of using their rights and liberties, the pro-government media seem to adhere to the government's paternalistic vision of vulnerable groups as in need of corrective action (Kende, 2019; cf. Zemandl, 2018).

It is worth noting, however, that in education research freedom of parental choice is closely related to representative justice. As noted by Power, "the language of choice (...) appeals to a form of justice based on participation", having a voice and influence, which is at the core the Fraser's understanding of justice as representation (Power, 2012, p. 485). Within ETHOS the entwinement of the representative justice in the language of rights and civil liberties has been also noted, for example in D4.2 (Lepianka, 2018).

Procedural justice & double standards

As already alluded to, in the light of media clips analysed, breaches in procedural justice, understood as administration of justice, underpin many other grievances of injustice. For example, who is given voice and how much this voice counts (representative justice) might be a question of *just* or *fair* procedures. Similarly, as shown by the UK case, procedural irregularities in the investigation of school (mal)practices might be seen as relevant for the perceived legitimacy of conclusions formed and – in case of unjustified accusations – as contributing to misrecognition of those wrongly accused. In such cases, just like in the Trojan horse case, the injustice of misrecognition is likely to be further aggravated by procedural irregularities that prevented the unjustly accused from clearing their name.

In the Netherlands, grievances about procedural injustice, reported in the media clips analysed, range from criticism of biased admission procedures that allow schools to segregate between less and more desirable students and result in unequal access to (supposedly better) 'white' schools, to complains about the biased treatment of children from weaker milieus, visible in more strict evaluation of their test results, which – in combination with early tracking system – often limits their educational advancement and negatively affects their social mobility. In general, those grievances touch upon the arbitrariness of (administrative) decision making that disadvantages the already disadvantaged. In Turkey, complaints about the injustice of double standards in admission procedures are evoked when the pro-government media reflect on the injustice of a coefficient rule that until 2011 confined the *Imam Hatip* graduates to divinity faculties, thus effectively limiting their access to university education (Ruben and Hişil, 2019).

Strongest claims to procedural justice, however, seem to be made in Austrian debates around the current coalition's (ÖVP-FPÖ) proposals for clear, uniform standards, rules and procedures in evaluating individual educational achievements. In the more leftist media, this procedural strictness, which aims at securing 'just' outcomes on the basis of merit, is also criticized for its neglect of the needs of vulnerable groups, the implicit bias for the already privileged (autochthonous able-bodied Austrians) and the inequality of outcome it is likely to perpetuate. In its essence the Austrian debate, as seen through the lens of media reporting, seems to touch on the relationship between procedural and substantive justice and how this relationship is determined by a specific/preferred understanding of substantive justice.

In the light of the media material analysed, 'double standards' might refer as well to the dubious, shifting standards applied by state institutions (e.g. the educational inspectorate Ofsted in the UK; see Divald, 2019: 22) as well as the 'unjust morals' of the actors involved. In Hungarian media especially, the various political sides of the debate – the

human rights activists opposing educational segregation on behalf of Roma minority and the government officials promoting segregation, again, on behalf of Roma minority – mutually accuse each other of cynicism, hypocrisy and manipulative use of Roma issue to promote their own interests. While such forms of discrediting are sometimes experienced as misrecognition (e.g., by the proponents of religious education in the Netherlands) and/or epistemic injustice, in the Hungarian case they are also used to expose, in and through the media, the double morals of actors who in real life fail to hold onto values officially preached (human rights activists as presented by the pro-government media) or frame themselves as defenders of vulnerable groups to promote their own elitist interests (governmental officials as portrayed in the media critical of the government).

Interesting in this context is also the emphasis that the media commentators and their sources put on establishing the ‘truth’ as a precondition and at the same time an aspect of procedural justice and thus, at the end, also an aspect of substantive justice (recognitive, representative, redistributive, etc.). For example, in the UK Trojan Horse debate assessing “what really happened” and whether the Trojan Horse document (recognised by all to be a fraud) and its allegations (more debated) were true or not is considered a condition *sine qua non* of deciding on what is the “right thing to do” and how to “judge” the various actors involved. At the same time, however, the irregularities in the procedure that impeded the assessing of the “truth” are condemned for obstructing justice.

Capabilities & adaptive preferences

Understood as a person’s capacity to pursue a life she has reason to value (Sen, 1999), capabilities seem to permeate all claims to justice articulated through the media analysed. Yet, they seem particularly pronounced in views of education (system) as a missed chance, where social inequalities, instead of being reduced, tend to be *reproduced*, not only directly, through differential (implicitly: discriminatory) treatment of children from weaker social milieus, but also indirectly through tempering their ambitions. As testified by an Afro-descendant student in Portugal, quoted in *Diário de Notícias*:

*in the phase of character-building, the child feels that they [the teachers] do not believe [in] her, that they do not encourage her. Within a short time span she internalizes the idea that she does not deserve to be a good student, internalizes an image that [she] is not good.*⁴⁰

In line with Sen, the latter might be interpreted as a factor that contributes to the development of *adaptive preferences* that reflect not the talent and aspirations of the children, but their adaptation to restrictive social conditions. In the light of media reports analysed, such grievances seem particularly pronounced in Portugal and in the Netherlands and Hungary – in the latter two countries, in the context of ethnic and socio-economic segregation of schools. However, to certain extent the injustice of *adapted preferences* seems also relevant in Turkey, where

⁴⁰ Cândia, Fernanda (2017) “É preciso descolonizar Portugal.” *Diário de Notícias* (13/06/2017). Available at: <https://www.dn.pt/portugal/interior/racismo-e-preciso-descolonizar-portugal-8558961.html>.

(footnote continued)

the enrolment system and school quotas, forces large numbers of ambitious students into lower quality religiously-oriented schools (*Imam Hatip*) or vocational schools. A quote from a government-critical newspaper, *Cumhuriyet*, accusing the government of pruning the ambitions of many talented students, captures this sense of injustice well:

*Thousands of children [with high grade averages of 90 and above] could not enter any [scientific] school ... You have destroyed the hopes, dreams, beliefs of all these children... What [will] happen to [those] young people who are supposed to be our future?*⁴¹

In the analysed media clips, children are often framed as being ‘robbed of [educational] chances’, ‘trapped’ or ‘confined’ and deprived of possibility to flourish. Usually, such framing refers to children from vulnerable milieus, whose choice of adequate education is limited and/or whose ability to follow extra-curricular activities outside of school are limited due to the cultural and financial capital of their parents. However, just like in case of other claims to justice, in media reports, grievances related to the limited capabilities are not necessarily restricted to minority members. In most countries, the ‘majority’ children’s capability to develop their talents is presented by some media and/or their audience members as diminished by poor quality of education, which in turn is often attributed to the presence of minority pupils. Strikingly, concern for the capabilities and functionings of the ‘majority’ (white, well-off) children, expressed in the media, often leads to recommendations of unbending meritocracy-based standards within the educational system (Austria) and/or segregation of students according to their (supposed) aptitude, thus disregarding the capability needs of (less well-off) minority pupils (in Hungary and the Netherlands).

Epistemic justice

Another conception of justice that runs across multiplicity of justice claims voiced in the educational debates in the media analysed is – the so far unexplored in ETHOS – epistemic justice. While epistemic injustice can take various forms, it is usually evoked when someone is wronged in their capacity as knower or epistemic subject (Fricker 2007; 2013; 2017). Fricker distinguishes between ‘testimonial injustice,’ which occurs when someone’s knowledge and/or credibility is ignored, rejected as false, treated as less relevant, or deflated because that person is a member of a particular social group; and ‘hermeneutical injustice,’ which occurs when someone’s experience cannot be rendered intelligible (by them or by others) because of the unavailability of sufficiently shared concepts that could adequately identify or explain that experience or because of the style of communication. Kidd and colleagues (2017), in their *Introduction to the Routledge Handbook of Epistemic Injustice*, define epistemic injustice as “those forms of unfair treatment that relate to issues of knowledge, understanding and participation in communicative practices” (Kidd et al., 2017: 1). Regardless of the specific definition or form, epistemic injustice is believed to be generated by stereotypes and prejudices about marginalised groups and a derivative of unequal power relations. At the end, those who are considered highly credible as knowers are usually drawn from more privileged groups.

In the analysed media debates on education, claims to epistemic justice, although never labelled as such, but most clearly present in media reporting on controversies around the curriculum, and more specifically, in discussions of omissions and silences about the (historical) harms inflicted by the dominant group (in most countries analysed:

⁴¹ Atalay, Figen and Ozan Çepni “İmam Hatip projesi çöktü: 200 bin öğrenci sistem dışında kaldı.” *Cumhuriyet* (30/7/2018). Available at: <http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1041471/imam-hatip-projesi-coktu-200-bin-ogrenci-sistem-disinda-kaldi.html>.

white majority) and experienced by (the ancestors of) specific categories, such as Afro-descendants (Portugal) or Roma (Portugal and Hungary). In the Portuguese debates that take place or are reported in the media, attention is drawn to the lack of rhetorical space and means by which minority groups could contribute to the Portuguese canonical historiography with stories of exploitation, plundering, prosecution and extermination (testimonial injustice).

The grievances of epistemic injustice strongly resonate in complains, voiced also in the media, about the inculcation of the dominant historical narrative in the minority groups. Important here are the processes of the relativization of the violence of colonialism and the trivialization and obliteration of racism. Such grievances are again well illustrated in the Portuguese debates, where attention is drawn to instances of visual misrepresentation of racism through “an image of a slave subtitled ‘dancing on a festive day’ that gives an idea that slavery was not so bad and that they were even entitled to a day off and could hold their festivities and preserve their cultures” or the way the myth of non-racism of the Portuguese is reinforced by the paradigm that associates racism with Holocaust or apartheid in South Africa, but not with colonialism (Bicas et al., 2018: 19-20). While such instilling is itself a form of epistemic violence, it also contributes to the hermeneutical injustice, as it deprives the racialized minorities of resources necessary to conceptualize, evaluate, or understand some of their experiences (cf. Fricker, 2007).

In the UK Trojan Horse debates, the grievances of epistemic nature, while not referred to as such, seem echoed in the media clips that reflect on the position of Muslim communities as an epistemic actor and especially their perceived credibility, not only in the Trojan Horse controversy itself but in any (future) controversy. As observed by Miah in his piece in *Discover Society*:

It (the story) is seen to confirm existing pre-conceived ideas of Muslim communities undermining a secular liberal consensus in Britain... The fact that an unauthenticated document has had such a huge impact on public discourse sets worrying precedents for the future, as it potentially frames future allegations of Muslims setting up Trojan Horses to infiltrate politics, local authorities and even the NHS.⁴²

In the light of the above quote, it was arguably the perceived lack of credibility of the Muslim community that allowed the untrue allegations to take “on a life on their own”⁴³ and made it possible to exclude Muslim voices from the public debate, at least at its outset. It was also the lack of credibility of the Muslim community as a whole that made possible the introduction of far-going security measures targeted exclusively at Muslims, which again is likely to further undermine their credibility:

⁴² Miah, Shamim (2014) “Trojan Horse, Ofsted and the ‘Prevent’ing of Education.” *Discover Society* (1/07/2014). Available at: <https://discoversociety.org/2014/07/01/trojan-horse-ofsted-and-the-preventing-of-education/>.

⁴³ Shackle, Samira (2017) “Trojan Horse: The Real Story behind the Fake ‘Islamic Plot’ to Take over Schools.” *The Guardian* (1/09/2017). Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/01/trojan-horse-the-real-story-behind-the-fake-islamic-plot-to-take-over-schools>.

(footnote continued)

Firstly, it seems that the indiscriminate use of Prevent measures is used to frame young Muslims, some of them as young as 4 years, through the lenses of counter-terrorism. Secondly, one of the most significant moments in a child's memory of attending nursery starts with, as far as Ofsted⁴⁴ is concerned, with a deficit, or a label, which implies they are potential 'terrorists'.⁴⁵

Relevance of 'epistemic justice' to the everyday life of minority members, is underscored as well in a Portuguese media clip that reports on an experience of a former high school student of colour, who having scored a 10 in a history test had to wait for the grade until the next test:

That is, she [the teacher] wanted to see if the 10 was actually mine. Since I was a black, she needed to check. Obviously, we are much more analysed, evaluated and scrutinized. There is a question about our abilities and potentialities since kindergarten.⁴⁶

The above example clearly shows how the credibility of a minority member, including the child (!), tends to be evaluated through the lens of their social location and the generalisation of negative stereotypes about the group they putatively belong to (cf. McConkey, 2004). Problematized in the media, it adds to the multiplicity of forms of injustice experienced by minority members that are documented in public space.

Strikingly, in the educational debates that are reported and/or take place in the media and have been analysed for the current study, epistemic harm is evoked in the grievances of both the vulnerable and the (relatively) powerful groups. For example, in the Netherlands, where the (supposedly white Dutch) audience of right-wing media feel harmed by the leftist elites that "reject logical explanations, refute existing evidence" thus ignoring the (or their: white majority's) 'truth' about the threat ethnic minorities and their institutions pose to the Dutch society.⁴⁷

Central to those grievances is the issue of trust/distrust and trustworthiness/untrustworthiness of the testimonies circulating in the public sphere. In the Trojan Horse controversy (the UK), the authenticity of the Trojan Horse document were often rejected as a "hoax", "forgery", "fake", "fraud", not "genuine", "unauthenticated", "unverified" and "debunked" (Divald, 2019: 9). Also in other national contexts, various actors search for 'authenticity' of information circulated and accuse some other participants of the debate of lies, 'false news', 'propaganda' and/or manipulative use of 'evidence' or data, such as statistics (e.g. in the Netherlands, but also Turkey and Hungary).

Often, such accusations are in themselves a form of epistemic harm, though. After all, as emphasized by Fricker (2007), perceived epistemic credibility of an actor relates to both: their perceived competence as knower and their perceived sincerity (discussed in Hawley, 2017, p. 70). Attempts to undermine the credibility of the opponent by the pro-government media in Hungary constitute a very good example of epistemic injustice. The intentions of activists who oppose educational segregation of Roma children as a violation of human rights is questioned by pro-

⁴⁴ Ofsted stands for Office for Standards in Education. It is a state agency with a mandate to inspect primary and secondary schools in England.

⁴⁵ Miah, Shamim (2014) "Trojan Horse, Ofsted and the 'Prevent' Ing of Education." *Discover Society* (1/07/2014). Available at: <https://discoversociety.org/2014/07/01/trojan-horse-ofsted-and-the-preventing-of-education/>.

⁴⁶ Henriques, Joana Gorjão (2017) "Dos afrodescendentes espera-se que não passem da 'escolaridade obrigatória'." *Jornal Público* (09/09/2017). Available at: <https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/noticia/dos-afrodescendentes-esperase-que-nao-passem-da-escolaridade-obrigatoria-1784725>.

⁴⁷ "Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid." *Geenstijl.nl* (17/01/2018). Available at <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5140158/steenhuis-ga-weg-bij-dat-vod/>.

government media through presenting them as elite members – “human rights lawyers from Rose Hill [= a posh district in Budapest inhabited by highly educated]” – who in real life rarely, if ever, get in contact with Roma, yet “give pep talk[s]” that disregard Roma interests. At the same time, mutual accusations of manipulation and lies, and battles over credibility, seem related to struggles over social power. As noted by Hawley (2017), “distrusting, or withholding trust is ... an exercise of social power: you may deny other people important opportunities when you fail to trust them, both through the practical consequences of your distrust and through its symbolic power” (p.70).

Essential to some of the debates analysed is the status of ‘truth’ or ‘establishing the truth’ as a condition *sine qua non* of doing justice. For example, establishing the “truth” about the real victims and about what really happened in the Trojan Horse controversy is presented in British media as necessary for the identification and resolution of other injustices (Divald, 2019: 12), including the harms of misrecognition and/or maldistribution. At the same time, ‘establishing the truth’ necessitates ‘epistemic justice’, understood as an equal ability of all the participants of the debate to exert epistemic influence, that is to share their knowledge as credible partners of a conversation that have the capacity to actually convince the other to one’s point of view. Fricker refers to such a situation as “the cooperative ethos of mutual epistemic recognition” (Fricker, 2018, p. 4). Understood in such terms, epistemic justice seems to require proper, on par, inclusion in a conversation, or what Fraser has called “participatory parity” and/or Benhabib, following Habermas, discussed under “discourse ethics.”⁴⁸ However, media reports analysed suggest a deficit of such parity that is experienced, or at least voiced, by both: the allegedly powerful (the majority) and the allegedly powerless (the minority). Regardless of their structural position, the various parties in the media(ted) debates claim being disadvantaged as an epistemic subject.

Justice as redress

The understanding of justice as a form of redress for harm suffered, albeit present, is not always very pronounced in the analysed media material. Also, the understanding of redress and its functions seems to differ between countries analysed. In Portuguese media attention is drawn to the uncovering the “truth” of the violence of colonialism as a necessary condition of reconciliation and the granting to minority groups a position they deserve. Redress is linked here to processes of social reconciliation and restorative justice.

In Turkey, the reconciliatory element is absent. In conservative, pro-government media, the proliferation of the religious *Imam Hatip* schools is often presented as a reaction to harms experienced by the schools in the times of secular republic: “The harm done [to *Imam Hatip* schools] between 1997 and 2002 has hardly been repaired until 2010. We thank the politicians and state officials for repairing the damage.”⁴⁹ The privileges the schools currently enjoy are thus framed as a form of redress for past discrimination; the (alleged) harm this inflicts on other, secular, schools and their students is silenced although not necessarily explicitly denied (nota bene just as the ‘reparative’

⁴⁸ Various authors made connection between epistemic justice and recognition (McConkey, 2004; Congdon, 2017; Fricker, 2018; Giladi, 2018); whereas others have stressed the distributive dimension of epistemic justice, understood as receiving less than fair share of an epistemic good, such as education or access to expert knowledge, information or advice (e.g. Coady, 2017). Fricker also explores the connections between epistemic justice and representation (2013).

⁴⁹ Haberleri, Gündem (2018) “28 Şubat sürecinde 2 kez görevden alınan İmam Hatip Lisesi Müdürü o günleri anlattı” *Sabah* (28/02/2018). Available at: <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/02/28/28-subat-surecinde-2-kez-gorevden-alinan-imam-hatip-lisesi-muduru-o-gunleri-anlatti>.

function of current favouritism towards *Imam Hatip* schools is silenced by the proponents of the secular values). At the same time, the repeated framing of the facilitation offered to the *Imam Hatip* schools as a form of compensation for past suffering (“the shackles are broken”) seems to serve the purpose of explaining, if not legitimizing, policies that to some might appear unjust. The insistence on the temporal lens and historical perspective offers a possibility to diminish the relevance of their grievances.

A reversed framing is used in Hungary, where right-wing pro-government media portray the international (especially EU) involvement in the issues of Roma education in Hungary as ‘revenge’ for the uncompromising stance of Hungary in the face of the ‘refugee crisis’ in 2015. Since Hungary (or pro-government media on behalf of Hungary) does not feel guilty of inflicting harm, the ‘revenge’ of the European institutions is interpreted in the pro-government media, albeit often tacitly, as unjust injury; an act of misplaced punishment designed to make the alleged culprit suffer. The language of vengeance (“Brussels's revenge”) indicates some relevance of retributive interpretations of justice, if only to explain the action of others.

Justice as protection (& freedom from ontological fear)

Protection, or – to refer to a concept tentatively applied in ETHOS reports D4.2 (Lepianka, 2018) and D7.1 (Knijn and Lepianka, 2018) – ‘ontological security,’ is yet another facet of justice whose relevance emerged in several of our country studies. Used in particular by conservative and/or right-wing media and their on-line active audiences in Austria, the Netherlands and the UK, the right to protection of one’s surroundings and way of life (or freedom from ontological fear) is claimed by, or on behalf of, those who feel that ‘the continuity of [their] self-identity and in the constancy of the surrounding social and material environments’ (Giddens, 1991, p. 91) is threatened by Islamic fundamentalism: non-Muslim white majority, Christians, women, homosexuals. Occasionally, the right to ‘protection’ is extended to Muslim-children seen as in danger of indoctrination and eventually radicalisation by extremists, although it is not really clear if the ‘protection’ is going to secure, or to violate, the ‘ontological security’ of the children.

In contrast, in light of the Turkish media analysed, it is both the religious segments of the society that are in need of protection against the rather vague “enemies of the people,” implicitly identified as the establishment and supporters of the secular republic (according to conservative, pro-government media), and the secular segments of the population whose norms and values are being violated by Islamist order (according to the liberal, government critical media). In both cases, it is the experienced (now or in the past) inability to secure the continuity of the preferred social and moral order and the craving for such continuity that drive demands for justice.

Strikingly, in the analysed material, calls for justice as protection, or freedom from ontological fear, are often veiled in the language of war, invasion and/or military operation.

Tensions identified

The various justice claims are commonly seen as entwined. For example, in the UK, the Netherlands and Austria, the more liberal, usually left-wing, media and their audiences plea for the recognition of minority (including Muslim) identity and community, also as a way to support the educational attainment of minority children. The recognitive claims of various minority groups often go hand in hand with demands for more just distribution of resources (for

example between schools serving different groups of students) and minority voice and representation within school settings. Moreover, as illustrated in the Turkish debates about *Imam Hatip* schools, redistributive injustice suffered by non-religious schools in terms of resource allocation, which affects the schools' capacity to admit all the students who would like to enrol, is seen by its critics not only as a cause of the unequal distribution of educational opportunities for a large number of youth (redistributive justice) and a factor that negatively affects their ability to flourish and lead the life which have reasons to value (capabilities), but linked as well to the violation of students' norms and values by forcing them into religious practices.

On the other hand, as expected, our analysis of media content reveals numerous, frequently interwoven, tensions between various types of claims, the procedural principles that govern different spheres and domains of justice, the moral grounds on which claims are made and, last but not least, between justice claims of various groups. In line with the approach adopted in this study, which builds on the presumption of a dialectical relationship between discourse and other elements of the social world (see: Introduction), whether or not any such justice-related tensions are signalled or even implied in the media content, and the way they are described, is constitutive of the relations of justice. It may thus help to sustain and reproduce the (un)just status quo, but also contribute to a (possible) transformation of the unjust social relations, for example by enabling alternative ways of 'seeing' the 'material reality' of (in)justice.

Tensions between facets of justice

As discussed by Fraser, realisation of recognitive claims to justice is often in conflict with the realisation of justice understood as fair distribution of resources. And vice versa. The latter tension is acknowledged, and given particular prominence, in Portuguese (media) debates, where it is claimed that the (policy) focus on poverty and class structure as the main factor explaining educational inequalities, pushes the injustice of colour blindness and the role of racism in the perpetuation of structural inequalities out of public debate and consciousness (Bicas et al., 2019, p. 27).

In other countries, the tensions between recognition and redistribution appear, in the light of media material analysed, to be more clearly interwoven with tensions between justice claims of various groups, which also appeal to different justice principles that govern redistribution of resources. In Austria and the Netherlands, more conservative media and their audiences often draw attention to how recognition of minority cultures and needs allegedly violates the principles of just distribution, for example via preferential treatment (larger investment!) of minority pupils and schools that accommodate them. It is also asserted, although often indirectly, that the recognition of the special educational needs of minority children negatively affects the majority's children educational development and their capabilities.

Comparable concerns, although reversed with respect to the identification of (potential) victims and beneficiaries of the existing educational policies, are expressed by more liberal, usually left-wing media and their audiences, which criticize the privileged position of denominational schools and/or policies that prioritize(d) freedom of educational choice over equal opportunities. The tension between the freedom of choice and the distributive ideals of equal opportunity seems particularly hotly debated the Netherlands and Hungary, where the parental prerogative to choose the most suitable education for their children is juxtaposed against its adverse consequence: white/intelligentsia/middle class 'flight' that contributes to educational segregation and, in consequence, the inequality of educational attainment, opportunity and social mobility. On the one hand, in the more conservative

media outlets and/or in the comments by my conservative audience members, segregation is presented as an unavoidable side effect of the much celebrated freedom of education, an aftermath of a natural parental drive to advance their children by boosting their well-being and future prospects and a corollary to the basic human need to associate with those whom we find similar. For example, one of the Dutch media users, who him/herself attended a specialized non-religious school, that is a school following a specific pedagogical philosophy/approach, reflects on the benefits of segregation through the lens of his/her own experience:

*The goal was to make sure you were among ‘our kind of people’, and not between the “plebs”. (...) I know that I sound unbearable elitist, but it also makes sense to not confront children at an too early age with all the complications of diversity in social class and ethnic background.*⁵⁰

On the other hand, however, in the more liberal (Hungary) or left-wing media (the Netherlands), it is sometimes suggested that freedom of educational choice is not identical for *all* parents, but conditioned, among other things, on parental resources in the form of economic, social and cultural capital. This is well illustrated by a quote from Hülya Kosar-Altinyelken – a social scientist interviewed for the Dutch newspaper *Het Parool*:

*The freedom of school choice is relative and does not apply to everybody; I hear stories of [minority] parents who say to have been discouraged from [sending their kids] to schools with many ethnic Dutch. Even if you look at the school admission policy in Amsterdam (...) it seems that the freedom of school choice is limited.*⁵¹

Moreover, in Dutch, Hungarian and Turkish media, in particular in the more leftist (the Netherlands, Turkey) or liberal (Hungary) media sources, attention is drawn to redistributive injustices generated and/or reinforced by the prioritization of the freedom offered to religious schools in shaping their admission policies (the Netherlands, Hungary) and/or by the preferences they enjoy in the allocation of state resources (Hungary, Turkey). The (renewed) recognition of the traditionally dominant and/or historically embedded religious identities is framed by the more liberal, left-wing media, as a cause, even if indirect, of a skewed distribution of educational attainment, life chances and capabilities that puts some children, especially children from more vulnerable socio-economic milieus, in a disadvantage.

In addition, support of religiously informed education in the name of the recognition of religious identities and values endorsed by parents, is sometimes framed in the sources analysed as disadvantageous for the capability development of the children who attend religiously-informed schools. Since the schools are believed to foster intolerance for difference and to narrow down the horizons of their students, children attending them are less likely to “flourish in a modern multicultural society.” While this type of fear is more often expressed in relation to the disabling capacities of Muslim schools, e.g., in the UK, similar concerns are also voiced in relation to Christian schools, for example in Hungary or the Netherlands.

⁵⁰ Users comment to Flentge, Erik (2017) “Tijd dat we de segregatie in het onderwijs een halt toeroepen.” *Joop.nl* (18/04/2017). Available at: <https://joop.bnnvara.nl/opinies/tijd-dat-we-de-segregatie-in-het-onderwijs-een-halt-toeroepen>.

⁵¹ Gelder, Lorianne van (2016). “Zwarte en witte scholen, het lijkt wel apartheid.” *Het Parool* (13/12/2016). Available at: <https://w.ww.parool.nl/nieuws/zwarte-en-witte-scholen-het-lijkt-wel-apartheid~b6b311c1/>.

On a different note, recognition of (religious/cultural) difference is often interpreted in the media clips analysed as at odds with a broader sense of justice linked to the well-being and safety of the society. For example, recognition of (even some elements of) Muslim culture is construed, especially by the more conservative media and their audiences, as a threat to the ('ontological') security of the majority, predominantly white, population. Thus, the freedom enjoyed by Muslim parents to pass onto their children their values and ways of life raises concerns and demands that the passing of "extremist values," values deemed "separatist" or "extremised" should not be recognized by the state.

All in all, the privileged position of denominational schools, while justifiable on the grounds of recognition of difference and/or civil liberties, freedom of religion and freedom of choice, is often framed in the analyzed media as at odds with the demands of redistributive justice and the well-being of society a whole. Attention is drawn to the harmful effects of religious indoctrination and the threat it poses to emancipation, tolerance, progress and science; and – last but not least – the adverse effects of (religion based) segregation on social integration and cohesion.

Tensions related to the principles of justice & the moral grounds for justice

Tensions between the various principles of (redistributive) justice – merit, equality and need – seem particularly pronounced in the Austrian debates on the proposed reforms in the education system and their normative foundations. The debates, as reported in the media analysed, revolve around the fairness of the whole educational system and whether or not (or to what extent) it should aim at increasing educational attainment through uniform ('equalizing') standards and procedures that reward hard work, discipline and achievement (meritocracy) or, alternatively, through addressing individual needs and securing equality of opportunity through systemic redistribution.

Similar controversy, although less central in the debate, is present in the Netherlands, where the freedom of (white, middle class, Dutch) parents to choose schools for their children is defended also on the grounds of the educational abilities, achievements and aspirations of the (white, middle class, Dutch) children which are likely to sink in mixed schools that focus on addressing the needs of the often 'mediocre' and 'unruly' pupils from weaker milieus. Illustrative here is a comment by one of the readers of Dutch right-wing media: "White parents have drawn their conclusions and keep their children as far as possible from the [minority] youth of which nothing [good] can be expected, which has bad influence and, above all, may make up a dangerous environment."⁵² In those debates the tensions between different principles that should govern the distribution of (quality) education frequently coincide with tensions between the claims of different groups.

Tensions arise as well respect to (past) suffering as a moral ground for affirmation, for example, in the form of preferential treatment. While redress and compensation of past harms do not seem controversial in themselves, tensions arise if compensation or redress implicates new suffering (arguably by a different social actor, often the alleged culprit of the past harm). While this trade-off is not necessarily verbalized in the media clips analysed, it does seem to underpin controversies around the preferential treatment of religious schools in Turkey. Interesting

⁵² A comment by a reader to a blogpost "'Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid'." *Geenstijl.nl* (07/01/2018). Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5140158/steenhuis-ga-weg-bij-dat-vod/>.

in those debates is the assumed virtue, or blamelessness, of the (alleged) victims and the silencing of the harm they might have inflicted (in the past) or are inflicting (now) on some others, who also claim victimhood. This is very well illustrated in Turkey, where the affirmation of the historical victims (traditional, religious sections of the society) is framed in the conservative media as a moral triumph, with no attempt to acknowledge the harm, or sense of injustice, it might bring to other groups. On the other hand, the claims of injustice currently suffered by the secular sections of the population, delved on in the liberal media, are devoid of reference to the harms the early republic might have inflicted on the religiously-minded groups. In both cases, the potential victimhood of the constructed ‘the other’ is silenced. Discursively this is linked to the praxis of de-personalization of the other, who being framed as ‘them’ or ‘the enemy’ or ‘the threat’, seems to lose his/her moral claim to victimhood (and possible also justice).

Somehow related to the question of victimhood as a moral ground for justice, is the question of ‘truth.’ While ‘truth’ is often framed in the analysed media clips as a condition for enacting justice, tensions arise around who has the right, authority and means (tools) to establish the truth. As already noted, the importance of truth – understood through the lens of authenticity of claims and veracity of testimony – is particularly prominent in the Trojan Horse debates in the UK that are reported and ‘enacted’ in the media. Yet, the relevance of ‘truth’ as a means to and evocation of justice is also relevant for the media debates in other countries. In the Netherlands, one of the frames identified in the media debates, unfolds mainly in reaction to the criticism (of specific forms of educations) that is experienced as ill-founded, based on ‘fallacies’, stereotypes, misconceptions, and erroneous information, and which in itself is experienced – and framed – as a form of misrecognition.⁵³

The need for ‘truth’ as a condition for enacting justice is also reflected in the use of numbers, statistical data, reports and academic sources, and the like, applied by the media analysed to establish the real scale and consequences of educational segregation in the Netherlands, and the demands of real ‘hard’ figures on the number of Roma and Afro-descendants residing in Portugal. In both those cases, the ‘truth’ of quantified data is believed to offer a sort of a measuring rod that permits an evaluation of the scale of injustice and a solid basis for the development of policy that would tackle the various forms of exclusion and discrimination. In some media clips, the rightfulness and/or legitimacy of certain claims to justice seems to be evaluated on the basis of their ‘accuracy’ and/or measurable ‘objectivity’ (for further discussion see also section on *Framing devices and multimodality*).

Tensions between groups

Particularly pronounced in more conservative media are tensions between the claims of different social groups. Most important here are the disagreements as to whose well-being is threatened, who is the actual (‘true’) victim of injustice and who is the potential agent of the injustice inflicted.

Suffering victim vs. source of threat

Interesting in the material analysed is the relativity of the status of victim – often reversed depending on the ideological stance of the media. In Turkey, where the polarisation seems to be strongest, the sufferer-threat

⁵³ It relates to criticism of religiously informed education and so-called ‘specialized education’ founded on specific pedagogical philosophies. The frame referred here is labelled in the Dutch country report as: “Freedom of Choice as a democratic value and right” (Lepianka et al., 2019).

dichotomies re-constructed on the basis of the media clips analysed run along the lines of secular/religious us vs. them, where the specific characteristic of ‘us’ and ‘them’ differ by context.

In Austria, Hungary, the Netherlands and the UK, in the more conservative, right-wing media, it is usually the white majority that is construed as a victim of (ethnic, racial, religious) minority groups, the state and its (unjust) policies that favour minorities, or both. In Austria, the presence of children who deviate from the majority children in terms of culture (religious affiliation), language acquisition, but also discipline and morality, is construed in the conservative media as exerting negative influence on the school system – both in terms of knowledge transmission (quality of education) and safety (problems with drugs and violence). The hard-working (implicitly white Austrian) students are portrayed by the very same media as cheated of their educational opportunities through ever-sinking standards, outputs and quality of education; and a victim of “the experiments of the leftist educational planners.”⁵⁴ Often the threat posed by minorities is framed as extending far beyond the educational settings. The alleged domination of Turks in Austrian public life, coupled with their alleged disregard for majoritarian values, are interpreted as a threat to the cultural continuity of the society as a whole.

If a minority group is construed as a victim by the conservative, right-wing media, they are the victim of self-exclusion and – in the case of Muslims – Islamic fundamentalism and extremism. In the UK media, in the context of the Trojan Horse controversy, Muslim children in particular are construed as victims of their own communities that prevent them from flourishing and by cutting them off from the wider society make them “vulnerable to segregation and emotional dislocation.”⁵⁵ Yet, also in the Netherlands, the right-wing audiences make reference to Muslim parents blaming them for the educational lack of success of their children: “[They] complain about discrimination? They isolate themselves (...) Put themselves in a box. Create their own country in the Netherlands.”⁵⁶ The consequences of such a rhetoric might be far-reaching. A belief that somebody suffers harm or inequality as a result of their voluntary decisions and is thus responsible for their disadvantageous position may go hand in hand with a denial or relativization of injustice they might be suffering. Exceptional in this context are the right-wing, pro-government Hungarian media, which construe the Roma minority as a victim of human right lawyers who, aligned with EU in attacks against Hungarian educational policy of “loving segregation”, act against the actual interests of the Roma children (Kende, 2019: 13).

In the left-wing media, minority members are usually portrayed as a victim of (structural) neglect and institutional discrimination that prevents them from developing their talents and capabilities. In Hungary, they are presented as

⁵⁴ *Unzensuriert.at* (2017) “Neue Regierung auf Leistungskurs im Bildungswesen.” *Unzensuriert.at* (18/12/2017). Available at: <https://unzensuriert.de/content/0025783-Neue-Regierung-auf-Leistungskurs-im-Bildungswesen>.

⁵⁵ Murray, Douglas (2014). “Save Our Children from the Islamists.” *The Spectator* (4/06/2014). Available at: <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2014/06/save-our-children-from-the-islamists/>.

⁵⁶ Audience member’s comment to: “Er is ruimte voor 70 islamitische basisscholen in Nederland.” *wnl.tv* (3/11/2017). Available at: <https://wnl.tv/2017/11/03/er-is-ruimte-70-islamitische-basisscholen-nederland/>.

(footnote continued)

a victim of governmental policy that serves the isolation aspirations of the majority, and in particular the interests of religiously-minded elites. In Portugal, minorities are portrayed as victims of historically embedded institutional racism. In the UK, particular attention is drawn to the misrecognition of the Muslim community in the form of false accusations and stigmatization through associations with terrorism, extremism; Muslim communities are also recognized as an object of witch-hunt by government officials, demonized and scapegoated.⁵⁷

In general, minority groups are thus presented in the media sources analysed as either a suffering victim or a threat to the majority (children). For example, in Hungary media critical of the government accuse the authorities of manipulating Roma parents into support for school segregation against the interest of Roma children. On the other hand, the educational integration of ‘uncultivated’ and ‘morally deprived’ Roma children in mixed schools is presented by the pro-governmental Hungarian media as a threat to non-Roma. Such a duality is observable also in other countries.

Beyond the us-them rhetoric?

While the juxtaposition of the majority and minorities permeates the analysed media material, in all countries there are frames that seek to move beyond the us-them rhetoric, with or without the actual embracing of diversity. In the Netherlands, for example, two frames that plea for freedom of parental choice in educational matters, justifying it on the grounds of historical tradition, constitutional rights and civil liberties, refrain from privileging (the grievances of) any specific socio-economic or ethnic group. While disregarding the issue of the potentially negative side-effect such freedom may bring to less privileged social groups, the two frames seem to view educational segregation as natural, or even beneficial to all groups of children who can develop in a familiar environment, surrounded by students of the same kind. Similar voices are raised in pro-governmental, right-wing, Hungarian media, which refer to “spontaneous segregation”⁵⁸, thus absolving political actors from responsibility for segregation of education along ethnic lines, and which describe the governmental policy of “loving segregation” as equally beneficial for both: Roma children (attending secular schools) and Hungarian children (and especially those attending religious schools).⁵⁹ Characteristic of this rhetoric is avoidance of explicitly negative valuation of minority

⁵⁷ See, for example, Shackle, Samira (2017). “Trojan Horse: The Real Story behind the Fake ‘Islamic Plot’ to Take over Schools.” *The Guardian* (1/09/2017). Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/01/trojan-horse-the-real-story-behind-the-fake-islamic-plot-to-take-over-schools>; and The Huffington Post (2014). “‘Trojan Horse’ Birmingham School Trustees Quit Following ‘Witch Hunt.’” *The Huffington Post* (15/07/2014). Available at: https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/07/15/trojan-horse-trustees-quit_n_5588128.html?utm_hp_ref=uk-operation-trojan-horse.

⁵⁸ Hanthy, Kinga (2016) “Kecskekő - Gyöngyöspata – az igazi problémát a politika szülte.” *Magyaridok* (5/10/2016). Available at: <https://www.magyaridok.hu/lugas/kecskeko-1066615/>. The concept of “spontaneous segregation”, fiercely contested in academic literature, relates educational segregation to residential segregation.

⁵⁹ It is worth noting that most non-Roma children attending religious schools in Hungary are non-religious and their (or their parents’) choice of religious schools is driven by the schools’ elitist status.

(footnote continued)

groups and evasion of juxtaposing the (white, national) majority against the (racialized) minority. Rather, the implicitly negative stereotypes of Roma are clothed in paternalistic care that defends segregation on the grounds of “special pedagogical methods” necessary to address the “cultural otherness” of Roma children. Moreover, they stress the satisfaction of the Roma with the policies of segregation:

*[Roma] families are happy that their children can learn in small [segregated] classes: they are in a safe place all day long, get a meal several times a day, surrounded by attention and love; they can learn music and participate in extracurricular programmes.*⁶⁰

Such a rhetoric is rejected by the left-wing media, which protest against the framing of Roma children as requiring special care (Kende, 2019: 17).

The embracing of diversity that is paired with the recognition of the inherent agency of all actors, without pushing any of them in the role of a victim, is rather infrequent. In one of the frames identified in Austria, the ‘otherness’ of members of minority groups (religious, ethnic, sexual), although acknowledged and recognized as a cause of disadvantage in many social settings, is simultaneously presented as a source of pride and a strength. Rather than dwelling on the suffering of the minority groups, emphasis is placed on how their ‘ascribed’ difference constitutes an asset and a benefit. For example, multilingualism is not necessarily foregrounded as an object of neglect and disregard in the system of education, but rather as a gift and a special privilege of some minority groups.⁶¹ Still, the ‘agency’ of the minority groups is not explicitly discussed in the context of them taking the responsibility for their (future) position in the society. Rather tellingly, the frame is exclusive to on-line platforms run by and addressed to minority audiences – women, religious minorities, ethnic minorities and/or people with disabilities (Tiefenbacher and Perschy, 2019: 21).

Tensions related to the scope of responsibility

In all the debates analysed, responsibility for the education process and outcomes is placed on a multiplicity of actors: parents, teachers and school boards, local and national authorities. However, the weight, range and content of this responsibility differs per frame used within and across countries, and per media analysed. In more conservative discourses, emphasis is placed on parental responsibility for the outcome of the educational process. Equipped with the freedom to choose the education that is best suited for their children, exempt from the blame

⁶⁰ Anita, Éló (2015) “Szeretetteljes felzárkóztatás – A Kúria döntött, a baloldal elszörnyedt.” *Valasz.hu* (23/04/2015). Available at: http://valasz.hu/publi/szeretetteljes-felzarkoztat-as-a-kuria-dontott-a-baloldal-elszornyedt-111937?utm_source=mandiner&utm_medium=link&utm_campaign=mandiner_201811.

⁶¹ Indeed, as observed by one of the Austrian readers, “It’s ... sad that this immense potential of linguistic competency is constantly portrayed as something negative in the media. All languages are valuable.” Source: Bag, Abdullah (2017) “Deutsch als Fremdsprache: Muss das etwas Negatives sein?” *Das Biber* (1/3/2017). Available at: <https://www.dasbiber.at/blog/deutsch-als-fremdsprache-muss-das-etwas-negatives-sein>.

(footnote continued)

for “white” or “middle class” flight, (majority white) parents are viewed as the ultimate agents of the educational success of their children. In a similar vein, educational failure of, for example, minority children is attributed to the short-sightedness and lack of proper care on the part of their parents or their insufficient integration in the (host) society. For example, in Hungary, the pro-governmental media accuse Roma parents of “holding their children back”⁶² despite all the governmental investment in remedial education (Kende, 2019, p. 19). Similarly, in the Netherlands, Muslim parents are blamed for neglecting their children’s educational development and not making use of the possibilities offered.

At the same time, there seems to be less consensus as to the scope and nature of responsibility that rests on the authorities, especially with respect to remedies. For example, in the Dutch (media) discourses that defend the freedom of educational choice and construction of segregation as a natural process with no serious consequences for social relations, the role of the authorities is envisaged as clearly facilitative. Moreover, responsibility for any policy-related developments is delegated to the local level – the municipal authorities, school boards, civil society – thus exempting the national-level actors from structural reforms. Yet, in the discourses that frame the majority as a victim of multiculturalism and the politics of identity, overrepresented in right-wing media, decisive action on the part of national government is fiercely demanded. In the Netherlands and Austria, where national authorities are blamed for the drama of multiculturalism, unfettered migration and failed integration of newcomers, the responsibility of the authorities lies, according to the sources analysed, in reversing the negative trends and – above all – in securing the continuity of the nation and national values through curbing the unwanted ‘foreign’ influences and demands. To what extent that means (forced) assimilation or deportation of those who are construed as ‘foreigners’ or ‘migrants’ remains unclear.

On the other end of the ideological spectrum – in the more liberal and/or leftist media, causal responsibility for injustices within educational system and/or responsibility for the reparation of past harms and prevention of new grievances is clearly attributed to the politicians and authorities, coupled, occasionally, with a praise of minority parents’ involvement in the educational advancement of their children. For example, the *Teaching Times*, in the UK, contrasted the attitudes of Muslim parents to those of the white working class in Birmingham:

It’s also true that the Muslim population has led to a revival in the performance of the city’s inner-city schools because of their commitment to education. Many of them are faring much better now than the white working-class schools in the outlying council estates – what are euphemistically called the ‘White Highlands’. In educational terms, they are really the ‘White Lowlands’. Muslim parents, especially the leaders in their community, are much more involved in education than their white counterparts and see it

⁶² Velkei, Tamás (2015) “Agyi szegregáció.” *Mandiner* (24/04/2015). Available at: https://mandiner.hu/cikk/20150424_velkei_tamas_agyi_szegregacio.

(footnote continued)

*as critical to the health of their community. If such were the case in other schools in the city, teachers would be gleeful about more committed parental involvement.*⁶³

Remedies advocated in the more liberal and/or leftist media to address redistributive injustices in the realm of education range from – a rather fundamental – abolition of the freedom of educational choice (for example, in the Netherlands), to far-reaching structural changes in the system of early tracking and/or limiting school autonomy in shaping their own admission criteria. With respect to the latter, in Hungary, Portugal and the Netherlands, media and their audience commonly call for de-segregating educational settings and integration of minority children in mixed schools and classes. On the local level, discussed predominantly in Dutch and Hungarian media, preference is given to improvements in the quality of education, investments in attractive school infrastructure and amendments in teachers' education to increase their sensitivity towards minority children and prepare them "for inclusive pedagogy"⁶⁴ and/or accessible forms of supplementary tuition for socially disadvantaged pupils. Calls for well-integrated anti-poverty and housing policies are also present, especially in Portugal, where the problem of school segregation is construed as linked to territorial segregation. In the media material analysed, politicians and (national) authorities are also held responsible for addressing recognitive injustices, suffered in particular by minority groups. In Portugal, authorities are held responsible for de-colonizing and de-racializing of the curriculum and for altering the racialized structure of schools (composition of student and teacher body, management and school boards) that reinforces the reproduction of the colonial power- and class-relations and tolerance for racially motivated micro-aggression.

Tensions & visions of good life and common good

All those tensions, exposed and/or construed in the media, seem very much rooted in the differing, sometimes incompatible, visions of good life and common good. According to the material analysed, such a conflict is most acute in Turkey, where the controversy around the *Iman Hatip* schools is rooted in a fierce struggle between two irreconcilable value systems and visions of morality: the religious values of the current regime and the secular-modernist values (of the early republic). The conflict is most apparent with respect to ideal of gender relations and the position of women.

As suggested by the material analysed, in other countries, tensions arise around the relative importance of freedom of choice of education and the right of parents and communities to nourish and transmit their (cultural and religious) values. Interestingly, those tensions may cut across the traditional opposition between liberal and communitarian visions of social life, where the former emphasize the autonomy of the individual and importance of individual liberty, and the latter accentuate the social nature of the self and the normative value of community. The freedom of educational choice is believed to reinforce the transmission of significant communal values, some of which – such as those religiously informed – might be far from promoting individual liberty or autonomy. This is well illustrated in the Dutch debates, where freedom of choice of education is defended as a liberal right and a part of Dutch political history and national identity, deeply embedded in the Dutch *poldermodel* or *pillarization* and the

⁶³ *Teaching Times*. n.d. 'Is There an Islamic Conspiracy in Birmingham Schools?' *Teaching Times*. Available at: <https://www.teachingtimes.com/articles/is-there-an-islamic-conspiracy-in-birmingham-schools>.

⁶⁴ Újlaky, András (2016) "Kelletlenül. A kormány és az unió vitája a szegregált oktatás miatt." *Magyar Narancs* (03/11/2016). Available at: <https://magyarnarancs.hu/publicisztika/kelletlenu-101452>.

culture of consensus; and where it is being criticized for its negative effects on social segregation, social integration and social cohesion (Lepianka et al., 2019).

Interesting in this context is the tension, noted in the UK report, between *respect for diversity* and *the promotion of diversity*, “where the latter necessitates some form of separation between groups to enable the community to pass on its own values” (Divald, 2019: 15). The general view of a society that seems to be cherished here is that of separation between groups leading parallel lives; a vision of society in which different social groups have the freedom and possibility to pursue their goals and thus also to choose the type of education that best suits their norms and values and benefits their children most. Implicitly, such a vision underscores the value attached to the recognition of difference and the equality among the relatively independent social groups, present, for example, in the Dutch tradition of pillarization, but reflected as well in the Hungarian metaphor of “loving segregation.” In the UK, and to certain extent also in the Netherlands and Austria, such *promotion of diversity* is problematized due to its consequences for Muslim children, who are not allowed to ‘flourish,’ but also to the broader society, due the threat of Muslim radicalization and security threats. Fear of “parallel social worlds” and societies split into enclaves or island of (normatively) unconnected “tribes” urges the more conservative media, and especially their audiences, to demand a nearly total assimilation (or expulsion) of minority groups (or those members of the groups who do not conform to the norms and values of the majority). Crucial here is the issue of the perceived loyalty of the minority members to the state. Interestingly, however, ‘loyalty’ is not necessarily a value in itself: while minority members are expected to show loyalty to their host society, their loyalty to their own community is not judged by the same standards. Indeed ‘moderate’ Muslims in the UK, who remained silent after the Trojan Horse controversy broke, were accused by the rightist media of not speaking against Islamic fundamentalism; their loyalty and belonging questioned (Divald, 2019: 20-21).

At the other end of the ideological spectrum, the more liberal and/or leftist media call for the embracing of minority groups as beneficial and enriching to the (host) society. Problematizing the apparent disregard for unequal power relations and the interdependence of different social groups, they plea for offering to minority groups a space to flourish and grow into the tissue of their (host) societies as their respected on par members. Securing real equality of opportunity via redistributive policies and promotion of mixed, in some context also secular schools, engaged in developing civic skills, is seen as a condition sine qua non of social cohesion, presumed to rest on the grounds of common (civic!) identity and respect for difference.

Note on framing devices

Attention to explicit and implicit meanings conveyed in the analysed media clips via metaphors, allusions, similes, semantic and syntactic choices, but also by silences or omissions, constituted an important part of our analytical work, inspired by a realisation, common to discourse studies, that language plays an active role in creating and changing social relations. Therefore, even though a comprehensive analysis of how various linguistic devices are applied by the media producers and receives (i.e. interacting audiences) in the justice-related educational debates falls beyond the scope of this comparative report, we would like to close it with a few reflections on the use of framing devices and multimodal content. We focus on three issues: (1) the use of factual information vs appeal to emotions as framing strategies; (2) the level and nature of engagement of various (political and discursive) sides of

the debate with one another; (3) multi-modal aspects of communication, and especially (4) the nature of users' (i.e. audience) comments.

Reason vs emotions

In virtually all countries, actors involved in certain stands of the educational debates, particularly those in the centre and on the left of the political spectrum, fell on statistics, academic research, or input of educational experts to offer a sense of solidity and a factual foundation to their arguments on the role of educational attainment in determining social stratification and/or the disadvantageous position of racial, ethnic or religious minority groups in their societies. In Austria, the Netherlands, and the UK, reference to statistics and (international) research is particularly frequent when redistributive justice is appealed to and/or structural position and educational attainment of various groups is compared. In Austria and the Netherlands, reference to statistical information frames the problem of injustice in education as structural and thus in need of structural solutions. Used predominantly in the left-wing media, it introduces an element of *thematic framing* into news reporting on educational injustice. According to Iyengar (1990), this type of framing encourages the public to perceive social problems as system-based and become more supportive of structural measures as a way to address them. In Portugal, where statistical figures on (educational achievement of) minority groups is missing, it is the call for the collection of such exact data that regularly features in the debates. Underpinning such calls is a strong belief that only solid statistical data on ethnic origin can undermine the myth of racial and cultural homogeneity of Portuguese society and thus assist the emancipation of racial and ethnic minorities. In Hungary, expert discourses take the form of reference to legal frameworks, such as equal treatment and anti-discrimination laws, descriptions of segregation cases that have been ruled in the Hungarian Supreme Court, or (critical) discussion of international recommendations and legal procedures related to the educational segregation of Roma children. In contrast to other countries, the 'matter-of-fact', professional and unemotional language is used in Hungary by both the conservative pro-government media and the liberal government-critical media, with each ideological camp using the legal jargon to forward their own interpretation of whether segregated education enhances or impedes justice for Roma children.

A careful selection of sources and background material might indeed constitute a powerful argument in media attempts to establish the 'truth.' For example, providing data on the demand for *Imam Hatip* schools in Turkey, serves the purpose of attacking (left-wing *Cumhuriyet*) or defending (right-wing *Sabah*) the recent proliferation of such schools. In case of the Trojan horse controversy discussed in the British media, hard figures are used, for example, to back-up and/or reject allegations against social actors involved in the affair. Also in Hungary, use of legal arguments serves the purpose of winning the 'truth' battle about the nature Roma discrimination and whether or not educational segregation constitutes a violation of Roma rights or – vice versa – their endorsement.

At the same time, however, careful use of statistical sources and other background material, for example, in Austria or the Netherlands, reflects the profile of those primarily involved in the mainstream media debate – either as authors or quoted sources: educators, policy makers and/or commentators specialised in issues of education. Also in Hungary, it is the institutional and political actors and human rights lawyers that use legal references to frame the debate in 'objective' legal terms.

Finally, extensive reference to expert sources by certain, non-tabloid left-wing rather than centre or right-wing, media outlets might be also a sign of care for the quality of reporting and/or responsiveness to the expectations of

their (usually highly-educated) audiences. This is, nonetheless, a double-edged sword: frequent reference to research, expert voices, legal documents and statistics is likely to put off less high-brow and less versatile audience, who might in fact be most in need of factual information. Considering the fact that it is usually the leftist media which more eagerly rely on hard data and expert arguments,⁶⁵ minorities' struggle for justice, channelled predominantly through leftist media,⁶⁶ run the risk of becoming 'elitist' in being addressed to and heard exclusively by members of leftist elites. Especially, as appeal to commonly shared fears and emotions is in general more often used on the right side of the ideological spectrum, and especially in the social media, where anti-migrant or anti-minority sentiments are also the strongest.⁶⁷ Arguably then, a deficit of 'hard data' in the right-wing media has a considerable impact on the shape of public debate. As noted by Redden (2011; cf. Lepianka, 2015), statistical data help to draw public attention to the scale and prevalence of the problem, which makes it difficult for politicians and other social actors to ignore the problem or understate it. Shortage of hard data and expert arguments in right-wing media allows their audience to stay ignorant about the scale and nature of the problem of injustice suffered by ethnic/racial/cultural and religious minorities in the realm of education, and to dismiss it as an issue worthy of their concern and/or concern of the social actors, such as politicians, who represent them.

Emotions, discrediting, and racist undertones

Frequent, especially in the right-wing media in Austria, Hungary or the Netherlands, are arguments *ad personam*, directed either at the (political) adversary (usually a left-wing politician, an independent organisation or a journalist defending minority rights and/or presenting their perspective), or the minorities themselves, for example through use of stigmatizing stereotypes. Such arguments help to redirect the debate and avoid constructive engagement with the arguments of the discursive opponent. They also serve the purpose of casting a doubt on the credibility of the opponent and the veracity of their claims. Exemplary here is mockery used to discredit human rights layers by pro-governmental media in Hungary, when referring to them as "human rights lawyers from Rose Hill", thus alluding to their elite-position in the society and disconnection from the ordinary Roma families whose interest they claim to represent. Particularly striking, however, are instances of aggressive and abusive epithets (such as "Islamic scum", "asocial bad-Dutch speaking shitheads"⁶⁸) and racist allusions directed at minority groups. Illustrative here is a comment by a reader of a popular right-wing blog (*Geenstijl.nl*) in the Netherlands:

⁶⁵ Hungarian pro-government media, which also excel in applying legal discourse, being an exception.

⁶⁶ And minority or community run media, with minority/community members being their target audience.

⁶⁷ As shown, for example, by a journalistic research by Bahara et al. (2019) about the role of Youtube in the radicalization of anti-racial and anti-migrant sentiments (available at: <https://www.volkskrant.nl/kijkverder/v/2019/hoeyoutube-rechtse-radicalisering-in-de-hand-werkt/> and <https://www.volkskrant.nl/kijkverder/t/2019/radicalisering-youtube/>).

⁶⁸ Audience comments to posts published at *Geenstijl.nl*: "'Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid'." *Geenstijl.nl* (07/01/2018). Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5140158/steenhuys-ga-weg-bij-dat-vod/>; and "Ebru Umar - Fuck islamitisch onderwijs op marmeren vloeren en onder kroonluchters." *Geenstijl.nl*

(footnote continued)

*Of course there are also those [Muslim children] who are intelligent and are doing well, but they are lagging far behind an average Dutch [child]. And nobody in the academia dares to point out the genetic aspect.*⁶⁹

The above quote clearly brings ‘biological racism’ back on the agenda. It shows that a shift away from ‘biological racism’ towards ‘cultural racism’ that focuses on markers of ethnic and cultural difference rather than genetic inferiority of the Other (Balibar 1991) has not been complete; associations of non-white phenotypes with lower intelligence still live in popular discourse, although often entwined with ‘cultural racism’ and ‘classism. Dutch users of *Geenstijl.nl*, for example, explain the alleged genetic deficiency of Muslim children by linking it to incestuous marriage practices of Muslims and ‘negative self-selection’ of newcomers (“low-educated people ... the scum of their homeland”).⁷⁰

Use of emotionally loaded words can be also observed in Austrian media analysed, especially in the two frames that could be seen are parallel in representing either the majoritarian point of view (*Clash of cultures frame*) or the predominantly minority’s point of view (*Recognising diversity frame*). As in the Netherlands, strong, polarizing language and reference to disrespectful stereotypes about minority members is typical for right and centre-right media and some of their audiences. However, emotions are also expressed by minority members and those speaking on their behalf, for example, when societal injustice and dominant (hegemonic) narratives are explicitly condemned and debunked through satire and (personal) accounts of injustice. The latter are usually reported through anecdotes and video- or audio-based interviews placed in community media run by and for ethnic minorities, that is, in niche media of very limited reach.

Appeal to emotions is also discernable in Hungarian media. The government-critical outlets employ personalized accounts, emotionally loaded language and other multi-modal devices to convey an image of Roma as victims of governmental policy and to express (and evoke) compassion and sympathy for Roma children. The injustice of educational segregation of Roma children, its socio-structural context and consequences are presented through the lens of individual accounts, such as that of a Roma mother suing the authorities for rejecting her child’s school applications to a non-district mixed-school. Media use as well the photo images of bad schooling conditions in Roma-populated segregated schools and vivid representations of poverty suffered by Roma in their segregated

(24/04/2018). Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5141694/ebru-umar-fuck-islamitisch-onderwijs-op-marmeren-vloeren-en-onder-kroonluchters/>.

⁶⁹ “Ebru Umar - Fuck islamitisch onderwijs op marmeren vloeren en onder kroonluchters.” *Geenstijl.nl* (24/04/2018).

Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5141694/ebru-umar-fuck-islamitisch-onderwijs-op-marmeren-vloeren-en-onder-kroonluchters/>.

⁷⁰ “Ebru Umar - Fuck islamitisch onderwijs op marmeren vloeren en onder kroonluchters.” *Geenstijl.nl* (24/04/2018).

Available at: <https://www.geenstijl.nl/5141694/ebru-umar-fuck-islamitisch-onderwijs-op-marmeren-vloeren-en-onder-kroonluchters/>.

(footnote continued)

settlements (Kende, 2019: 17). Emotions are also appealed to by the pro-government media to defend the policy of ‘loving segregation’ (“[Roma] families are happy”; “children were crying after the court decisions [that banned segregation]”), and to stigmatize Roma children and imply a connection between their situation (poverty, isolation), their socially unacceptable or even dysfunctional behavior, and the threat they allegedly pose to non-Roma children. Pro-government Hungarian media applying the *threat frame* employ dramatic rhetorical devices that emphasize the “backwardness” and cultural incompatibility of Roma children, who need to “to practice the different rules of human coexistence” and be thought “how to wash their hands and use the toothbrush.”⁷¹ As already noted elsewhere in this report, such rhetoric could be interpreted as a form of naturalization of the supposed inferiority of ethnic and racial minorities, and the justification of their low position in the social hierarchy.

Level of engagement with the opponent

The degree to which and the manner in which various parties to the debate engage with each other and/or respond to the arguments of their political or discursive opponents depends predominantly on the degree of political polarisation in the country, and to a lesser extent on the arguments in question. In Turkey and Hungary, where the political scene and the media are most polarised, educational debates analysed are subjected to the logic of a partisan conflict, with no common ground for discussion about the issues of justice. While the two sides of the debate clearly address each other, this happens through more or less overt attacks carried out with the use of reasoning (i.e. argumentative) strategies and framing (i.e. mostly linguistic) devices.⁷² Often, in such polarized setting, the opponent does not even need to be mentioned. As Ruben and Hışıl (2019) observe in relation the Turkish debate, the ‘who’ of the reporting is so obvious to journalists, editors and readers of the newspapers representing the two sides of the political and cultural conflict that it does not need to be specified (pp. 26, 42). Exceptional to this partisan logic is the general prejudice against Roma uniformly expressed by Hungarian media users (i.e. audience members), regardless of their own ideological stance or the ideological profile of the media outlet they contribute to.

Ideologically-informed polarisation of opinions, although less violent, is observable in other countries, too. This involves taking a clear, although opposing, view on the exactly same issue. For example, in the British media reports on the Trojan horse controversy, in debates around the veracity of allegations against Muslim community, Muslim educators and schools in question, claims about there being “no evidence”⁷³ of a plot, made by more leftist media, are counterbalanced by right-wing assertions that “It’s a fiction to suggest that there was no plot by Islamist hardliners to take over state schools”⁷⁴ (see Divald, 2019: 10).

In the Netherlands, despite a clear left-right divide on question of (in)justice experienced by minority groups as a consequence of segregation within the education system, a considerable degree of dialogical engagement of the

⁷¹ Szilvay, Gergely (2015) “Roma-magyar együttélés: mi számít szegregációnak?” *Mandiner.keresztény* (4/06/2015). Available at: https://keresztény.mandiner.hu/cikk/20150604_roma_magyar_egyutteles_mi_szamit_szegregacionak.

⁷² See the methodological section and footnote 7 for a definition and more elaboration on reasoning and framing devices.

⁷³ Murray, Douglas (2014a). “Save Our Children from the Islamists.” *The Spectator* (14-06-2014). Available at: <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2014/06/save-our-children-from-the-islamists/>.

⁷⁴ Timothy, Nick (2018). “It’s a Fiction to Suggest That There Was No Plot by Islamist Hardliners to Take over State Schools.” *The Daily Telegraph* (9/10/2018). Available at: <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2018/08/09/fiction-suggest-no-plot-islamist-hardliners-take-state-schools/>.

various parties is clearly observable in the strand of the debate related to the freedom of educational choice. A following quote illustrates how, in an attempt to refute criticism against religious schools, a range of arguments raised by the opponents are directly addressed:

Due to problems at 'De Roos' in Zaanstad [a Muslim school] 4.000 specialized schools are now being placed in the dock. Even though those 4.000 schools are pluriform, [provide] good education and contribute to the multicolored society, and [where] the freedom of parents is curtailed. (...) 1 to 3 percent of those 4.000 schools has a strict admission policy, and I defend that freedom [to decide on the composition of the student body] not on the grounds of color, or on the grounds of race, but on the grounds of a [religious, ideological] persuasion, and that is indeed part of the freedom of education.⁷⁵

At the same time, however, the Dutch debate exposes unequal interest of various parties in specific justice-related issues. For example, arguments against the freedom of parental choice in the matters of education that focus explicitly on the problem of economic segregation inherent to the freedom of choice, raised by the critics, remain unanswered by the firm defenders of the freedom of educational choice. Such a selective engagement with the arguments of the opponent can be detected also in the Trojan horse coverage in the UK, where the left-wing media discussion on the redistributive aspects of injustice faced by Muslim schools and communities, and the role of educational attainment in reducing social inequality and lifting a particular vulnerable community out of poverty, does not find a (counter-)reflection in the coverage provided by the right-wing media (see Divald, 2019: 17). Similarly in Hungary, the government-critical voices that expose redistributive injustices suffered by Roma minority as a consequence of 'loving segregation' remain unaddressed by the pro-governmental media (Kende, 2019).

Interesting in this context is a strategy of 'what about-ism' noted in Austrian report. Tiefenbacher and Perschy (2019) observe the limited direct engagement of some, especially minority, media in the mainstream debate on education and their preference for crafting a whole new line of argumentation without a direct rebuttal to the claims of their opponents. While such a strategy seems safe in its avoidance of direct confrontation and/or might prove effective in establishing one's own narrative and agenda in the debate, it has its obvious disadvantages. First, the unaddressed allegations may gain credibility even if they are false; and second, this might create or enhance the impression of various parties talking not 'to' but 'pass' each other, un-listened to and ignored, and eventually lead to a sense of testimonial injustice.

Use of arguments *ad personam*, discussed above, also constitutes a way of avoiding a direct engagement with the arguments of the opponent, whereby the actual dispute is abandoned (or redirected) and the substantive argumentation is (partly) replaced by a description of the characteristics, both actual and alleged, of the discursive, and often also political, opponent.

Use of multimodality

Our investigation encompassed an analysis of media clips some of which used multiple modes, such as text, embedded audio and video material, illustrative photographs, graphics, drawings, as well as online comments

⁷⁵ Gert-Jan Segers (ChristenUnie) interviewed in *Nieuwsuur* (12-09-2016) Available at: "Moeten alle scholen gemengd onderwijs aanbieden?" <https://nos.nl/nieuwsuur/artikel/2131658-moeten-alle-scholen-gemengd-onderwijs-aanbieden.html>.

posted by the audience members. Most multimodal forms completed one another, and either strengthened the message conveyed (e.g. via graphs, photo's, video clips), or – in case of multimodal 'quotations' of content produced by the (ideological, discursive) opponents, for example, in the form of tweets or Facebook posts – constituted an important reference point and/or a starting point of a critical engagement with an opposing argument or a competing discursive frame. Only occasionally, multimodal forms, such as images, were used by some media to convey a message that was not explicitly verbalized in the news item analysed.

In general, in contrast to language that might be occasionally direct or even abusive, images used in the media content seemed mostly neutral, avoiding explicitly racist or otherwise offensive tones. For example, in the coverage of the Trojan horse controversy in British media, the most common type of a photo was of the school buildings; it was shown in all segments of the press regardless of their positioning on the left-right spectrum. Also in the Netherlands and Hungary, photos used to illustrate the verbal content were usually neutral, presenting school buildings or schoolchildren in front of or inside the school. Occasionally, however, images included did convey an ideologically-loaded message. In Austria, for example, images of happy young children wearing a headscarf, playing, accompanied one of the articles framing educational justice in terms of recognition, visibility and acknowledgement of difference that were typical for minority media and left-wing media (Tiefenbacher and Perschy, 2019:29). In the Netherlands, depicting the backs of the students attentively listening to their teacher conveyed a message that ethnicity or colour should not matter in school admission policies (Lepianka et al., 2019). In the UK, images of smiling, well-groomed, brown-skinned, uniform-wearing young people who did not stick out of the ordinary, with some young girls wearing veils and not others, appeared across articles in the mainly centre and left-wing media sources. Also an image of a young Muslim female student, veiled, holding her notebook and looking into the camera, with three white hands on her, pulling her headscarf, jumper and shoulder,⁷⁶ published in *the Guardian*, could be interpreted as ideologically informed. The photo strengthened the message, conveyed in the text of the article, of the Trojan horse allegations victimizing members of Muslim community (Divald, 2019: 11).

In contrast, images coming from more right-wing outlets often showed veiled women with foreign dress taking children to school (the UK) or girls wearing a headscarf during a lesson in German (Austria). While not abusive, such images strengthen the stereotype of Muslim community as 'other', socially distant, culturally and linguistically incompetent, and living in a parallel world. Interestingly, a similar message was conveyed in a series of graphics accompanying an article, rather leftist in tone, that was critical of segregation in Dutch schools.⁷⁷ Ironically, the article critically discussed the implications of segregation and 'middle class flight' for educational advancement of children from working classes. The unfortunate, according to some critical audience members, choice of illustrations undermined the main argument of the article but also stereotypically equated members of the economically weaker milieus (or working classes) with Muslims (Lepianka et al., 2019). However, most ideologically and emotionally loaded were some of the images (and other multimodal output) that accompanied the right-wing reporting analysed in Austria. Some of the texts that problematized 'foreign influences' and proposed the eradication of 'foreign influences' as a solution to grievances within the educational system, even if relatively neutral in the textual communication and focused on the matter-of-fact discussion of problems, were accompanied

⁷⁶ Weale, Sally (2018). "Play Shines Light on Trojan Horse 'Islamist Plot' to Run Schools." *The Guardian* (23/07/2018). Available at: <https://www.theguardian.com/stage/2018/jul/23/play-shines-light-on-trojan-horse-islamist-plot-to-run-schools>.

⁷⁷ Ref to the correspondent article and the Dutch report

by pictures showing children with migrant background that were hitting white children or taking drugs (Thiefenbacher and Perschy, 2019: 21). Otherness, indolence and (potential) threat posed by minority members was also conveyed through some images of Roma published in pro-government media in Hungary (Kende, 2019).

Interesting in the analysed material was a photo that appeared in Austrian community media and which presented a girl with a headscarf who raised her hand. The photo aimed to illustrate an idea, conveyed also in the text of article it accompanied, that foreign students are able to excel in an educational system which values hard work, meritocracy and individual attainment. The photo that conveyed a very positive and counter-stereotypical image of a minority member, was used to back-up an argument that denied minority students any special treatment on the grounds of their alleged vulnerability and need. Worth mentioning as well is the use of a blurred photo of the alleged Trojan horse document in one of the British newspapers at the outset of the controversy. While it was eventually uniformly accepted, also by the right-wing media, that the document was a fraud, the photo had given an element of credibility to the document and the fact that it was blurred only increased the aura of secrecy around the whole affair thus strengthened the claim of it being a 'conspiracy'. Interesting in those two examples is their ambiguity and non-obvious interpretation that could change if the images had been placed in a different textual context. Occasionally, images were used to question the credibility of public figures/social actors playing an important role in the debate. Illustrative here is a photo of the Hungarian Secretary of State, whose children attend an expensive private international school, baking Christmas cookies amongst poor children.

A different partisan logic regulated the publication of images in Turkish media. The leftist, secular *Cumhuriyet* tends to reinforce articles critical of *Imam Hatip* schools with images of veiled women lined up like in an army, with their backs turned to the camera. According to the authors of the Turkish report, the anonymity, lack of individuality and implied compliance suggest oppression and victimization, but also collaboration of the veiled women with the system of oppression. Characteristic for the images published in *Cumhuriyet* is shadowing a part of the image, which dramatized the picture and suggests some secrecy (Ruben and Hışıl, 2019).

Other visual input included graphs (e.g. in Austria, the Netherlands) or short educational video clips (Netherlands) to illustrate the statistical information provided and to strengthen the claim it is supposed to support. Just like statistical data itself, such graphs are usually to be found in texts discussing issues of (unequal) educational attainment.

Users' comments

The content and quality of media users' comments depend on the medium and ideological profile. Comment are not always directly related to the issues discussed in the main entry (an article, opinion piece, blog entry, video clip) and often serve the purpose of expressing general discontent and frustration with various sides of the political conflict. In general, users of high quality media, and especially more elitist leftist media, comment on the content less often, but are more elaborate and more argumentative in their entries. Users of popular, usually right-wing media, and especially blogs, leave comments that are usually short and often emotionally loaded. It is the comments to right-wing popular media in Austria and the Netherlands that contain examples of abusive language and traces of 'biological racism'. Interestingly, in both countries verbal attacks on 'migrants' or 'foreigners' by the audience members demonstrated poor language skills of the 'attackers'. While such grammatical and spelling mistakes could be attributed to the nature of social media – the immediacy and speed of the communication, as

well as the heightened emotions around the presence of minorities on the part of the media users, both of which encourage linguistic carelessness, they appear rather ironic.

In Hungarian media, racist comments related to Roma minority appeared in a variety of media and regardless of their political stance, indicating that while the political conflict between liberal and illiberal elites of this country evokes strong partisan reactions on the part of the general public, the issue of Roma discrimination does not really constitute a bone of contention in the street-level politics – regardless of what kind of reporting (qua content and tone) triggered them, the audience comments reflected negative preconceptions of Roma, often expressed in strong, overtly racist or even vulgar language (Kende, 2019: 22).

Discussion and Conclusions

The primary goal of this study is to uncover how justice, as an abstract and complex concept and phenomenon, is evoked in the (social) news media in the context of educational debates and to map tensions inherent in the various notions of justice and visions of good life and common good. The role of news media in informing and influencing public discourse, including education politics, is hard to overestimate. As noted by Kelly (2011), news media, very much like Hollywood films, “shape habits of thinking by providing audiences with framing mechanisms and affective structures through which individuals fashion their identities and mediate their relationship to public life, social responsibility, and the demands of critical citizenship” (Giroux, 2008: 7 quoted in Kelly, 2011: 188). By creating, selecting, steering and shaping information for public consumption, media generate points of view, promote social agendas, frame problems and contribute to strengthening or undermining support for specific policies, practices and ideologies. Various stakeholders mobilize media for strategic advantage, for example, during a period of important social reforms. Media also constitute an important outlet for popular discontent with existing policies and practices. The questions of what is just, to whom and on what moral grounds are usually crucial in those debates.

The role of education in the realization of (*social*) *justice* is ambiguous. On the one hand, education is considered crucial for the eradication of persistent inequalities and enhancement of social inclusion. On the other, due to its contribution to the (re)production of particular identities and social positioning, it is often seen as an important source of *injustice*. This tension, or contradiction, is hardly surprising considering a general lack of consensus on what kind of *justice ideals* education policies should pursue (redistribution vs recognition), which allocative principles they should follow (need vs desert vs ability) and on what moral grounds, whose well-being they should prioritize (majority vs minority), and who is ultimately responsible for the *just* 'outcomes' of the educational process (authorities vs school vs parents).

Focusing on the media debates on education allows us to tap those aspects of justice and justice-related tensions that have become most salient in various national contexts and most reflective of the current norms and ways (cf. Peeters and d’Haenens, 2005: 202). In this paper, we focus in particular on tensions that arise in debates on justice for minority groups, that is groups that are more likely to be classified as the ‘other.’

As in other ETHOS reports, Nancy Fraser's tripartite framework of justice as recognition, re-distribution and representation constituted the starting point of our investigation. Our analysis shows that the way (social) media frame the various facets of justice in debates around educational issues overlaps with how the various elements of the Fraser's framework are conceptualised in educational research, thus confirming the usefulness of Fraser's analytical lens in disentangling the various forms of injustice that take place in the realm of education. At the same time, it reveals how the various education-related grievances extend way beyond the school setting and question the entirety of social relations, their normative underpinnings and the power structure that legitimizes them.

In the material analysed, recognitive injustices are evoked particularly strongly in discussion about the assimilative agenda of schools that denies the various 'others' to co-author the curriculum and thus to nourish not only their own identity, but also the social respect for 'other-ness' and 'other-thinking' that characterises (or should characterise) a truly inclusive society. Practices of obliterating 'uncomfortable' historical figures, events and processes, discriminating between 'better' and 'lesser' languages and cultural backgrounds, refusal to *sympathize* with the other, where sympathy is understood as "sharing (or having the capacity to share) the feelings of another"⁷⁸ are thus interpreted through the lens of exclusion, but also self-exclusion – shutting oneself off the wider society, which disadvantages not only the individual or group in question, but the whole national community.

As expected, redistributive grievances permeate discussions about access to quality education, school admission policies, education tracking system, and redistribution of public resources among various types of schools. Underpinning all those claims is a firm belief in the role of education in nourishing talent and ambition, on the one hand, and its significance for the alleviation of social inequalities, on the other. The debates revolve around the question of whether or not and 'how' the current educational system, succeeds in fulfilling its fundamental social mission; they expose tensions over the principles that govern the allocation of 'justice', and – indirectly – groups whose well-being is, often implicitly, prioritized.

Strikingly, representation as a dimension of justice is less directly present in the media debates; most often they come to the surface in complains about insufficient inclusion of specific voices (parents, minorities) in the educational matters, issues of curriculum, educational core and admission policies and/or demands for a more diverse teacher's body. Particularly striking here is the absence of attention to the 'voice of the child' – in most of the analysed material children seem a mere object of reporting (and concern!) rather than an active subject and a partner in the debate that directly affects them and, moreover, has a pronounced influence on their future socio-economic status and position within the society.

The relative infrequency with which the issues of representation, children representation in particular, are discussed in the analysed media debates might stem from the sampling procedures applied in the current research. On the other hand, however, such absence, if confirmed in other research, is in itself telling. As noted by Choules: "Discourses about injustice often do not involve an analysis of power relationships. The absence of a power analysis benefits those groups who occupy positions of power" (2007, p. 461). In other words, not talking about power relations invariably contributes to their maintenance. This applies as well to the adult-child and parent-child relation.

⁷⁸ <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/empathy#note-1>

When linked to mis-recognition of specific social groups, on the one hand, and the silences, omissions and half-truths they often complain about, on the other, representational injustice taps on epistemic injustice, understood as unfair treatment in issues of knowledge, understanding and participation in practices of communication and deliberation. Epistemic injustice has been identified in this report as a conception of justice that runs across multiplicity of justice claims voiced in the educational debates, alongside claims that appeal to civil rights and liberties and/or human rights framework, claims to procedural justice, claims understood in the spirit of capabilities and functionings and understandings of justice as freedom from fear and (ontological) insecurity.

One of the goals of the current study was to map the justice-related tensions that are most salient in media discourse. The analysis allowed us to shed additional light on the tensions between various claims to justice, tensions between different understanding of justice claims and tensions between the principles that govern the realisation of justice. For example, it showed that the principles of merit, need or equality that seem to dominate in the distributive paradigm of justice, may be insufficient in explaining what is considered ‘just’ in allocation of ‘education.’ The demands of more or better, or rather different, education and/or special treatment of various groups may stem not from their perceived neediness or merit but rather from their demands for redress (Turkey) and/or recognition of the unique contribution they make to the national community (Portugal).

Particularly relevant in this context is the media representation of tensions between justice claims by different groups, such as between the majority and a minority, secular and religious segments of the society, or groups of different socio-economic status. Media are often claimed to subscribe to tacit cultural assumptions that may lead to the exclusion of the concerns of marginalized groups from the media content (Gerstl-Pepin, 2007: 4). Questions are then raised about the extent to which the oppressed groups are actually represented in and by the media, but also whether or not the position of the marginalised groups is devalued by their biased, usually negative, presentation. In much of the analysed media debates on education, one of the central, albeit often unspoken, questions, revolves around the issue of victimhood. The establishing who is the victim of policy (past or present), institutional failures and in/action of some ‘other’ seems to constitute one of the necessary conditions to re-establish justice.

Given the immense moral power of victimhood and its appeal as a moral ground of justice, this is hardly surprising. Important here, however, is the implied blamelessness of the victim conveyed, for example in the opposition between a sufferer and a threat, uncovered also in our study, and the moral consequences of viewing the issue of victimhood through an ‘either/or’ lens. Diane Enns (2012) draws attention, among other things, to how absolving the victim from co-responsibility for shaping the socio-historical context in which injustice is taking place and/or searching for a better future, may ultimately deprive them of agency as moral actors. In addition, our analyses show how claiming victimhood, for example by a majority, may be paired with denying the victimhood of the other, in this case: minority, and turning them into the agents of majoritarian suffering; i.e. perpetrators of harm. In the Dutch and Austrian discourse, for example, this denial of the status of a victim to Muslim minority groups, takes the form of “blaming the victim” and equipping them with responsibility not only for their own position but also the position of the ‘new’ majoritarian victim. Here “blaming the victim” is combined with “shifting the blame.”

Such shifts in the (media) discourse are hard to ignore, considering especially how media are shaped by the biases and agendas of the people and institutions involved, but also the ideologies, discourses, and narratives embedded

in the broader culture (Fairclough, 1995; van Dijk, 1988). Moreover, since media have become a major site of political and ideological struggle among groups competing to frame reality in a way that emphasizes their definition of the 'problem,' those who have access to institutional power have here a huge advantage. This seems particularly true in countries in which media are deprived of much of their (political) independence, such as Hungary or Turkey, but visible as well in Austria and the Netherlands, the two countries, where right-wing populism is (close to) winning the hearts of the public.

Noteworthy in the context of (partisan) struggle for the recognition of specific claims to justice and/or claims to justice by specific groups, is the unbalanced use of 'hard data' and expert input to report on and/or contextualise minority claims to justice. Arguably, deficit of 'hard data' in the right-wing media has a considerable impact on the shape of public debate and the perceived legitimacy of minority claims to justice. As noted by Redden (2011; cf. Lepianka, 2015), statistical data help to draw public attention to the scale and prevalence of a social problem, such as inequality, which makes it difficult for politicians and other social actors to ignore or understate it.

Sex and gender inequality in media reporting on education-related justice – a note on a conspicuous absence

While gender inequality and discrimination against sexual minorities are recurrent themes in academic and policy debates on justice in Europe, they seem conspicuously absent from the analysed media debates on injustice in the realm of education. Issues of gender inequality come to the centre of analysed media reporting only in case of Turkey, where mixed-sex education and emancipation of women represents a modern and secular lifestyle that is being rejected by the current government that promotes religiously-informed *Imam Hatip* schools. Many of the texts published by the left-wing, government-critical *Cumhuriyet* emphasise the injustice embodied in abolishing mixed-sex education and the threat this abolition poses to the status of women in the society. Attention is also drawn to instances of (sexual) harassment of girls that takes place in *Imam Hatip* schools. In fact, maltreatment of women constitutes a recurring motive of the moral critique against *Imam Hatips* (Ruben and Hışıl, 2019), strengthened by the presence of photo-images of veiled women, which for secular Turks is a crucial manifestation of the oppressive element of Islam.

Similar arguments can be found in Austrian, British and Dutch right-wing media, where issues of sex and gender come to the fore, or are problematized, mostly in the context of reporting on Muslim 'otherness' and their incompatibility with the host societies. In this line of reporting, Muslim minorities are accused of disregarding, or even undermining, the (supposedly) majoritarian values of equality, tolerance and respect for diversity, embodied, among other things, in the emancipation of women and sexual minorities. In the especially right-wing media in the UK, the Netherlands and Austria, attention is drawn to homophobia and/or unfair treatment of girls and women by Muslims, epitomized in 'forced marriages' and strict clothing rules (and 'clothing police' in Austrian schools). In British media coverage of the Trojan horse controversy, 'girls' and 'homosexuals' are among groups classified as victims of Muslim fundamentalism (Divald, 2019: 7, 18). (Right-wing) media criticize, among other things, homophobic comments made by some of the crucial Muslim actors in the affair, their passive attitude to homophobia, discrimination against girls as well as unfair treatment of non-Muslim, supposedly female, teachers. Muslim discrimination of sexual minorities and women is also reported in the context of Islamic extremism and conservative Islamic teachings that permit marital rape and/or indoctrinate young girls to obey the laws of sharia rather than demand respect for their rights as female citizens. Indeed, critics of female maltreatment by Muslims,

seem particularly keen on juxtaposing Muslim religious values to British/Dutch/Austrian values, as exemplified in a quote of a woman describing her experience in a sharia court, quoted in a conservative British daily: “I have been told what my rights are as a Muslim woman. No one ever told me what my rights are as a British woman’.”⁷⁹

In contrast, in the more leftist media, attention is drawn to double standards applied by politicians, officials, right-wing media and general public to evaluate such phenomena as single-sex education and discrimination against women and sexual minorities in Muslim and non-Muslim schools, such as Catholic schools in the UK. In general, however, issues of gender inequality and/or discrimination of sexual minorities by Muslim and non-Muslim schools, seem relatively absent from the left-wing media reporting on the education-related injustice. Paradoxically, both the left-wing silencing and the right-wing flagging of the problem (after all, right-wing media are in general *not* particularly zealous in promoting gender equality and tolerance for sexual minorities) show how issues of gender inequality and discrimination suffered by sexual minorities are instrumentalized in the public debates related to justice in education. In particular, right-wing media and their audiences seem to engage in defending gender rights solely as an argument in their own discriminatory project.

At the same time, it has to be emphasised that conclusions about the apparent marginalisation of gender and sexual equality in media debates on justice in the realm of education drawn on the basis of the current study have to be treated with some caution. Our analyses focused on the position and (in)justice experienced by religious, ethnic and racial minorities. Our results indicate that when justice for minority groups in education is being debated in the media, the issue of gender and sexual equality seems to be evoked only sporadically, usually in an instrumental manner, in order to impute backwardness and intolerance to Muslim community, and thus to attach an air of legitimacy to discriminatory treatment they are subjected to. Our results do not indicate that issues of gender inequalities are completely absent from the education-related debates in the media, but that once the ‘minority lens’ is applied, questions of gender and sexual inequality become less relevant and often instrumentalised. Interesting, from ETHOS point of view is the fact that the issues of (in)justice experienced by minority groups within the education system are de-coupled in the media from questions of intersectionality.

⁷⁹ Murray, Douglas. 2014a. “Save Our Children from the Islamists.” *The Spectator* (14/06/2014). Available at: <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2014/06/save-our-children-from-the-islamists/>.

Bibliography

- Anderson, B., Hartman, C. and Knijn, T. (2017). *Report on the Conceptualisation and Articulation of Justice: Justice in Social Theory*. ETHOS Deliverable 5.1. Available at <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Anderson, G. L. (2007). "Media's Impact on Educational Policies and Practices: Political Spectacle and Social Control" *Peabody Journal of Education* 82(1): 103-120.
- Balibar, E. (1991), "Is there a neo-racism?" In: E. Balibar and I. Wallerstein (eds), *Race, Nation, Class: Ambiguous Identities*. London: Verso, pp. 17-28.
- Baroutsis, A. (2019). "Mapping the field of education research and media." In: A. Baroutsis, S. Riddle and P. Thomson (eds) *Education Research and the Media: Challenges and Possibilities*. Abingdon and New York: Routledge.
- Bergström, G., Ekström, L. and Boréus, K. (2017). "Discourse Analysis." In: Boréus, K. and C. Bergström (eds) *Analyzing Text and Discourse: Eight Approaches for the Social Sciences*. Sage Publications, pp. 208-241.
- Bicas, M., Meneses, M. P. and Brito, L. (2019). *Mapping the Construction of Justice Claims in the Media. National Report D4.4. - Portugal*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 4.4.
- Buğra, A. (2018). *Report on a Theoretical Review of the Conceptualization and Articulation of Justice in Political Theory*. ETHOS Deliverable 4.1. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Buğra, A. and Akkan, B. (2019). *Discourses on minorities (and vulnerable groups) access to education, inclusionary and exclusionary aspects*. ETHOS Deliverable 4.3. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Busemeyer, M. R, Garritzmann, J. L., Neimanns, E., and Nezi, R. (2018). "Investing in education in Europe: evidence from a new survey of public opinion." *Journal of European Social Policy* 28(1): 34–54.
- Choules, K. (2007). "The Shifting Sands of Social Justice Discourse: From Situating the Problem with "Them," to Situating it with "Us"" *The Review of Education, Pedagogy, and Cultural Studies*, 29, 461–481.
- Coady, D. (2017). "Epistemic Injustice as Distributive Injustice." In: I. J. Kidd, J. Medina and G. Pohlhaus, Jr. (eds) *The Routledge Handbook of Epistemic Injustice*. New York: Routledge, pp. 61-68.
- Congdon, M. (2017). "What's Wrong with Epistemic Injustice? Harm, Vice, Objectification, Misrecognition." In: I. J. Kidd, J. Medina and G. Pohlhaus, Jr. (eds) *The Routledge Handbook of Epistemic Injustice*. New York: Routledge, pp. 243–253.
- Cribb, A. and Gewirtz, S. (2003). "Towards a sociology of just practices. An analysis of plural conceptions of justice." In: C. Vincent (ed.) *Social Justice, Education and Identity*. London and New York: Routledge Falmer, pp. 15-29.
- Deutsch, M. (1975). "Equity, Equality, and Need: What Determines Which Value Will Be Used as the Basis of Distributive Justice." *Journal of Social Issues* 31(3): 137- 149.
- Deuze, M. (2008). "The changing context of news work: Liquid journalism and monitorial citizenship." *International Journal of Communication*, 2, 848–865.
- De Vreese, C. (2005). "News framing: Theory and typology." *Information Design Journal* 13(1): 51–62.
- DiStasio, V. and Solga, H. (2017). Education as social policy: An introduction. *Journal of European Social Policy* 27(4): 313–319.
- Divald, S. (2019). *The Trojan Horse Controversy: Mapping the construction of justice in the UK media*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 4.4.
- Enns, D. (2012). *The Violence of Victimhood*. University Park, PA: PenState University Press.

- Entman, R. (1993). "Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm." *Journal of Communication* 43(4): 51–58.
- Fairclough, N. and Wodak, R. (1997). "Critical Discourse Analysis." In: T. van Dijk (ed.) *Discourse as Social Interaction*. London: Sage, pp. 258-84.
- Fairclough, N. (2010). *Critical Discourse Analysis: The critical Study of Language*. Old Tappan: Taylor and Francis.
- Fitzgerald, R. and Housley, W. (2016). "Media, Policy and Interaction: Introduction." In: R. Fitzgerald and W. Housley (eds) *Media, Policy and Interaction*. London: Routledge.
- Francis, B., Mills, M. and Lupton, R. (2017.) "Towards social justice in education: contradictions and dilemmas." *Journal of Education Policy* 32(4): 414-431.
- Fraser, N. (1989) "Talking about Needs: Interpretive Contests as Political Conflicts in Welfare-State Societies." *Ethics* 99(2): 291-313.
- Fricker, M. (2007). *Epistemic Injustice: Power and the Ethics of Knowing*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Fricker, M. (2013). "Epistemic justice as a condition of political freedom?" *Synthese* 190, 1317–1332.
- Fricker, M. (2017). "Evolving Concepts of Epistemic Justice." In: I. J. Kidd, J. Medina and G. Pohlhaus, Jr. (eds) *The Routledge Handbook of Epistemic Injustice*. New York: Routledge, pp. 53–60.
- Fricker, M (2018). "Epistemic Injustice and Recognition Theory: A New Conversation – Afterword." *Feminist Philosophy Quarterly* 4(4), Article 8.
- Garrizmann, J. L., Busemeyer, M. R., and Neimanns, E. (2018). "Public demand for social investment: new supporting coalitions for welfare state reform in Western Europe?" *Journal of European Public Policy* 25(6): 844–861.
- Gerstl-Pepin, C. I. (2007). "Introduction to the Special Issue on the Media, Democracy, and the Politics of Education." *Peabody Journal of Education* 82(1): 1-9.
- Giddens, A. (1991). *Modernity and Self-Identify: Self and Society in Late Modernity*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Giladi, P.(2018). "Epistemic Injustice: A Role for Recognition?" *Philosophy and Social Criticism* 44(2): 141–158.
- Goffman, E. (1974). *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Gosepath, S. (2011). "Equality." In: E.N. Zalta (ed.) *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2011 Edition). Available at: <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2011/entries/equality/> .
- Hawley, K. (2017). "Trust, Distrust, and Epistemic Injustice." In: I. J. Kidd, J. Medina and G. Pohlhaus, Jr. (eds) *The Routledge Handbook of Epistemic Injustice*. New York: Routledge, pp. 69-78.
- Inceoglu, Y., Sozeri, C., and Filibeli, T. E. (2019). *Monitoring Media Pluralism in Europe: Application of the Media Pluralism Monitor 2017 in the European Union, FYROM, Serbia & Turkey Country Report: Turkey*. Florance: Centre for Media Pluralism and Freedom.
- Iyengar, S. (1990). "Framing responsibility for political issues: The case of poverty." *Political Behavior* 12(1): 19–40.
- Keddie, A. (2012). "Schooling and social justice through the lenses of Nancy Fraser." *Critical Studies in Education* 53(3): 263-279.
- Kelly, D. M. (2011). "The public policy pedagogy of corporate and alternative news media." *Studies in Philosophy and Education* 30(2): 185–198.

- Kende, A. (2019). *Mapping the construction of justice claims in media: Hungarian case*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 4.4.
- King, G., Schmeer, B., and White, A. (2017). "How the news media activate public expression and influence national agendas." *Science* 358, 776-780.
- Knijjn, T., Theuns, T. and Zala, M. (2018). *Multidisciplinary Perspective on Justice in Europe*. ETHOS Deliverable 2.3. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Knijjn, T. and Lepianka, D. (2018). *Report containing a conceptual framework for integration of findings*. ETHOS Deliverable 7.1. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Komter, A. (2005). *Social Solidarity and the gift*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Lepianka, D. (2015). "Images of poverty in a selection of the Polish press." *Current Sociology* 63(7): 999–1016.
- Lepianka, D. (2018). *Justice in European Political Discourse – comparative report of six country cases*. ETHOS Deliverable 4.2. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Lomborg, S. (2017). "A state of flux: Histories of social media research." *European Journal of Communication* 32(1): 6–15.
- McCombs M and Reynolds A (2009) How the news shapes our civic agenda. In: Bryant J and Oliver M (eds) *Media Effects: Advances in Theory and Research*. New York: Routledge, pp. 1–16.
- McConkey, J. (2004). "Knowledge and Acknowledgement: 'Epistemic Injustice' as a Problem of Recognition." *Politics* 24(3): 198–205.
- Miller, D. (1992). "Distributive Justice: What the People Think." *Ethics* 102(3): 555-593.
- Miller, D. (1999). *Principles of Justice*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Pantea, M-C. (2015). *Social Inclusion of Young People in Europe: Trends and Policy Measures Summary Report on the 2013/14 Social Inclusion Country Templates*. Partnership between the European Commission and the Council of Europe in the field of youth. Accessed on 24/6/2019 from: http://pjp-eu.coe.int/documents/1017981/1668217/Summary_Report_Social_Inclusion_2015.pdf/7d184d78-539b-4c49-8e40-089349dea2b8.
- Peeters, A. L. and d'Haenens, L. (2005). "Bridging or bonding? Relationship between integration and media use among ethnic minorities in the Netherlands." *Communications* 30(2): 201–31.
- Piotrowski, M. and Ruitenberg, C. (2016). "Liquid subjects: news media and public political pedagogy." *Critical Studies in Education* 57(3): 342-357.
- Power, S. (2012). "From redistribution to recognition to representation: social injustice and the changing politics of education." *Globalisation, Societies and Education* 10(4): 473-492.
- Rippon, S., Theuns, T., de Maagt, S., Zala, M, and van den Brink, B. (2018). *Report on the European Heritage of Philosophical Theorizing about Justice*. ETHOS Deliverable 2.1. Available at <https://www.ethoseurope.eu/publications>.
- Redden, J. (2011). "Poverty in the news: A framing analysis of coverage in Canada and the UK." *Information, Communication and Society* 14(6): 820–849.
- Rossini, D. A. (2019). *Monitoring Media Pluralism in Europe: Application of the Media Pluralism Monitor 2017 in the European Union, FYROM, Serbia & Turkey Country Report: the Netherlands*. Florance: Centre for Media Pluralism and Freedom.

- Ruben, D. and Oğuzhan, H. (2019). *Political Discourses on the Religious Education and Minorization of Secular Groups in Media*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 4.4.
- Salát, O. (2019). *A comparative report on the right to education: An assessment of the legal framework of six countries from the perspective of recognitive and redistributive justice*. ETHOS Deliverable 3.6. Available at: <https://www.ethos-europe.eu/publications>.
- Schwinger, T. (1980). "Just Allocation of Goods: Decisions Among Three Principles." In: G. Mikula (ed.). *Justice and Social Interaction. Experimental and theoretical contributions from psychological research*. Bern [etc.]: Hans Huber Publishers, pp. 95-125.
- Seddon, T. (2003). "Framing justice: challenges for research." *Journal of Education Policy* 18(3): 229-252.
- Sen, A. (1999). *Development as Freedom*. New York: Knopf.
- Tiefenbacher, W. and Perschy, L. (2019). *Mapping the construction of justice claims in traditional media and social media – Case Study Austria*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 4.4.
- Valkenburg, P., Semetko, H. and De Vreese, C. (1999). The effects of news frames on readers' thoughts and recall. *Communication Research* 26(5): 550–569.
- Van Dijk, T. (1988). *News as Discourse*. Hillsdale NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Van Dijk, T. (2003). "Knowledge in parliamentary debates." *Journal of language and politics* 2(1): 93-129.
- Van Dijk, T. (2005). "Contextual knowledge management in discourse production. A CDA perspective." In: R. Wodak and P. Chilton (eds), *A New Agenda in (Critical) Discourse Analysis*. Amsterdam: Benjamins, pp. 71-100.
- Van Gorp, B. (2005). Where is the frame? Victims and intruders in the Belgian press coverage of the asylum issue. *European Journal of Communication* 20(4): 484–507.
- Vincent, C. (2003). "Introduction." In: C. Vincent (ed.) *Social Justice, Education and Identity*. London and New York: Routledge Falmer.
- Walzer, M. (1983). *Spheres of justice. A defence of pluralism and equality*. Basic Books.
- Wodak, R. (2008). Introduction: Discourse Studies-important concepts and terms. In: R. Wodak and M. Krzyzanowski (eds) *Qualitative Discourse Analysis in the Social Sciences*, 1-29.
- Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (2016). "Critical discourse studies: history, agenda, theory and methodology." In: R. Wodak and M. Meyer (eds) *Methods of Critical Discourse Studies*. Sage Publications, pp. 1-22.
- Zaller, J. (2003). "A new standard of news quality: Burglar alarms for the monitorial citizen." *Political Communication* 20(2): 109–130.
- Zemandl, E. (2018). *The Roma experience of political (in)justice: The case of school (de)segregation in Hungary*. Country Report prepared for ETHOS Deliverable 5.2.

Appendices I – Background information on debates selected for the analysis, media landscapes and sampling procedure per country

1. Austria

1.1. Background information on the debates selected for the analysis

The case chosen for this study is the educational reform, which started being discussed and implemented in Austria following the election of the new coalition government (ÖVP-FPÖ) in late 2017. Following the official inauguration of the government, concrete educational plans became the main subject of the public debate, revolving around the issue of how to amend the existing educational system in light of its shortcomings in order to better provide for desired educational outcomes. The proposed reform aimed to introduce strict standardization of rules and procedures that would allow filtering out ‘good’ and ‘bad’ students, where ‘bad’ is defined in terms of deficiencies in physical, cognitive, linguistic and other development. Such filtering is seen by right-wing conservatives as necessary for optimal streaming of students within the educational system; the standardization, that focuses on the achievement, gives the streaming an air of ‘objectivity’ – what is being rewarded through standard regulations and procedures is students’ performance and their educational attainment. According to the opponents of the reform, the proposed solutions (indirectly) discriminate against students from vulnerable groups, ethnic and religion minorities in particular, by disregarding their disadvantageous starting position.

The topic was chosen due to its relevance for justice concerns, timeliness, the prevalence in the traditional, digital and social news, as well due to public involvement in the discussion of every group that one way or another affected is by the (intended) reform, including minority representatives.

The central concern of the media/public discussion on the educational reform is: how and on which terms can a ‘good’ educational system be achieved? Within this overarching question, several strands of discussion could be identified: (1) debates related to language knowledge and practice (by minority groups); (2) debates related to religion (Islam) and its visibility; (3) debates related to educational/school structure and resources; (4) debates related to students’ performance and educational outcomes; (5) debates related to identity and worth attributed to ascribed identities; (6) debates related to the role of socio-economic background as a determinant of access to education; (7) debates related to violence in schools. All those topics can be broadly clustered into two cross-cutting themes: the values and beliefs leading the direction of the system, and the structural measures provided to reach these ideals. The prevalence of these themes and the way in which the discourse around them is waged both give clear insight into different justice frames being used in the media and among its readership. The prevalence of these two themes is reminiscent of findings in D4.3, which saw educational policy being driven by two factors: ideals about education, and political direction given on how to realise these ideals. The discursive frames found in the analysed media sources largely revolve around these two themes and shed light on tensions and conflicts between claims and groups.

1.2. Media landscapes

The case study at hand focuses on both, traditional and digital media in Austria, with additional attention given to social media. This analysis centers on news media formats. The news media landscape of Austria is vast comprising newspapers, radio, television, community platforms, blogs, social media channels, video outlets, etc. They can be split into traditional media formats (print, radio, television), digital media formats (community platforms, blogs, video outlets), and social media formats. The boundaries between these categories are blurred, as most traditional outlets are present in the digital sphere, with additional social media presences to increase audience.

Traditional media

While losing their popularity, the traditional media – the printed press, the radio and the television remain strong players in news reporting, particularly among 80% people aged 55 and older.⁸⁰ Currently 4.81 million people (64.6% of the population) read a newspaper on a daily basis.⁸¹ Three out of ten read the same paper: the *Kronenzeitung* – a Eurosceptic tabloid,⁸² and an undisputed market leader in print media. The remainder of the daily printed news market is shared by the two free-of-charge daily newspapers *Heute* and *Österreich* (with a reach of 12.1% and 6.9% respectively), the *Standard* (7%), *Kurier* (7%), the *Presse* (4.5%) and the regional paper *Kleine Zeitung*, published only in two provinces (accumulating at 10.2%).⁸³ Weekly news and magazines are significantly less popular than daily papers. The most popular news magazine is the regionally/locally specific news magazine *Die Ganze Woche* (10.3%), followed by the TV-programme *TV-Media* (8.4%), the news magazines *News* and *Profil* (4.1% each) and the newspaper *Falter* (2%).⁸⁴

Television has become more popular among Austrians in the past years, peaking at an average of 186 minutes of watching time.⁸⁵ Television broadcasts reach 65.3% of the population (4.9 million users) every day. The most noteworthy player is the state-run Austrian Broadcasting Service (*Österreichischer Rundfunk, ORF*), with a market share at 33.9%.⁸⁶ Similarly, Austrians listen to as much as 179 minutes of radio per day, with the most popular music-radio *Ö3* (run by the Austrian Broadcasting Service, ORF) reaching up to 2.6 million (33%) listeners per day⁸⁷

⁸⁰ <https://de.statista.com/statistik/daten/studie/748147/umfrage/offline-und-online-hauptnachrichtenquellen-in-oesterreich-nach-altersgruppen/>

⁸¹ <https://www.leadersnet.at/news/30770,media-analyse-2017-anteil-der-zeitungsleser-schrumpfte-etwas.html>

⁸² <https://www.intellectbooks.co.uk/File:download,id=724/9781841502434.251.pdf>

⁸³ <https://www.media-analyse.at/table/3067>

⁸⁴ <https://www.media-analyse.at/table/3067>

⁸⁵ <https://der.orf.at/medienforschung/fernsehen/fernsehnutzunginoesterreich/index.html>

⁸⁶ <https://der.orf.at/medienforschung/fernsehen/marktanteil/index.html> While the market share of the ORF does not seem considerable, it is noteworthy that the majority of television channels with significant market share following the ORF are from Germany (RTL, 4,7%; PRO7 and ZDF, 4,1% each; Sat1, 3,9%). The few Austrian (private) channels that exist outside of the ORF-run channels are ServusTV (2,1%) and ATV2 (0,7%).

⁸⁷ <https://oesterreich.orf.at/stories/2891425/>

(footnote continued)

and enjoying a market share of 71%.⁸⁸ The Internet tops these three media forms, being by far the most-used medium on the Austrian market: in total, 6.42 million people use the Internet (86%), 5.3 million of those on a daily basis.⁸⁹ On average, half of them access the ORF website(s).

News sources can broadly be sorted into three ideological categories, taking into account the average socio-economic background, education, and classification according to the Austrian Media Analysis (2018) of the audience:⁹⁰

- the right side of the political spectrum (*Kronenzeitung, Heute, Österreich*)
- the centre
 - centre right (*Kleine Zeitung, Presse; Kurier*)
 - centre: (*ORF, News, Wiener Zeitung*)
 - centre left (*Falter, Profil*)
- the left side of the political spectrum (*der Standard*)

In addition to the mainstream traditional media sources, also alternative media channels exist made for/by specific groups,⁹¹ including ethnic minorities. These so called ethnic media.⁹² is commonly produced and published by members of the group in question (often also from abroad) and in the language of the community towards which it is geared.

Online media forms: digital and social

Austrian media landscape has been changing since 2015⁹³: online media formats have come to dominate the market for news (76% of Austrians), closely followed by TV (71%), print media (63%) and exclusive use of social networks (49%). Indeed, the Internet is considered the subjectively ‘most important’ medium for Austrians (57%), far before the TV (19%).⁹⁴ Across media formats, the majority of Austrians (88%) still prefers written news reporting to audio or visual forms like radio or video,⁹⁵ in particular for national political news (61%).⁹⁶

⁸⁸ <https://oesterreich.orf.at/stories/2891425/>

⁸⁹ <https://www.integral.co.at/downloads/Internet/2018/07/AIM-C - Q2 2018.pdf>

⁹⁰ <https://www.media-analyse.at/table/3067>

⁹¹ Several intersecting terms exist for this, including “minority media”, “immigrant media”, “community media”. The most prominent determining factors are often ethnicity/language and/or community-specific causes. See http://othes.univie.ac.at/14683/1/2011-03-09_0748774.pdf, p.32

⁹² http://othes.univie.ac.at/14683/1/2011-03-09_0748774.pdf

⁹³ <http://www.digitalnewsreport.org/survey/2018/austria-2018/>

⁹⁴ <https://de.statista.com/themen/2110/mediennutzung-in-oesterreich/>

⁹⁵ <https://ec.europa.eu/commfrontoffice/publicopinion/index.cfm/ResultDoc/download/DocumentKy/82786>, p. 12

⁹⁶ <https://ec.europa.eu/commfrontoffice/publicopinion/index.cfm/ResultDoc/download/DocumentKy/82786>, p.40

(footnote continued)

Noteworthy channels for online media include Facebook, Twitter, and blogging. Most traditional news outlets mentioned above are active on social media. In addition, two blogs are on the rise: *Tagespresse*, a satire portal which takes current news and spins them with humour to make a critical point,⁹⁷ and the ninth most read blog in the country; and the far-right blog/newsroom *unzensuriert.at*, which has made dramatic gains in the past few years both as a blog and as a Facebook page. Next to the popular Facebook pages of the *Tagespresse*, *Kronenzeitung* and *Standard*, the profile of the *Zeit im Bild* (the regular news programme run by the ORF), is currently considered one of the fastest-growing pages in Austria.⁹⁸ Twitter is not as commonly used in Austria as Facebook: only few media sources have Twitter profiles including *der Standard*, *Kurier*, the *Presse* and the *Kronenzeitung*.⁹⁹

Alternative digital media channels exist made for/by specific communities or groups,¹⁰⁰ such as the feminist *anschlage* magazine, the LGBTQ *Pride* magazine, the regional street magazines *Augustin* and *Megaphone*, *Kosmo* and *Biber* – two major news portals for/by young Austrians of ex-Yugoslavian descent and for/by young, Muslim Austrians, respectively – and *Yeni Vatan*, a digital Austro-Turkish news platform has been online and popular since 1999. Digital ‘ethnic media’ encompass as well two popular portals *OktoTV* and the Vienna-based *Radio Orange94*, conceptualised as ‘spaces of inclusion’.¹⁰¹ They allow users to acquire regular broadcasting spaces which they can fill with their own content (subject to the rules and regulation of the platform).¹⁰² *OktoTV* is a platform similar to Youtube and can be termed “inclusive online television,” *Orange94* shares the same concept but applied to radio, and has its own frequency in Vienna.¹⁰³

1.3. Sampling procedure

In **step 1** of the sampling, a set of key words was used to screen major news outlets (almost all available digitally) and corresponding social media pages for relevant news items published since 2016. Given the high concentration of Austrian media, and the centralization of ownership across both digital and analogue media,¹⁰⁴ the screening encompassed a broad selection of media, diversified with respect to the socio-economic profile of the target audience, political orientation and media format. The screening showed that educational reform (“*Bildungsreform*”) and related topics (such as the use of German language in class and during school breaks, problematic schools (“*Brennpunktschulen*”), resource allocation, and guiding educational ideals) were discussed in almost every major news outlet; it also showed that the debates intensified during the 2017 electoral campaign and afterwards, when the concrete reform plans were announced by the newly elected government. On the basis

⁹⁷ <https://www.blogheim.at/topblogs>

⁹⁸ <https://www.socialbakers.com/statistics/facebook/pages/total/austria/>

⁹⁹ <https://www.socialbakers.com/statistics/twitter/profiles/austria/media/daily-news/>

¹⁰⁰ Several intersecting terms exist for this, including “minority media”, “immigrant media”, “community media”. The most prominent determining factors are often ethnicity/language and/or community-specific causes. See http://othes.univie.ac.at/14683/1/2011-03-09_0748774.pdf, p.32

¹⁰¹ see Geißler, Rainer/ Pöttker, Horst (2005): Massenmedien und die Integration ethnischer Minderheiten in Deutschland. Problemaufriss. Forschungsstand. Bibliografie, Transcript Verlag, Bielefeld

¹⁰² <https://www.freie-radios.at/download/artikeldok-8.pdf>

¹⁰³ Orange94 is one of many participatory radio stations in Austria. Most participatory radio stations are local/regional and have their own frequencies. Due to the breadth of thematically relevant content and the fact it is the biggest community radio in the German speaking region, Orange94 was selected although it is only available via direct radio frequency in Vienna.

¹⁰⁴ <https://freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-press/2016/austria>, p. 64

of the intensity of reporting, the period between October 2017 and November 2018 was chosen as the optimal timeframe for the sampling of the to-be-analysed material. In **step 2**, a balanced selection of traditional, digital and social media sources was made taking into account the reach (geographical scope/popularity), the audience (majority/minority, young/older), and the political orientation of the news outlet (where possible). Media concentration was a determining factor in the final selection, as several sources were found not to differ from each other significantly in terms of claims or audiences. In **step 3**, the selected media outlets were screened once more to retrieve the-to-be analysed news items. This was done on the main websites of traditional media sources (including the sections on users' comments), digital platforms (including comments) and social media pages (including comments and reactions) of the selected sources. Relevance of items eventually selected for the analysis, was determined by presence of a clear, relevant claim (or lack thereof) either in the news piece or in the comments, or both. In **step 4**, the selected media items and clips were screened one more time and categorized according to their formats (written, audio, video) and/or type of posts (news piece, blogpost, radio show, talkshow, opinion piece, etc.). Balance was sought with respect to different sources, formats and post types. Still, majority of the media clips selected for the analysis are written pieces, sometimes accompanied by a multimodal content (a photo, or a short video). This has to do with our focus on the content as the factor determining the final selection. Due to the careful selection of sources prior to this step, the number of news items with audience comments was limited, particularly in minority and ethnic outlets.¹⁰⁵ Out of the top comments (automatically sorted on each platform), up to 10 comments per post/news item were selected for the analysis; we focused on comments with clear thematic relevance and articulation of claim. This yielded a total of 187 comments for analysis.

The multi-step sampling process yielded a selection of 52 relevant media clips published in 21 media sources/outlets; 24 of the media clips selected contained audience comments, 187 of which were eventually included in the analysis.

1.4. List analysed media clips

These tables reflect the media entries analyzed for D4.4. Please note that this table does not include sources or entries that were eliminated in the multi-step sampling process.

¹⁰⁵The sources and media entries can best be sampled according to a distinction of majority and minority media. This can be made based on characteristics of "ethnic media" borrowed from Matsaganis, Katz and Ball-Rokeach (2011). Already in Step 2 it became clear this is a noteworthy distinguishing line between majority and minority media sources.

Majority media sources

Type	Media name	Market share ¹⁰⁶	Audience	Political orientation	Comments	Multimodality	Media Entry
Daily newspaper	<i>Kronenzeitung</i>	28% of total print readership	Majoritarian	Right	Yes	Video + Pictures	https://www.krone.at/1769553
					Yes	Pictures	https://www.krone.at/1790191
					Yes	Pictures + Statistic	https://www.krone.at/1770642
Daily free paper	<i>Heute</i>	12.1% of total readership	Majoritarian	Right	Yes	Picture	https://www.heute.at/oesterreich/wien/story/Ramadan-Kalender-an740-Schulen-im-Angebot-47842059
					Yes	Picture	https://www.heute.at/oesterreich/oberoesterreich/story/Pro-Tag-eine-Gewalttat-an-Schulen-in-Oberoesterreich-51691013
					Yes	Picture	https://www.heute.at/oesterreich/wien/story/Fluechtlinge-duerfen-jetzt-in-Wien-als-Lehrer-arbeiten-48190342
Daily newspaper	<i>Die Presse</i>	4,5% of total readership	Majoritarian	Centre-right	Yes	Picture	https://diepresse.com/home/bildung/schule/5448244/Brennpunktschulen_Wir-ziehen-eine-Generation-von-Analphabeten-heran?from=suche.intern.portal
					Yes	Picture	https://diepresse.com/home/bildung/schule/5506001/Reform_Neue-alte-Strenge-in-den-Schulen?from=suche.intern.portal

¹⁰⁶ <https://www.media-analyse.at/table/3067>

					Yes	Hyperlink to other medium	https://diepresse.com/home/bildung/schule/5511231/Deutsch-lernen-im-Biologiekammerl-Integrativ-kaum-zu-bewerkstelligen?from=suche.intern.portal
					Yes	-	https://diepresse.com/home/meinung/gastkommentar/5446504/Gastkommentar-Partizipation-Selbstbestimmung-Inklusion
Daily newspaper	<i>Der Standard</i>	7% of total readership	Majoritarian	Left	Yes	-	https://derstandard.at/2000087381160/Woranes-in-der-Schule-krankt
					Yes	Picture	https://derstandard.at/2000084490603/Deutschfoerderklassen-eher-segregierend
					Yes	Picture	https://derstandard.at/2000072251663/Inklusion-aber-richtig-damit-die-Sonderschule-keine-Einbahnstrasse-wird
Daily newspaper	<i>Kurier</i>	7,4% of total readership	Majoritarian	Centre-right	Yes	Picture	https://kurier.at/politik/ausland/pisa-test-erfinder-andreas-schleicher-fachwissen-koennen-sie-bei-google-abfragen/400135577
					Yes	Video, Statistic	https://kurier.at/politik/inland/schule-in-notwo-deutsch-eine-fremdsprache-ist/400134818
Weekly magazine	<i>NEWS</i>	4,1% of total readership	Majoritarian	Centre	-	Picture	https://www.news.at/a/schulstart-aus-und-vorbei-10316765
					-	Picture	https://www.news.at/a/leitartikel-schule-schritte-9858889
Weekly magazine	<i>Profil</i>	4,1% of total readership	Majoritarian	Centre-left	Yes	Picture	https://www.profil.at/meinung/rosemarie-schwaiger-zweiklassengesellschaft-10124049
					Yes	Picture	https://www.profil.at/oesterreich/offener-brief-maturantinnen-bildungsreform-schule-10170606

					Yes	Picture, emojis	https://www.facebook.com/100626156097/posts/10155929451341098/
Daily news digital/TV/radio	ORF – Austrian Broadcasting Service	Market leader in television (33,9%), radio (71%), digital news	Majoritarian and ethnic minorities	Centre	-	-	https://orf.at/v2/stories/2383035/2383036/
					Yes	Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YKiQfLY-7DQ
					Yes	Picture	https://www.facebook.com/182146851877/posts/10156673175956878/

Alternative/community/minority media sources

Please note that several alternative/community sources had to be eliminated due to no relevant thematic coverage. This may be indicative of the fact that many community-specific media sources only report on issues relevant to their community (eg. LGBTQ+, Jewish, etc). It should also be mention that the political orientation of these media sources is not obvious but subject to interpretation considering audience and profile.

Type	Media name	Profile and market share (if available)	Audience	Comments	Multimodality	Media entry
Digital platform	<i>Orange 94.0</i>	Participatory radio. Biggest community radio in the German-speaking region	Multi-ethnic, multi-cultural, queer	-	Radio	https://cba.fro.at/358308
				-	Radio	https://cba.fro.at/385765
Digital platform	<i>OKTO.TV</i>	Participatory video platform. 30.000 people watch daily.	Multi-ethnic, multi-cultural, queer	-	Video	https://okto.tv/de/oktothek/episode/19767
				-	Video	https://okto.tv/de/oktothek/episode/21420
				-	Video, reference to other medium	https://okto.tv/de/oktothek/episode/18764
Digital/analogue magazine	<i>Biber</i>	Transcultural magazine for “new Austrians”. 179.000 readers per issue, 10x annually.	Multi-ethnic, multi-cultural, young migrant population	-	Pictures	https://www.dasbiber.at/content/mischt-euch-da-nicht-ein-0

				-	Picture	https://www.dasbiber.at/content/wir-fuehlen-uns-im-stich-gelassen
				-	Picture	https://www.dasbiber.at/blog/deutsch-als-fremdsprache-muss-das-etwas-negatives-sein
				Yes	Pictures, emojis	https://www.facebook.com/20236828906/posts/10155679574493907/
Digital/analogue magazine	<i>AUGUSTIN</i>	Street newspaper Sells around 27.000 per issue every 2 weeks.	Low socio-economic status, migrant population	-	Picture	https://augustin.or.at/zeitung/tun-und-lassen/die-aufholstrecke-wird-immer-laenger.html
Digital magazine	<i>Kosmo Magazin</i>	Most sold monthly magazine for B/C/S/M migrants Monthly circulation: 120.000 copies	Ethnic minorities in Austria (ex-Yugoslav)	-	Pictures	https://www.kosmo.at/mobbing-habt-ihr-angst-in-die-schule-zu-gehen/
				-	Picture, emojis	https://www.facebook.com/191576624211837/posts/1693549137347904/
				Yes	Picture	https://www.kosmo.at/bildungsniveau-von-migranten-im-staendigen-aufwaertstrend/
Newspaper	<i>Yeni Vatan Gazetesi (Neue Heimat Zeitung)</i>	Turkish/German community newspaper	Ethnic minority population (Turkish minority)	-	Picture, graph, statistic	https://www.yenivatan.at/auslaender-bildungsniveau-steigt/

Analogue/Digital magazine	<i>anschlaege.at</i>	Most popular feminist magazine	Self-identified feminists (assumingly many women)	-	Picture	https://www.anschlaege.at/feminismus/2018/05/an-sage-its-racism-stupid/
				-	Picture	https://www.anschlaege.at/feminismus/2018/10/glueckliche-kruempel/
Digital	<i>Romano Centro</i>	print magazine by Roma organisation	Roma	-	Picture	https://docs.google.com/document/d/1RINRg0DnP7wNiZoh51HLFM1jWKNF56PrGF1MwAs8EEM/edit
Digital blog	<i>kontrast.at</i>	social democratic/critical blog and magazine	Social-democratic, left-leaning, young people	-	Graph	https://kontrast.at/73-prozent-wollen-mehr-finanzielle-unterstuetzung-fuer-arme-schueler/
				-	Picture	https://kontrast.at/die-verlorenen-einsteins-wenn-herkunft-und-nicht-talent-ueberforscher-karrieren-entscheiden
Digital blog	<i>unzensuriert</i>	Far right blog, rapidly growing anti-establishment news source	Far-right populist and extremist (!) Austrians	-	Picture + Video	https://unzensuriert.de/content/0025337-Nur-zwei-Oesterreicher-einer-Klasse-Mein-Sohn-ist-Aussenseiter-weil-er-Deutsch
				-	Picture	https://unzensuriert.de/content/0025783-Neue-Regierung-auf-Leistungskurs-im-Bildungswesen
				Yes	Picture, emojis	https://www.facebook.com/61474458710/posts/10155678952028711/
Digital	<i>Tagespresse</i>	Left satirical/critical blog/magazine. #9 social media leader in Austria	left-leaning population of Austria (including members of groups)	-	Picture	https://dietagespresse.com/islamisierung-oder-skandalisierung-ein-tag-in-einer-wiener-problemschule/

				-	Interactive quiz	https://dietagespresse.com/test-schaffen-sie-die-aufgaben-der-deutschfoerderklasse/
				-	Picture	https://dietagespresse.com/sofortmassnahmen-so-produzieren-schulen-nicht-mehr-am-markt-vorbei/
Digital magazine	<i>Bizeps</i>	NGO magazine	Persons with disabilities	-	Hyperlink to other medium	https://www.bizeps.or.at/voller-einsatz-fuer-die-sonderschule/
				-	-	https://www.bizeps.or.at/die-angst-vor-dem-zurueckbleiben/
Digital magazine	<i>Kismet</i>	Long-standing magazine for (non)Muslims	Muslim and non-Muslim population in Austria	-	Picture, hyperlink to other medium	https://www.kismetonline.at/ministerium-freiwilliges-kopftuchtragen-ist-rebellischer-akt/
				Yes	Picture, emojis	https://www.facebook.com/310315949836/posts/10156012675229837/

2. Hungary

2.1. Background information on the debates selected for the analysis

In comparison with those of other OECD countries, Hungarian education system is characterized by high selectivity within the schools. Differences among schools are mainly based on class, having strong intersectionality with ethnicity. The main victims of selectivity are Roma children, two thirds of whom attend schools with a Roma majority (Kende 2018). With this in mind, the current analysis of media debates on education focused on two strongly interrelated topics: the increasing selectivity within the school system by choosing church schools and private schools to escape from the state schools by the upper- and upper-middle-class (topic 1), and on the other hand, on the ethnic segregation intertwined with socio-economic segregation (topic 2) in the context of free school choice system and in the context of the increased number of religious schools which are one of the main sites of educational selection and the exclusion of Roma students. Central to these debates is the question if and how educational selection and segregation should be countered by governmental policies by regulating the freedom of choice in education and by providing a fairer state financing between the different types of schools. It is worth noting that most parents do not send their children to church schools because they want their children to have a religious education. These schools receive more money from the state per student than do public schools (3,4 times more). They also do not have to use the textbooks published by a government publishing house, which, according to the majority of teachers, are inferior to the earlier ones. Unlike public schools, church schools do not have to accommodate all students within their school districts, but they can select among the children. Thus, the larger the number of religious schools is going to be, the greater the already huge gap between elite schools and “run-of-the mill,” or worse schools, is going to be.

The other topic, the school segregation and integration¹⁰⁷ in education is one of the hottest issues among education topics in the Hungarian media. The reason for this is that the Hungarian school system is extremely selective, therefore the educational segregation of Roma children is given outstanding attention. The analysis will cover the

¹⁰⁷ Although in the Hungarian context we use the term of integration for any kind of school integration (the integration of disabled or socially disadvantaged or/and Roma children), I am well aware of theoretical distinctions between the term of integration and the term of inclusion. Integration is a process of placing children with disabilities or with social disadvantages in existing mainstream educational institutions, as long as the former can adjust to the standardized requirements of such institutions. Inclusion involves a process of systemic reform embodying changes and modifications in content, teaching methods, approaches, structures and strategies in education to overcome barriers with a vision serving to provide all students of the relevant age range with an equitable and participatory learning experience and environment that best corresponds to their requirements and preferences.

(footnote continued)

period from 2013 to 2018 because of the important events relating to segregation discourse in media that received intensive media coverage. One is the Nyíregyháza re-segregation case¹⁰⁸ which symbolizes the Government's educational policy which is more permissive with segregation. The second one is the Hungarian government's reaction to the European Commission launching an infringement procedure¹⁰⁹ because of the school segregation in Hungary (Rorke 2016). This procedure was launched in April 2016.

The debate about selection (topic 1) and segregation (topic 2) in education receives media attention in both traditional and social media. In general, three interconnected strands of discussion can be distinguished: (1) debates on selection related to socio-economic status; (2) debates about segregation related to ethnicity; (3) debates about selection and segregation related to the increased number of religious schools and private schools (and parental choice for).

2.2. Media landscape in Hungary

Like in many third-wave democracies, television is the leading medium in terms of audience, with the dominance of commercial outlets, while the Internet is currently the number one medium on the advertising market. 70% of people still get the news from the TV. Internet penetration nears the European Union average. The circulation figures of nationwide quality dailies have been in decline for many years now, while most tabloid newspapers have preserved their readership figures, even though a free-distribution middlebrow newspaper is highly popular in urban areas. Like most other countries in Central and Eastern Europe, since the political transformation in 1989-1990, Hungary has evinced a weak newspaper market, a high level of political parallelism, a low level of journalistic professionalisation, and a high level of state and/or government intervention. The Hungarian media landscape has, however, undergone major changes in recent years. While the one-party model of the press was transformed into a multi-party model during and after the demise of the state socialist regime in 1989-1990, a near one-party model has emerged again after the electoral victory of the Fidesz/Christian Democrats party alliance in 2010. Conservative and nationalist voices have earned a near-hegemony in the print press and the broadcast media, whereas critical views have been largely marginalised.¹¹⁰

With the majority of mainstream broadcast and print media outlets influenced by government agendas, digital media have become important as a space where freedom of expression is practised, and critical information can be found. On the other hand, reliance on digital news, especially accessed through social media, intensifies the already high level of polarisation. In polarised environments such as Hungary, the trust in overall news (29%) is low (35th out of 37 countries). In public discourse, politicians and public figures frequently accuse media outlets of spreading 'fake news' and having a political agenda, which arguably adds to the sense of general lack of trust. Hungary also suffers from low trust in institutions in general while there tends to be a strong reliance on personal, informal

¹⁰⁸ See the case: <http://www.cfcf.hu/en/ny%C3%ADregyh%C3%A1za-resegregation-case>

¹⁰⁹ The European Commission called for an end to school segregation and noted that Hungary counts 45% of Romani children being placed in segregated schools or classes, one of the highest percentages among EU member states (Rorke 2016).

¹¹⁰ Conclusions of the Joint International Press Freedom Mission to Hungary (2019) European Federation of Journalists. <https://ipi.media/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/Hungary-Conclusions-International-Mission-Final.pdf>

networks. This helps to explain the high usage of social media in Hungary, though it is worth noting, if slightly surprising, that only 27% trust the news accessed this way. In government-dominated small media markets such as Hungary, funding independent journalism becomes a crucial and difficult issue. Some of the most significant investigative journalism is produced by small NGOs, journalism centres, and digital-only outlets (Atlatzso, Direkt36).

Traditional media

Following the closures of influential dailies *Népszabadság* (left) and *Magyar Nemzet* (right-wing, conservative; pro-government until 2016, against government until 2018), Hungary has just one remaining independent political daily, *Népszava* (centre-left, quality newspaper), with a circulation of only 20,000. By contrast, the government-controlled network of regional daily newspapers alone has a combined circulation of over 200,000. No data are available on the circulation figures of the pro-government *Magyar Hírlap* (right-wing, conservative, quality) and *Magyar Idők* (right-wing; targeted at low educated audience), and the pro-government business daily *Világgazdaság*, as these have no active registration with MATE SZ (Hungarian Distribution Monitoring Association). The two tabloids, *Blikk* (left-wing, targeted at low educated audience) and *Bors* are the best-selling dailies in Hungary with an average circulation of 116,423 and 64,774 copies. Most daily and weekly print publications have online versions, usually accessible free of charge and funded through advertising, albeit these usually offer more restricted content than the printed original.¹¹¹

Among broadcast media, overtly pro-government outlets currently include: fourteen ‘public service’ broadcasters, a nationwide commercial television channel (*TV2*), a cable news channel (*Echo TV*), several local and networked radio stations (*Karc FM*, *Radio 1*). The only nationwide outlet covering government policies in a highly critical way is the private commercial television channel *RTL Klub* (weekly reach at the level of 60%). There is a single independent talk radio station, *Klubrádió*, whose reach is restricted to Budapest.¹¹²

Social Networks

Hungarian Internet users spend an average of 209 minutes online daily. The top three activities online include the use of social media, email services and news sites. In terms of online news, independent *Index.hu* (40%) remains ahead of *Origo.hu* (38%, pro-government), followed by *24.hu* (34%; left-wing and liberal). Both *Hirado.hu* (right-wing; the online portal of the public service broadcaster) and *ATV.hu* (left) have experienced a significant drop in percentage of Hungarians using the sites for news. Some of the biggest and most popular blogs edited by an editorial staff include *Mérce* (left side) (on politics, with 106,716 Facebook likes). Facebook is the most widely used social media platform for public figures to express their opinions. YouTube is the second most popular social

¹¹¹ Bajomi-Lazar, P., Filep C. (2018) Hungary - Media Landscape. European Journalism Centre (EJC) 2018 - MediaLandscapes.org. <https://medialandscapes.org/country/pdf/hungary>

¹¹² Bajomi-Lazar, P., Filep C. (2018) Hungary - Media Landscape. European Journalism Centre (EJC) 2018 - MediaLandscapes.org. <https://medialandscapes.org/country/pdf/hungary>

network, with video bloggers, Twitter is only the 7th most used social network in Hungary with 631,000 registered users.

2.3. Sampling procedure

The selection of items relevant for the analysis started with establishing the sampling time frame (**step 1**). This was determined by the timing of the nationalization of schools that started in 2013 and some important events that influenced the debates about educational segregation in the media. One is the Nyíregyháza re-segregation case that symbolizes the Government's current educational policy that believes in integration in a segregated setting, as confirmed by former Minister Zoltan Balog in his testimony. The case attracted intense media attention. The second one is the Hungarian government's reaction to the European Commission launching an infringement procedure because of the school segregation in Hungary. This procedure was launched in April 2016. The sampling frame thus ranges from 2013 to 2018. In **step 2**, a balanced selection of to be screen media was made, based on their ideological/political stance, reach and characteristics of the audience. Since currently neither minority owned media nor media representing Roma perspective have relevance in Hungary, no such medium was included in the sampling procedure. The following outlets were eventually selected for screening:

- (1) **Government critical media (left-wing):** *Blikk (newspaper), Magyar Narancs (weekly magazine), MÉRCE (news website), 24.hu (news website), RTL Klub Híradó (TV), Hír TV (TV), 444.hu (news website), Abcúg (news website).*
- (2) **Pro-government media (right side):** *Magyar Idők (newspaper), Mandiner (news website), Magyar Nemzet (newspaper), Magyar Hírlap (newspaper), Echo TV (TV), Heti Válasz (weekly magazine)*

In **step 3**, the selected media were screened for the relevant content. The screening took place on the official websites of the selected media and their public Facebook pages. The following key-terms were used in the process of screening:

	Terms in relation to the phenomenon of "the middle-class flight" from the state schools	Terms in relation to the segregation of Roma children
government-critical media	public school system, religious school, attractiveness of private schools, selectivity, escape from the state schools	segregation, integration, Roma students, disadvantaged students, selectivity
pro-government media	public school system, religious school, attractiveness of private schools, selectivity, escape from the state schools	segregation, integration, Roma students, disadvantaged students, selectivity

Eventually, 34 media clips discussing issues of ethnic, religious and socio-economic segregation in education, predominantly commentaries, opinion pieces and interviews, published between 2013 and 2018 have been

selected for the primary analysis. Only items in which segregation in education constituted the main issue of reporting were chosen. Because media attention to the issues of (minority) education and the questions of justice they raise is not evenly distributed between pro-governmental and government-critical media (the topics selected are believed to be 'leftist'), maintaining a balanced proportion between the clips published by the two political camps was impossible. In consequence, 21 of the analysed items were published in left-wing media and only 13 in the right-, pro-governmental media. A part of the selected items included photos, and some news items from television programs were also included in the sample.

In addition, on-line comments to 18 news items were included in the analysis. In cases a news clip attracted considerable attention and generating a huge number of comments, the first 30-40 comments were included in the analysis; in case of less heated debates, all audience comments were analysed.

2.4. List analysed media clips

Government-critical media (left side)

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multi-modality	Source
Blikk	Popular newspaper, large reach, lower-educated/SES	21/12/17	<i>Mi történt? Bezárat a bíróság egy kaposvári iskolát</i>		Photo	link
		18/10/16	<i>Botrány: elkülönítették a romákat, bezáratották a kaposvári iskolát</i>	X	Photo	Link comments
Magyar Narancs	Opinion magazine, medium reach, higher-educated/SES	11/12/14	<i>Egy pillanatig se moralizálnak</i>			Link
		03/11/16	<i>Kelletlenül - A kormány és az unió vitája a szegregált oktatás miatt</i>	X	Photo	Link
		07/05/18	<i>A kormány az út szélén hagyja a hátrányos helyzetű gyerekeket, és még a kitörési lehetőségeket is elzárja előlük</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
		12/07/17	<i>Miközben az államiakat kivézteti, az egyházi iskolákat teletömi pénzzel a kormány</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
		06/09/18	<i>Dr. Szabó választása</i>			Link
		30/08/18	<i>Az egyházi iskolák térnyerése - Holtig tanít</i>			Link
Mérce	News/opinion, Left, social democratic, higher-educated	21/01/2016	<i>Kósa szerint jól halad az oktatás reformja, de a valóságban generációk életét teszi tönkre</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
		11/04/2018	<i>Bíróság mondta ki végre: a szegregáció rossz</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
		04/09/18	<i>Ha olyan jó a közoktatás, miért járhatja méregdrága iskolába a gyereket az EMMI államtitkára?</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
24.hu	leading news websites, left and liberal	23/04/13	<i>Ragaszkodnak a romák az iskolájukhoz</i>		Photo	Link
		24/04/13	<i>Szegregált felzárkóztatás Nyíregyházán</i>	X	Photo	Link
		10/07/2014	<i>Roma gyerekeknek nem jár szabad iskolaválasztás</i>		Video	Link Comments
		31/08/15	<i>Riasztja a szülőket az állami iskola</i>		Photo	link

		05/09/18	<i>Rogántól Szijjártóig: magánügy, milyen iskolába járnak a gyerekeik</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
RTL Klub Híradó	TV news program, channel with largest reach, lower-educated/SES	26/05/16	<i>Szegregáció miatt indult eljárás</i>		Video	Link
		07/12/17	<i>Háromszor több pénzt kapnak az egyházi iskolák</i>		Video	Link
Hír TV	TV news program, channel with medium reach	10/04/2018	<i>RIASZTÁS - Szegregáció</i>	X	Video	Link
444.hu	News portal, liberal, higher-educated/SES	21/05/18	<i>Az állam és az egyház elérte, hogy a gyerekek már nem is köszönnek egymásnak az utcán</i>	X		Link Comments
Abcúg	hard news and fact-based reporting about Hungary, low reach, higher-educated/SES, high reach portals take over its articles (e.g. Index.hu and 444.hu)	30/03/15	<i>Menekülnek a szülők az állami oktatásból</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments

Pro-government media (right side)

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multi-modality	Source
Magyar Idők	Daily newspaper, pro-government, low reach, lower-educated/SES	27/05/15	<i>Kitörés a gettóból</i>	X	Photo	link Comments
		07/07/16	<i>Új romapolitikára lenne szükség</i>		Photo	Link
		09/10/16	<i>Kecskekő - Gyöngyöspata – Az igazi problémát a politika szülte</i>		Photo	Link
		30/08/16	<i>Szilárd erkölcsi alapok kellene az oktatásban</i>		Photo	Link
Mandiner	Opinion magazine, conservative news site, medium reach, higher-educated/SES	13/04/16	<i>Szegregáció: társadalmi egyenlőtlenségek voltak és lesznek</i>	X		Link Comments
		11/12/14	<i>Hamis a vita a szegregációról</i>	X		Link
		04/06/14	<i>Roma-magyar együttélés: mi számít szegregációnak?</i>			Link
		26/05/16	<i>Lázár: Honnan tudja a Bizottság, hogy ki a cigány?</i>	X	Photo	Link
Magyar Nemzet	Daily News/Right and conservative, 1938-2018 (before 2015, it was pro-government newspaper, after 2015, government-critical newspaper)	24/04/2015	<i>Agyi szegregáció</i>			Link
Magyar Hírlap	Daily News/Right and conservative	24/04/13	<i>Szegregáció</i>	X		Link
Echo TV	TV news program, channel with largest reach, lower-educated/SES	18/12/16	<i>Támogatás az egyházi oktatási intézményeknek</i>		Video	Link
		07/12/17	<i>Háromszor több pénzt kapnak az egyházi iskolák</i>		Video	Link

<i>Heti Válasz</i>	conservative weekly magazine, medium reach, higher-educated/SES	23/04/15	<i>Szeretetteljes felzárkóztatás – A Kúria döntött, a baloldal elszörnyedt</i>	X	Photo	Link Comments
--------------------	---	----------	--	---	-------	--

3. Netherlands

3.1. Background information on the debates selected for the analysis: segregation in education

Segregation in education is a recurrent theme of public debates in the Netherlands, many of which take place in and through the media. First media reference to the issue of ethnic segregation in education was made in the early 1970's, when *Het Parool* published an article on ethnic segregation in schools in Bijlmer – an Amsterdam neighbourhood with a high concentration of inhabitants with Surinamese background. Still, it was not until the second part of the 1980's that the topic of ethnic segregation in education gained more widespread and long-term attention.

Recently, debates on educational segregation have been rekindled by the 2016/2017 general election campaign, when public attention was (again) drawn to socio-economic background and ethnicity as primary factors that determine educational success of pupils and the path they take in life (vs individual talent and/or effort as envisaged in the national creed). During the electoral debates attention was drawn, among other things, to the (financial) barriers less affluent parents face in access to extracurricular activities for their children (including extra tutoring), ethnic segregation in urban areas and the role of state-funded religious schools. The debate was further simulated by a series of reports by Education Inspectorate (e.g. 2017, 2018) that revealed major disparities in the quality of schools in secondary education, growing homogenisation of primary schools with respect to students' socio-economic and ethnic background, and the ambiguous role of (state-founded) religious, especially Islamic schools, in sustaining the (still) substantial level of ethnic segregation in education.

Our current analysis of the discursive construction of justice in media debates on educational segregation aimed to highlight the most salient aspects of the issue of segregation that appeal to broad media audiences, or are believed to do so by media makers, as well as to explore the popular/societal response to themes discussed in the media. The analysis focused on three interrelated strands of the educational debate: ethnic segregation, socio-economic segregation, and religious segregation – partly due to their popularity in the (social) media debates and partly because of their relevance for the analysis of the discursive construction of justice for ethnic minority groups. Central to all three debates is the question if and how educational segregation should be countered by governmental policies: by removing or by regulating the freedom of choice in education? Some consider regulating school choice as intruding upon the constitutionally established freedom of education and/or point to the harmful consequences enforced diversity may have for the flourishing of individual pupils. Others, however, argue that ethnic, socio-economic and religious diversity in educational institutions reproduces and reinforces inequality and intergroup tensions, which negatively affects not only the (minority) pupils in question but also the whole society.

3.2. Dutch media landscape

The Dutch study comprises an analysis of a selection of items that appeared in broadly understood 'news media', including both traditional (print, broadcast) and 'new' (digital) media that produce and distribute news via internet (e.g. via news platforms/news blogs/on-line newspapers and/or social media sites of traditional media outlets, such

as Facebook or Twitter). Our analytical focus on news media was determined by their popularity among the Dutch public: every week 95% of the Dutch population is reached by traditional and new news media. Moreover, out of 8.5 hours spent daily on media consumption, the Dutch use more than half to follow news and news- or current affairs-related debates (SCP, 2016).

Among traditional media, television has the largest daily reach (39% of the population), followed by print media (newspapers and magazines) (27% of the population) (SCP, 2017). Among social media (total daily reach – 58% of the population), most popular are news-sites and news-apps (52%), followed by on-line editions of traditional newspapers (6%). Whereas lower-educated groups use television as a primary information source, higher-educated media consumers often read newspapers and visit news sites and apps. Furthermore, visiting news sites and apps is popular among younger people (20-34), whereas traditional newspapers are most popular among older generations (50+). The on-line editions of the traditional publishers/broadcasters constitute an interesting crossing of traditional and social media. They reach ca. 6% of the Dutch population, and are particularly popular among ethnic minorities (more than Dutch natives) and among people between 35 and 49 years of age (Motiveaction, 2014).

Traditional media

Television is the most popular medium in the Netherlands, among both Dutch natives (89%) and ethnic minorities (94%) (Motivation, 2014). The channels with the largest reach among ethnic minorities are the commercial channels *RTL4* (73%) and *SBS6* (72%). Among native Dutch *RTL4* (71%) and the public broadcasting station *Ned1* (70%) have the largest reach. The television programs that are particularly popular among the left-wing voters are the talk shows *De Wereld Draait Door* and *Pauw* on *Ned1*. The news programs *NOS* and *Nieuwsuur* on *Ned1* appeal to both voters on the left and the right. *RTL Nieuws* (aired on *RTL4*) is watched predominantly by people with right-wing political preferences.

Between 2000 and 2015, the paper circulation of national newspapers in the Netherlands has decreased by 42%. At the moment, the press market is confined to 809 million published issues, with an average reach of 44% of the Dutch population (NOM, 2018) (but only 1 á 2% among the four largest non-Western ethnic minority groups). The newspapers with the largest circulation and reach are: *Telegraaf* and *Algemeen Dagblad* (read by right-wing voters, older people and people the lowest socio-economic status; in addition, *Telegraaf* is appreciated by minority readers); *Volkscrant* (mostly read by voters on the left, and those with a higher SES); and *Metro* (a non-paid newspaper with equal popularity among both right and left voters). The fifth, sixth, and seventh newspapers with the largest market share and average daily reach are *NRC*, *Trouw*, and *Het Parool*. All three newspapers appeal to the higher-educated, voters from the left, and those with a medium to high SES. Lastly, *Reformatorisch Dagblad* is a daily newspaper which explicitly profiles itself as orthodox-Christian; it is read almost exclusively by orthodox-Christian readers, those with right-wing political preferences and/or those with low to medium SES. Dutch opinion magazines have a reach that is comparable to the smaller newspapers: *Trouw*, *Het Parool* and *Reformatorisch Dablad*. The opinion magazines with the largest paper circulation and reach are *Elsevier*, *HP De Tijd*, and *De Groene Amsterdammer*, which attract higher-educated readers with a high SES. *Elsevier* appeals to voters on the right, *HP De Tijd* attracts both voters from the left, and voters from the right, and *De Groene Amsterdammer* appeals almost only to voters from the left.

New media - online news media, social media, weblogs and fora

On average, the Dutch spend daily almost one hour visiting news sites and apps (SCP, 2017). From all Dutch new news media, the internet-based *Nu.nl* has the largest reach (43.6%), among both ethnic minorities and Dutch natives (NOBO, 2018). *Nu.nl* appeals equally to voters from the rights and voters from the left, and is, together with the website of the news program *NOS*, the most appreciated Dutch news website among ethnic as well as native Dutch (Motivaction, 2014). In popularity and appreciation, *Nu.nl* is followed by the websites of TV news program *NOS* and the websites of the national newspapers: *AD* and *Telegraaf*. Interestingly, the website of *Telegraaf*, which is located on the right side of the political spectrum, is more appreciated among ethnic minorities than among Dutch natives. Another significant internet-based platform is *De Correspondent*, a popular and much shared news source among mostly centrum-left voters that reaches more than 5% of the Dutch population (Marketingfacts.nl, 2016). In the Netherlands, Facebook is the most used publicly accessible social medium, but has less members among ethnic minorities (69%) than among ethnic Dutch (75%). The most popular Dutch news pages on Facebook are *RTL Nieuws*, *AD.nl*, *NOS* and *De Telegraaf* (Marketingfacts, 2017). The Dutch weblog with the largest reach is *Geenstijl.nl* (Marketingfacts, 2014), which is a right-wing weblog read predominantly by the young and higher-educated. The ideological counterpart of *Geenstijl.nl* is the leftish weblog *Joop.nl*, which is an opinion website of the Dutch broadcasting organization *VARA (Ned 1)*. Ethnic minorities are represented online via Dutch fora like *Maroc.nl* and *Hababam.nl*, and the weblog *Republiekallochtonie.nl*.

Against this background, the analysis undertaken in this research includes both traditional and digital (including social) media formats, with particular attention given to the reach, audience, and ideological standing of the medium.

3.3. Sampling procedure

To select items relevant for our analysis we applied a multi-step, iterative, sampling method. In **step 1**, we determined the time frame by checking the frequency with which the issue of segregation in education has been discussed in Dutch print media included in the Dutch version of LexisNexis Academic – an online database that contains a major collection of world newspapers – between January 2010 and July 2018. A crude, search-word based screening showed a relative increase in the amount of reporting in autumn 2016, i.e. at the outset of the national election campaign – an increase that has continued (with some fluctuation) until now. In consequence, our sampling frame ranges from September 2016 to July 2018. In **step 2**, a balanced selection of relevant traditional and new (social) news media was made according to their ideological-political stance, reach and characteristics of the (target-)audience. In **step 3**, the to-be-analysed media were screened for the presence of relevant items: articles, news items, sections of talk-shows, blog entries, etc., that focus explicitly on issues related to segregation in education. For feasibility reasons (lack of access to broadcast archives), priority was given to content accessible on-line or via LexisNexis Academic. This excluded from our potential sample items that had been broadcast by traditional channels (TV, radio) but currently inaccessible via (other) digital channels. The following key-terms were used when screening: ‘segregation’, ‘education’, ‘white and black schools’, ‘opportunities inequality’, ‘special education’ and ‘Islamic schools’. Screening took place on the official websites of the pre-selected media and their

public Facebook pages. It encompassed **(step 4)** all the items/media entries referred to in the (pre-)selected material as well as in the readers' comments to this material.

In selecting media sources we tried to find a balance between the various criteria: ideological stance of the medium and/or its target audience; popularity among various socio-economic groups and ethnic minorities; balance between traditional (print and broadcast) media and new (digital) media; and include media that enable the active engagement of the audience (via comments). The choice of specific media outlets was driven by their popularity, measured by their reach and appreciation among users, their dissimilar ideological profile, and the socio-economic characteristics of their users.

Eventually, 45 clips discussing issues of ethnic, racial, religious and socio-economic segregation in education, predominantly commentaries, opinion pieces and interviews, published between 2016 and 2018 have been selected for the primary analysis. Only items in which segregation in education constituted the main issue of reporting were chosen. In addition, we analysed 272 users' comments that appeared on-line in reaction to 15 of the news clips selected for the analysis (selection ratio comments: 8.6%). Based on the general argumentative quality of the comments, the online discussions were divided into those with generally high or generally low quality comments. The selection of to-be-analysed comments from the high quality discussions was purposeful: only comments related in their argumentative layer to the issues or actors discussed in the news clip analysed were included. In case of low quality discussions (7 items), the selection was partly randomized: from every 10th comment published, we selected those that were relevant in their argumentative layer to news clip analysed, and especially those that added a new perspective and/or stirred a discussion among other users. In case of low quality discussions that consisted of less than 100 comments, 10% of all comments were randomly selected for the analysis; again – the relevance of the comment and its argumentative novelty were crucial for the selection.

3.4. List analysed media clips

Dimension 1: Ethnic segregation

Selected items of media on the right side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multi-modality	Source
AD	Popular newspaper, large reach, lower-educated/SES	18/10/16	<i>Mees (13) trekt het niet meer als enig wit kind in de klas</i>	x	Image	Link
<i>Reformatorisch Dagblad</i>	Newspaper, orthodox-Christian, limited reach, lower-educated/SES	19/12/17	<i>'Vrijheid van onderwijs niet opheffen vanwege segregatie'</i>		Image Photo	Link
RTL Nieuws	Internet-based news, TV news program, channel with largest reach, lower-educated/SES	07/12/17	<i>'Op een gemengde school leer je je verplaatsen in een ander'</i>	x	Video	Link
<i>Telegraaf</i>	Most popular traditional newspaper, greatest reach, lower-educated/SES	02/02/17.	<i>Politici, voer actie tegen segregatie!</i>			Link

Selected items of media on the left side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multi-modality	Source
<i>Joop.nl</i>	Weblog, limited reach, higher educated/SES	18/04/17	<i>'Tijd dat we de segregatie in het onderwijs een halt toeroepen'</i>	X	Photo	Link
<i>Parool</i>	Newspaper, medium-reach, higher educated/SES	05/05/17	<i>Is een zwarte of witte school zo erg?</i>		Photo	Link
		20/05/17	<i>Overheid moet strijd tegen segregatie leiden</i>		Image Hyperlink	Link P1 Link P2
		13/12/16	<i>'Zwarte en witte scholen, het lijkt wel apartheid'</i>		Photo	Link P1 Link P2
<i>Republiek Allochtonië</i>	Weblog, limited reach, ethnic minorities	24/10/16	<i>Segregatie houdt kinderen gevangen in achterstand</i>		Hyperlin	Link
<i>Trouw</i>	Traditional newspaper, limited reach, liberal-Christian, higher-educated/SES	06/09/16	<i>Zwarte school is nog niet zwart genoeg</i>		Photo	Link

Selected items of media in the centrum of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>Correspondent</i>	Online-based news, analytic/opinion, centrum/left, higher educated/SES	16/05/18	<i>Arme en rijke kinderen zitten steeds minder vaak bij elkaar in de klas (en daar is wat aan te doen)</i>	x	Images, graphs, hyperlinks	Link
<i>NOS</i>	Internet-based news, news program TV, large reach	20/03/18	<i>Veel ongelijkheid in het onderwijs: 'Het is echt vijf voor twaalf'</i>		Photos Hyperlinks	Link
<i>Metro</i>	Free newspaper, lower educated/SES	01/02/17	<i>Is de integratie op Nederlandse scholen mislukt?</i>		Photo; Hyperlink	Link
		09/05/17	<i>Lezen op eigen risico: Racistische column</i>	x	Photo	Link

Dimension 2: Socio-economic segregation

Selected items of media on the right side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>AD</i>	Popular newspaper, large reach, lower-educated/SES	11/04/18	<i>Tweedeling tussen rijk en arm neemt toe op Utrechtse scholen</i>		Photo; Hyperlink	Link
<i>Geenstijl.nl</i>	News/opinion, most popular weblog, comments, higher-educated	07/01/18	<i>'Slechte schoolprestaties allochtone leerlingen = Schuld van Ongelijkheid'</i>	X	Twitter Hyperlinks	Link
<i>Reformatisch Dagblad</i>	Newspaper, orthodox-Christian, limited reach, lower-educated/SES	19/12/17	<i>'Vrijheid van onderwijs niet opheffen vanwege segregatie'</i>		Image Photo	Link
<i>RTL Nieuws</i>	Internet-based news, TV news program, channel with largest reach, lower-educated/SES	30/10/16	<i>Meer kans voor leerling met laagopgeleide ouders</i>		Photo, hyperlink	Link

<i>Telegraaf</i>	Most popular traditional newspaper, greatest reach, lower-educated/SES	11/04/18	<i>Onderwijsniveau glijdt af: Nederland valuit uit de internationale top</i>	X	Photo	Link
------------------	--	----------	--	---	-------	----------------------

Selected items of media on the left side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>De Groene Amsterdammer</i>	Opinion magazine, limited reach, higher educated/SES	20/04/16	<i>Sociale scheidslijnen in Nederland: Generatie ongelijk</i>		Photo's	Link
<i>NRC</i>	Newspaper, medium-reach, higher educated/SES	04/12/17	<i>Strijden tegen de onderwijssegregatie</i>		Photo	Link
<i>Parool</i>	Newspaper, medium-reach, higher educated/SES	07/07/18	<i>Amsterdammerschap eerst in de klas</i>		Photo	Link P1 Link P2
		18/11/17	<i>Maak gelijke kansen de prioriteit</i>		Photo	Link P1 Link P2
<i>Volkscrant</i>	Newspaper, medium reach, higher educated/SES	13/04/18	<i>Segregatie in onderwijs: de klas is een bubbel van gelijke zielen</i>		Photo Graphs	Link
		26/07/17	<i>Onderwijs draagt bij aan tweedeling in Nederland</i>		Photo	Link

Selected items of media in the centrum of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>Correspondent</i>	Online-based news, analytic/opinion, centrum/left, higher educated/SES	08/08/17	<i>Waarom veel slimme kinderen het toch niet redden op school</i>	X	Images, graph, hyperlinks	Link
<i>HP De Tijd</i>	Magazine, centrum, low reach, higher educated/SES	14/02/17	<i>Kamer wil limiet aan ouderbijdrage</i>			Link
<i>Nieuwsuur (NOS)</i>	Popular news program, large reach	01/10/16	<i>'Kinderen van laagopgeleide ouders hebben minder kansen op school, terwijl ze even slim zijn als klasgenootjes met hoogopgeleide ouders'.</i>	X	Video	Link
<i>NOS</i>	Internet-based news, news program TV, large reach	11/04/18	<i>Het Nederlandse onderwijs glijdt af: al 20 jaar daalt niveau, zegt inspectie</i>		Photo's	Link

Dimension 3: Religious segregation

Selected items of media on the right side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
Elsevier	Most popular opinion magazine, large reach, higher-educated/SES	23/09/17	<i>Het hardnekkige misverstand over vrijheid van onderwijs</i>	x	Photo	Link
		07/10/16	<i>Bijzonder onderwijs had liberale uitvinding kunnen zijn</i>		Photo	Link
Geenstijl.nl	News/opinion, most popular weblog, comments, higher-educated	04/10/17	<i>Papieren pudding genaamd Volkskrant legt uit waarom islamitisch onderwijs zo belangrijk is</i>	X	Hyperlink, Twitter	Link
		24/04/18	<i>Ebru Umar - Fuck islamitisch onderwijs op marmere vloeren en onder kroonluchters</i>	X	Photo, hyperlinks	Link
Reformatorisch Dagblad	Newspaper, orthodox-Christian, limited reach, lower-educated/SES	17/12/16	<i>Voorkom afbraak van onderwijsvrijheid</i>		Photo	Link
		01/10/16	<i>Misverstanden over christelijk onderwijs zitten diep</i>			Link

Selected items of media on the left side of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>Joop.nl</i>	Weblog, limited reach, higher educated/SES	19/09/16	<i>Zondag met Lubach pakt bijzonder onderwijs aan</i>	X	Video	Link
<i>NRC</i>	Newspaper, medium-reach, higher educated/SES	11/05/18	<i>'Islamitische scholen hebben een kracht die wordt onderschat'</i>		Photo,	Link
<i>Parool</i>	Newspaper, medium-reach, higher educated/SES	02/09/17	<i>'Religieus onderwijs staat haaks op diversiteit'</i>		Photos	Link
<i>Trouw</i>	Traditional newspaper, limited reach, liberal-Christian, higher-educated/SES	07/12/17	<i>'Vrijheid van onderwijs is juist heel liberaal'</i>		Photos	Link P1 Link P2
		30/12/16	<i>'Openbaar onderwijs voor iedereen'</i>		Photo	Link
		09/01/17	<i>'Bijzonder onderwijs leidt niet tot segregatie'</i>		Photos	Link
<i>Volkskrant</i>	Newspaper, medium reach, higher educated/SES	03/11/17	<i>Yusuf Altuntas vertelt waarom islamitisch onderwijs zo belangrijk is</i>	x	Photos	Link P1 Link P2

Selected items of media in the centrum of the political spectrum

Media	Profile	Date	Title	Comments	Multimodality	Source
<i>Goedemorgen NL</i>	Popular morning talkshow, high reach	03/12/17	<i>'Er is ruimte voor 70 islamitische basisscholen in Nederland'</i>	X	Photo	Link
<i>Nieuwsuur (NOS)</i>	Popular news program, large reach	12/09/16	<i>Moeten alle scholen gemengd onderwijs aanbieden?</i>		Video (debate)	Link
<i>Metro</i>	Free newspaper, lower educated/SES	09/05/17	<i>Geld voor Islamitische school</i>		Photo	Link

4. Portugal

4.1. Background information on the debate selected for the analysis: minority's right to history and self-definition

Despite their official status as Portuguese citizens entitled, under the Constitution of the Portuguese Republic, to equal treatment (art. 13), their considerable share/presence in the society and the centuries-long presence in the country, Roma and Afro-descendant communities are consistently constructed as 'foreign.' For example, as 'foreign' or 'second-class citizens' they are subjected to the protection by the High Commission for Migration and thus set under the legal guardianship of the state; they are also the object of 'guidance' through their 'assimilation' to the Portuguese society. The discriminatory representation of these two minority groups is facilitated by lack of reliable data on the ethnic-racial origin of Portuguese citizens, on the one hand, and a distorted vision of the history of Portuguese colonialism and racial discrimination, on the other.

Lack of reliable (population) data and misrepresentation of history (or one-sided representation of history that ignores minority perspectives) are seen as most fundamental, and often entwined, sources of injustice, traceable, among other things, in education. Particularly relevant here is the problem of (spontaneous) educational segregation, which deprives minority children of quality education and prevents their recognition as full-fledged members of the national community. Attributed to the state's failures in creating the conditions for multicultural dialogue and cultural co-existence as well as lack of ethnic monitoring, educational segregation contributes to the structural invisibility of the minority groups. In the eyes of minority activists and international bodies, the 'formal', 'numerical' invisibility is intertwined with 'symbolic' invisibility, exemplified by absences, half-truths and omissions in the school curriculum, and attributed to the assimilationist school system that fails to include young minority citizens in the national project.

The current analysis of the discursive construction of justice in media debates on education is based on the media coverage of specific 'events' or developments in the realm of minority or education policy and/or triggered by minority activism. Relevant for the current analysis, for example, was the coverage triggered by the launching of a "National Study on the Roma Communities"¹¹³ (2014) carried out by the Roma Communities Observatory (ObCig) or a very recent report by the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI),¹¹⁴ which: (a) clearly claims that Portuguese history textbooks should discuss the contribution of Afro-descendants and Roma communities to Portuguese society; and (b) states that the history of the former Portuguese colonies, as well as the discrimination and violence committed against them should be taught in school. On the other hand, relevant for the current analysis was the coverage of the black activism between 2016-2018 and the media debate around the investigative journalism on colonialism, racism and inequality by Joana Henriques Gorjão (2016-2017). For the current analysis, we focused on the coverage that (explicitly) addressed the inclusionary/exclusionary aspects of education for ethnic-racial minorities in Portugal.

¹¹³ See Mendes, Magano and Candeias (2014).

¹¹⁴ ECRI (European Commission against Racism and Intolerance) 2018. *Relatório da ECRI sobre Portugal*. Available at <https://rm.coe.int/fifth-report-on-portugal-portuguese-translation-/16808de7db>, accessed in October 2018.

4.2. Portuguese media landscape

The Portuguese study comprises an analysis of a selection of items that appeared in traditional print news media (newspapers, news magazines) and ‘new’ (digital) media that produce and distribute news via internet (e.g. online newspapers, web blogs, thematic websites/platforms, YouTube channel, Facebook pages). The study focus on print and on-line news media is driven by their accessibility – archival data of visual and general broadcast media is in Portugal difficult to access.

(Traditional) print media

Although traditional, written press has faced an erosion of their audience in recent years, many of the readers still prefer traditional *offline* outlets to access news.¹¹⁵ In fact, 43 per cent of the Portuguese declare using traditional written press “several times a day” (ERC, 2019: 7). Moreover, in a recent survey on the on-line use of ‘traditional media’, more than 80% of respondents admitted using the newspapers webpages to see news on the Internet, while 66% admitted using also social networks.¹¹⁶

According to a recent study on the most read newspapers and magazines, *Correio da Manhã* is the most read daily (with an average audience of 11.3%), followed by the *Jornal de Notícias* (10%), a weekly *Expresso* (5,7%), a daily *Público* (4,8%), *Diário de Notícias* (3,4%) and, finally, a weekly *Sol* (1%). Since Portuguese press is in general targeting a rather plural and diverse audience, it is difficult to identify a clear political/ideological profile of specific titles.¹¹⁷ However, over the last years, all the above identified newspapers have been consistently expressing centre or centre-right political positions.

While studies on media as opinion makers are scarce in Portugal, it is quite common for traditional newspapers to be quoted in another media outlets, such as blog posts or radio broadcasting. In particular, the *Público* and *Expresso* are considered highly influential as opinion leaders – often cited and referred to in public debates. Also, *Correio da Manhã*, a populist centre-right newspaper, on the other hand, is believed to have a greater impact on the opinions of the common citizen.

New media

The importance of ‘new’ media in Portugal is growing, especially among (ethnic) youth or minority groups in general, who use them to denounce injustices and to express their perspectives on their struggles for recognition. Since it is the popularity among specific groups that defines the success of the ‘new’ media, they are in general very much target-audience oriented, producing content that is relevant to and/or expected by their (expected)

¹¹⁵ Gonçalves, Telmo (coord.) (2019), *Públicos e consumos de média – o consumo de notícias e as plataformas digitais em Portugal e em mais dez países*, ERC, Lisboa

¹¹⁶ “Jornal de Notícias” é o jornal online preferido dos portugueses’, *Jornal de Notícias*, 25 September 2018, available at <https://www.jn.pt/artes/media/interior/jornal-de-noticias-e-o-jornal-online-preferido-dos-portugueses-9906209.html>, accessed in October 2018.

¹¹⁷ Oliveira, José Manuel Paquete, ‘Não há jornais de direita nem de esquerda em Portugal’, *Público*, 6 June 2016, available at <https://www.publico.pt/2016/06/06/sociedade/opiniao/nao-ha-jornais-de-direita-nem-de-esquerda-em-portugal-1734159>, accessed in September 2018.

audiences. Exceptional in this respect are the on-line versions of the ‘traditional media outlets’ still targeting rather broad audience.

The popularity of various ‘new media outlets’ differs. Those, whose appearance on the market has been particularly timely, like the Facebook page of the SOS Racism Association, are known to the broad public and can boast a significant number of Facebook followers (in case of *SOS Racismo* - 18448 followers); the Facebook pages of the *High Commission for Migration* (ACM) and the *Choices Program* also exceeded 10.000 followers). On the other hand, some of the new media ‘channels’ exert a great impact in terms of dissemination of information that regards ethnic and racial minorities, despite their more regional or circumscribed scope of action and a modest number of followers.

4.3. Sampling procedure

At the outset of the sampling procedure (**step 1**), we pre-selected media relevant for the analysis. In the selection process attention was paid to: (1) the format of the media (traditional vs. new media); (2) the popularity of the particular media outlet among various populations groups (e.g. in term of age, class, minority status etc.); (3) the content of the reporting/coverage (news with specific reference the Roma community and Afro-descendants, as well as news identifying different types of exclusions in education); and (4) their capacity to guarantee a wide dissemination of news to a broader, generalist public – relevant in particular for the selection of items published by traditional outlets. In case of ‘new’ media, selection focused on social media (including independent and alternative journalism) that reported ethnic-racial news; communication channels created by civil society associations struggling for the rights of minorities; as well as websites and platforms of NGOs working with minorities and migrants in Portugal.

In **step 2**, all the relevant (on-line) sources, including the Facebook pages and on-line versions of traditional print media, were screened for their content); the following key-words – all alluding to segregation in education, right to history and ethnic-racial data collection – were used: “segregation/exclusion”, “Roma”, “Afro-descendants”, “schools and/or classes for Roma children”, “equal opportunities”, “discrimination”, “illiteracy”, “school failure”, “[Portuguese] History textbooks”, “Ethnic-racial data collection”, “ethnic-racial representativeness”, “quotas”, “ethnic-racial recognition”, “school inequalities/segregation”, “Eurocentric School curricula and textbooks”, “professional courses”, “vocational/technical education”, “mediators”, “schools and class segregation”, “citizenship” “interculturality”, “assimilation/integration”, “history and cultural patrimony of minorities”, “decolonized curriculum”, “anti-racist”, “[Portuguese] colonialism and slavery”, “decolonize Europe”, “racism”, “equal participation”, “barriers to school success”, “future life choice”, “inclusive school”, “education/classroom homogenization”, “minorities myths/stereotypes”, “restorative justice”, “Othering”, “negligence of identity”, “diversity [cultural, school]”, “multiculturalism”, “lusotropicalism”, “absenteeism”, “Discoveries”, “former colonies”, and “national identity project”.

In **step 3**, the to-be-analysed material was divided between items that focused explicitly on Roma communities and those that discussed the situation of Afro-descendants. A few relevant debates were selected as the focus of the in-depth analysis. These were: the approval of the National Roma Communities Integration Strategy 2013-2020

(ENICC) by the government¹¹⁸; reporting around the ‘International Decade for People of African Descent (2015-2024)’¹¹⁹; reporting on the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI)¹²⁰; and reporting on some national developments related to the increase in black activism, investigative journalism on colonialism, and new data on racial-inequalities.

Eventually, a total of 48 news/information items were the analysis. Of these, 30 were from the traditional print media and 18 from the new media. Preference was given to opinion pieces/editorials rather than to news items presenting a mere description of an event. Samples of investigative journalism were also included. In addition, when available, 3 comments to 15 traditional and 6 ‘new’ media items were analysed. However, it should be noted that the general engagement online is low and the comments were scarce.

¹¹⁸ Ministry Council Resolution no. 25/2013, available at <https://dre.pt/pesquisa/-/search/260415/details/maximized>, accessed in August 2018.

¹¹⁹ The theme for the International Decade proclaimed by the UN General Assembly was “People of African descent: recognition, justice and development” (Resolution 68/237). Available at <http://www.un.org/en/events/africandescentdecade/>, accessed in September 2018.

¹²⁰ ECRI (European Commission against Racism and Intolerance) 2018. *Relatório da ECRI sobre Portugal*. Available at <https://rm.coe.int/fifth-report-on-portugal-portuguese-translation-/16808de7db>, accessed in October 2018.

4.4. List analysed media clips

Selected Traditional Media

o.	Media	Profile	Date	Title	News	Comments	Multimodality	Source
1	<i>Visão</i>	Opinion magazine	20/07/2017	<i>Racistas, nós?</i>	X		Photo's	http://visao.sapo.pt/actualidade/sociedade/2017-07-19-Racistas-nos-
2	<i>Diário de Notícias</i>	Newspaper, large reach	01/09/2017	<i>Governo quer debate nacional sobre o racismo e pôr tema nas escolas</i>	X		Photo	https://www.dn.pt/portugal/interior/governo-quer-debate-nacional-sobre-discriminacao-racial-e-promete-por-tema-nas-escolas-8742591.html
3	<i>Expresso</i>	Newspaper, large reach	07/07/2017	<i>Ciganos e afrodescendentes mais protegidos com nova lei</i>	X		Photo	https://leitor.expresso.pt/diario/07-07-2017/html/caderno-1/temas-principais/ciganos-e-afrodescendentes-mais-protegidos-com-nova-lei
4	<i>Visão</i>	Opinion magazine	02/10/2018	<i>Europa quer que manuais escolares passem a contar a história dos descobrimentos incluindo a "discriminação e a violência"</i>	X		Photo	http://visao.sapo.pt/actualidade/sociedade/2018-10-02-Europa-quer-que-manuais-escolares-passem-a-contar-a-historia-dos-Descobrimentos-incluindo-a-discriminacao-e-a-violencia
5	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	23/09/2017	<i>Nem o 25 de Abril derrubou o mito do bom colonizador</i>	X	X	Photo's, newslinks	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/23/sociedade/noticia/nem-o-25-de-abril-derrubou-o-mito-do-bom-colonizador-1786395
6	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	29/01/2018	<i>Racismo em Portugal: desafios para a esquerda no século XXI</i>	X	X	-	https://www.publico.pt/2018/01/29/sociedade/opiniao/racismo-em-portugal-desafios-para-a-esquerda-no-seculo-xxi-1799860
7	<i>Diário de Notícias</i>	Newspaper, large reach	01/05/2017	<i>"Persiste nos manuais a narrativa de que fomos bons colonizadores"</i>	X		Image	https://www.dn.pt/sociedade/interior/persiste-nos-manuais-a-narrativa-de-que-fomos-bons-colonizadores-6257731.html
8	<i>Diário de Notícias</i>	Newspaper, large reach	01/05/2017	<i>Passado Colonial. "Não sabemos o lado verdadeiro da nossa história"</i>	X		Photo	https://www.dn.pt/sociedade/interior/o-que-sabemos-portugueses-do-seu-passado-colonial-6257659.html

9	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	19/10/2018	<i>Como se avalia um país? "As discussões são confidenciais"</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/10/19/sociedade/noticia/--discussoes-sao-confidenciais-autor-relatorio-racismo-1848082
10	<i>SOL</i>	Newspaper, low reach	12/07/2017	<i>Racismo. Isto "não é um problema de polícias ignorantes" mas de impunidade</i>	X	X	Photo	https://sol.sapo.pt/artigo/571875/racismo-isto-nao-e-um-problema-de-policias-ignorantes-mas-de-impunidade
11	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	28/10/2018	<i>Esta escola já não é só para ciganos</i>	X		Photo's, video, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/10/28/sociedade/repotagem/escola-ja-nao-so-ciganos-1848819
12	<i>Diário de Notícias</i>	Newspaper, large reach	16/09/2017	<i>Ciganas com um pé na tradição e outro na universidade</i>	X		Photo's	https://www.dn.pt/sociedade/interior/ciganas-com-um-pe-na-tradicao-e-outro-na-universidade-8774405.html
13	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	05/02/2017	<i>Só 2,5% dos ciganos completaram o ensino secundário</i>	X	X	Photo	https://www.publico.pt/2017/02/05/sociedade/noticia/so-25-dos-ciganos-completaram-o-ensino-secundario-1760868
14	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	04/03/2018	<i>Até nas escolas "há uma tendência para segregar" os ciganos</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/03/04/sociedade/entre-vista/mesmo-nas-escolas-ha-uma-tendencia-para-segregar-os-ciganos-1805267
15	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	07/04/2018	<i>A escola pode ser um lugar onde as crianças ciganas se sentem protegidas</i>	X	X	Photo's	https://www.publico.pt/2018/04/07/sociedade/repotagem/a-escola-pode-ser-um-lugar-onde-as-criancas-ciganas-se-sentem-protegidas-1808613
16	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	29/11/2018	<i>Haverá bolsas no ensino secundário para 100 alunos ciganos</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/11/29/sociedade/noticia/havera-bolsas-ensino-secundario-100-alunos-ciganos-1852980
17	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	09/04/2018	<i>Em 19 anos duplicou o número de ciganos na escola obrigatória</i>	X	X	Photo, graphs, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/04/09/sociedade/noticia/quase-duplicou-o-numero-de-alunos-ciganos-na-escola-obrigatoria-1808751
18	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	08/08/2018	<i>Há 32 câmaras que querem ter mediadores interculturais</i>	X		Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/08/08/sociedade/noticia/ha-32-camaras-que-querem-ter-mediadores-interculturais-1840292

19	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	09/09/2017	<i>Com que direito se apagam as crianças brancas dos manuais</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/noticia/com-que-direito-se-apagam-as-criancas-naobrancas-dos-manuais-1784746
20	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	03/10/2018	<i>Ensino da história não pode ignorar a violência cometida contra os povos das ex-colónias</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2018/10/03/sociedade/noticia/ensino-da-historia-portuguesa-nao-pode-continuar-a-ignorar-a-violencia-cometida-contra-os-povos-das-excolonias-1846066
21	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	19/03/2017	<i>A luta pela descolonização continua</i>	X	X	Photo's, images	https://www.publico.pt/2017/03/19/sociedade/noticia/a-luta-pela-descolonizacao-continua-1765568
22	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	16/09/2017	<i>As várias faces do ativismo negro</i>	X	X	Photo's, image, video, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/16/sociedade/noticia/as-varias-faces-do-activismo-negro-1785487
23	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	09/09/2017	<i>Dos afrodescendentes espera-se que não passem da “escolaridade obrigatória”</i>	X	X	Image, video, photo	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/noticia/dos-afrodescendentes-esperase-que-nao-passem-da-escolaridade-obrigatoria-1784725
24	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	09/09/2017	<i>“A presença de negros na academia é nula”</i>	X	X	Photo's	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/entre-vista/a-presenca-de-negros-na-academia-e-nula-1784760
25	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	09/09/2017	<i>Há uma geração a ser encaminhada para as vias vocacionais</i>	X	X	Photo, Graph	https://www.publico.pt/2017/09/09/sociedade/noticia/ha-uma-geracao-a-ser-encaminhada-para-as-vias-vocacionais-1784759
26	<i>Diário de Notícias</i>	Newspaper, large reach	13/06/2017	<i>“É preciso descolonizar Portugal”</i>	X		Photo's	https://www.dn.pt/portugal/interior/racismo-e-preciso-descolonizar-portugal-8558961.html
27	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	20/02/2016	<i>Queixas de racismo e discriminação em manuais escolares</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2016/02/20/sociedade/noticia/denuncias-de-racismo-e-discriminacao-em-manuais-escolares-1723843
28	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	05/05/2016	<i>Afrofobia está espalhada na Europa e em Portugal</i>	X	X	Photo, newlinks	https://www.publico.pt/2016/05/05/sociedade/noticia/afrofobia-esta-espalhada-na-europa-e-em-portugal-1730868

29	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	24/04/2016	<i>Alunos dos PALOP em Portugal chumbam três vezes mais do que portugueses no 1.º ciclo</i>	X	X	Photo's, graph	https://www.publico.pt/2016/04/24/sociedade/noticia/alunos-de-palop-em-portugal-chumbam-tres-vezes-mais-que-portugueses-no-primeiro-ciclo-1729946
30	<i>Público</i>	Newspaper, large reach	05/12/2016	<i>Vinte e duas associações de afrodescendentes queixam-se de Portugal à ONU</i>	X	X	Photo, graphs, newslinks	https://www.publico.pt/2016/12/05/sociedade/noticia/xxxx-associacoes-de-afrodescendentes-enviam-carta-a-onu-a-criticar-estado-1753485

Selected "New Media"

No.	Media	Profile	Date	Title	News	Comments	Multimodality	Source
31	<i>Esquerda.net</i>	Left-wing online newspaper (news/opinion) most popular among left side of the political spectrum	22/02/2018	<i>Habituação inadequada ligada à discriminação étnica</i>	X		Photo, newslinks	https://www.esquerda.net/artigo/afrodescendentes-e-ciganos-vivem-em-habitacoes-inadequadas-em-portugal-afirma-amnistia
32	<i>Fumaça</i>	Independent, progressive and dissident journalism	12/10/2016	<i>Manuais escolares narram o colonialismo, a escravatura e o Racismo</i>	X		Audio-interview (podcast)	https://fumaca.pt/marta-araujo-manuais-escolares/
33	<i>Perguntar Não Ofende</i>	Independent journalism	29/11/2018	<i>"Os Portugueses são Racistas?"</i>	X		Audio-interview (podcast)	https://www.perguntarnaofende.pt/pno/cristina-roldao
34	<i>Canal CES</i>	CES news channel	20/05/2018	<i>Portugal ainda ensina o mito do "bom colonizador"</i>	X		-	http://saladeimprensa.ces.uc.pt/index.php?col=noticias&id=19996#.XC-xNVX7TIW
35	<i>UCV</i>	Web Television of the Coimbra University	25/03/2011	<i>Um olhar Europeu sobre África</i>	X		Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8tJlaF_cmAo
36	<i>Fumaça</i>	Independent, progressive and dissident journalism	21/04/2018	<i>Debate – Que papel para as comunidades ciganas?</i>	X		Video, audio-interview (podcast)	https://fumaca.pt/debate-que-papel-para-as-comunidades-ciganas/

37	<i>Fumaça</i>	Independent, progressive and dissident journalism	17/07/2017	<i>As comunidades ciganas em Portugal</i>	X		Audio-interview (podcast)	https://fumaca.pt/pimienio-ferreira-sobre-as-comunidades-ciganas-em-portugal/
38	<i>SIC Etnias</i>	A private television channel with largest reach. TV program based on ethnicity	07/01/2017	<i>Projeto Opré Chavalé - Ciganos no ensino Superior</i>	X		Video	https://sic.pt/Programas/Etnias/videos/2017-01-27-ETNIAS---Programa-de-7-de-janeiro
39	<i>Observatório das Comunidades Ciganas (ObCig)</i>	Governmental entity – under the scope of the High Commission for Migrations (ACM)	30/07/2018	<i>"Jovens ciganos/as no Ensino Secundário" - Newsletter July 2018</i>	X		Photo's, video, images, hyperlinks	https://www.obcig.acm.gov.pt/newsletter; https://www.obcig.acm.gov.pt/documents/58622/209362/Newsletter_OBCIG_julho_2018.pdf/c7bf6eff-7006-4d4e-b7f0-26b19e44ab5b
40	<i>Plataforma portuguesa para os direitos das mulheres</i>	Activist, pro women's rights, broad spectrum	30/04/2016	<i>Opré Chavalé - Program for the integration of Roma communities in higher education</i>	X		Photo's, hyperlinks, videos	http://plataformamulheres.org.pt/projectos/opre-chavale/
41	<i>Alto Comissariado para as Migrações (ACM)</i>	Governmental entity - High Commission for Migrations	06/04/2018	<i>"PareSer: um passo em frente em prol da Igualdade"</i>	X		Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=HaPfZBTzS58
42	<i>Letras Nomadas - Associação de Investigação e Dinamização das Comunidades Ciganas (AIDC)</i>	Activist, with a focus on Roma communities	25/09/2016	<i>Experiencing ROMED in Portugal</i>	X		Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=l-OXLf0-3OA
43	<i>RTP1 - Outras Histórias</i>	A public television channel owned by the Portuguese state, with largest reach.	27/11/2018	<i>Maria da Fronteira</i>	X		Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=027INFYHJa4

		TV program based on histories that inspire others.						
44	<i>Programa Escolhas</i>	A national government program, promoted by the Presidency of the Council of Ministers and coordinated by the High Commission for Migrations (ACM)	06/10/2015	<i>Implementar o "ensino à distância" no ano letivo de 2015/16</i>	X		Image	http://www.programaescolhas.pt/conteudos/noticias/ver-noticia/5613e28d4309a/programa-escolhas-volta-a-implementar-o-%22ensino-a-distancia%22-no-ano-letivo-de-2015-16
45	<i>Rádio Afrolis</i>	AudioBlog (radio) and cultural association produced by afro descendants living in Portugal	18/05/2016	<i>Afrodescendentes no Sistema Educativo Português</i>	X	X	Audio-interview (podcast)	https://radioafrolis.com/2016/05/18/audio-110-afrodescendentes-no-sistema-educativo-portugues/
46	<i>Fumaça</i>	Independent, progressive and dissident journalism	15/09/2016	<i>Racismo na Escola</i>	X		Audio-interview (podcast)	https://fumaca.pt/cristina-roldao-pedro-abrantes-racismo-escola/
47	<i>Fumaça</i>	Independent, progressive and dissident journalism	06/10/2016	<i>Racismo na Escola e na Política, e o Feminismo Negro.</i>	X		Audio-interview (podcast), podcastlinks	https://fumaca.pt/beatriz-gomes-dias-feminismo-negro/
48	<i>RTP África – Bem-Vindos</i>	A Public television channel. TV program directed to the African Portuguese speaking countries (Angola, Cape Verde, Equatorial Guinea, Mozambique and São Tomé and Príncipe) and Brazil	17/06/2016	<i>Entrevista a Beatriz Dias - Djass - Associação de Afrodescendentes</i>	X	X	Video	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=R83VEwVwhOI

5. Turkey

5.1. Background information on the debates selected for the analysis

In 2012, the government introduced a 12-year compulsory education system with four-year phases of primary, middle and high school, known in Turkey as the “4+4+4”. Along with this change, religious middle schools are opened and expanded and in many districts, religious vocational schools emerged (almost overnight) as the only alternative for parents.

One argument is that with the residence based enrolment scheme, students are forced to enroll in the religious *Imam Hatip* Schools situated in their districts. Some of the state schools are turned into *Imam Hatip* Schools in the neighbourhoods where secular-minded families reside. This created controversy in the society as the parents protested the enforcement of the religiously dominated education system. In 2014, parents took to the streets in protest against education reforms that promoted enrolment in state-run *Imam Hatip* Schools.¹²¹

Along with the elevation of the *Imam Hatip* schools, the introduction of more religious aspects in the curriculum also created controversy among the parents. Education Ministry’s proposal for the removal of “evolution” from science classes created unrest among the secular-minded parents. The teaching of religion in the curriculum has already been a controversial issue pertaining to the inclusiveness of the education system (See 4.3 Country Report). Turkey has been subject to several cases at the European Court of Human Rights on charges that Turkey had violated Alevi’s rights to education with its school practices as the religious classes at schools promote a Sunni driven Islamic interpretation that is imposed on Alevi students. The European Court of Human Rights has a ruling that the classes should be thought in a pluralistic way.

In the changing landscape of education, the opposing argument is that the *Imam Hatip* schools and their students have been demonized in the media as they are depicted as “religious and vindictive” generation.¹²² The government advocates that the *Imam Hatip* schools’ expansion responds to demand by Muslim families who want to send their children to religious schools and who felt discriminated by the secular elite.¹²³

The discourses around the controversial issue of promotion of religious education pertain to injustices that have redistributive, recognitive as well as representative character. Families from the lower socio-economic background who want their children to have access to secular education and cannot afford private schools find themselves in a disadvantaged position. This pertains to redistributive injustices (access to education); recognitive injustices issues (their worldview is not recognized in the religious education system one it is becoming a norm in the public education); and representative issues (they do not have the means to represent their case in the political circles). The claims of the other side, the religious families and organizations supportive of the religious schools, are also brought into the analysis. Here, the redistributive and recognitive injustices are often viewed from the perspective

¹²¹ Imam Hatip Schools that were established in 1923 to train imams, religious clergy under the state control. Today, they teach national curriculum as well as religious courses.

¹²² <https://tr.sputniknews.com/analiz/201809111035143674-imam-hatiplere-bakis-arastirmasi-raporu/>

¹²³ <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/feb/12/turkish-parents-steered-religious-schools-secular-imam-hatip>

of historical victimhood and discrimination that “religious majority” has experienced under the secular establishment.

5.2. Media landscapes

Taking the date of Turkish Statistical Institute into consideration, it can be claimed that the interest in the traditional print media has decreased. According to the 2018 data, the number of newspapers and magazines (5.962) decreased by 2.6% compared to 2017. This number was 7.120 in 2014, 4.176 of which were magazines. Magazines made up 58.7% of these publications. Only 6.9% of the newspapers published in 2018 have been published nationally. Besides that, in 2018, there was a 17.6% decrease in newspaper circulation compared to 2017. Although the number of magazines is more than newspapers, the total annual circulation of the newspapers and magazines published is 1.368.287.463, and newspapers constituted 94.2% of these publications.¹²⁴

Television, on the other hand, is considered the main information and entertainment source in Turkey. According to the report named "Television Viewing Trends Survey" published by Radio and Television Supreme Council, average daily television viewing time of the citizens of Turkey is 3 hours 34 minutes. Within the scope of the research, the most liked television channel is ATV with a rate of 19.7% owned by Turkuvaz media (a media company also owning *Sabah* newspaper), followed by the state-owned TRT channel and Fox. According to the findings of the research, the most watched programs were news programs, domestic TV series, and sports programs respectively.¹²⁵ Due to high concentration of the media, the traditional (print, broadcast) and ‘new’ (digital) news media hardly differ in content.

Over the last two decades, the traditional media environment of Turkey has become heavily polarized. There is a strong opposition between the pro-governmental and anti-governmental media outlets that coincides with the secular/modern-religious/conservative divide in the country. Also the readership and viewership of the newspapers and TV channels heavily align with party affiliation (Erdoğan and Semerci, 2018: 93-100). The pro-governmental (AKP) media encompass outlets nurtured by the AKP from their inception, outlets (recently) acquired by the pro-government business groups and outlets ‘disciplined’ by the AKP through (threats of) heavy tax fines, arrest and imprisonment of critical journalists (e.g. during the heavily politicized Ergenekon¹²⁶ and KCK¹²⁷ operations in 2008-2011) or redundancies (Yeşil, 2016: 94). Currently, most influential on this side of the political spectrum is *the Sabah*,

¹²⁴ <http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=27605>

¹²⁵ https://www.rtuk.gov.tr/rtuk-kamuoyu-arastirmalari/3890/5776/televizyon_izleme_egilimleri_arastirmasi_2018.html

¹²⁶ Ergenekon was an investigation in which people from civilian and military bureaucracy were charged with being involved in activities overthrow the government.

¹²⁷ KCK is a political body affiliated with PKK. In KCK investigations, many journalists were charged with being the member of KCK, PKK connections or dissemination of terrorist propaganda.

(footnote continued)

which was originally established (1985) as a mainstream centrist newspaper. In 2011, however, it was acquired by Çalık group from state-owned TMSF; in 2013, it was sold again, along with its parent media company, Turkuvaz media group, to another pro-government group, Zirve holding. Since 2011, *Sabah* is known for its clear pro-government stance. In general, it can be argued that media outlets purchased by pro-government business groups dominate mainstream media today. The pro-government Demirören media group today owns the mainstream newspapers such as *Milliyet* Newspaper, *Vatan* Newspaper, *Hürriyet* Newspaper, *Hürriyet Daily News* and *Posta* Newspaper. In addition, the same media group owns television channels such as *CNN Türk*, *Kanal D*, *teve2* and radio channels such as *CNN Türk Radio* and *Radyo D*.¹²⁸ On the other hand, Turkuvaz media group is the owner of newspapers such as *Sabah*, *Takvim*, *Yeni Asır* and *Daily Sabah*. In addition, Turkuvaz media group owns television channels such as *ATV*, *ATV Europe*, *Yeni Asır TV*, *a Haber minika*, *minika Çocuk*, *minika Go*, *a2*, *a News*, and also owns radio channels such as *Radio City*, *a News Radio*, *a Sports Radio*, *a News Radio*.¹²⁹

Apart from these, there exists a limited number of rather small-sized TV channels and newspapers, leftist and/or Kemalist in their orientation, heavily critical of the government (Yeşil, 2016: 142). Of those most popular are *Sözcü*, *BirGün* and *Cumhuriyet*. *Cumhuriyet* was chosen as one of the samplings of this report, since it is a daily established in 1924 and known for its commitment to the secular values of the republic. Therefore, it can be claimed that the newspaper has a representative position for opposing newspapers in terms of its deep-rooted history and institutional structure.

In general, media corporations in Turkey are also vertically integrated, i.e., they own various media outlets, most often newspapers and TV stations. Very often then the same content, with the same (ideological) framing, is put into circulation by both the newspapers and the TV stations. Thus news (analysis) published by *Sabah* corresponds with content broadcast by *ATV*. Even digital media journalism has been dominated by the aforementioned mainstream media holdings. Top websites ranking for “News and Media” category in Turkey such as (and respectively) *hurriyet.com.tr*, *sabah.com.tr*, *milliyet.com.tr* are owned by Demirören and Turkuvaz holdings.¹³⁰

5.3. Sampling procedure

In **step one** of the sampling we selected the to-be-screened media outlets. Under a polarized socio-political climate and due to the ideological divide between the pro-government vs opposition media as well as the vertical integration of the media under common ownership, we chose to focus in our analysis on two national newspapers that are believed to represent the two (far) ends of the polarized media spectrum: the pro-government *Sabah* and the opposition *Cumhuriyet*. The choice was driven by the similarities in the content of the various media outlets *within* each of the ideological ‘camps’ and the availability of (on-line) archives. In addition, we include in the analysis a social media website *Ekşi Sözlük* (<https://eksisozluk.com>). *Ekşi-Sözlük* is “a collaborative hypertext dictionary” based on the concept of Web sites built up on users’ contributions; yet one that does not require correct information.¹³¹ *Ekşi Sözlük* writers (who are registered and approved users, who have the authority to make

¹²⁸ https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demir%C3%B6ren_Holding

¹²⁹ https://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Turkuvaz_Medya_Grubu

¹³⁰ <https://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries/TR>

¹³¹ https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Ekşi_Sözlük

comments and create headings) create headings (i.e. titles under which users share their entries) about current developments and share their personal views by the means of comments (defined as "entries" within *Ekşi Sözlük* jargon). *Ekşi Sözlük* constitutes a powerful opinion outlet that can affect the country's media agenda. Some developments/issues that have been overlooked, or purposefully omitted, in the mainstream media can still attract the mainstream/traditional media's attention once *Ekşi Sözlük* users have actively discussed them. According to Alexa, *Ekşi Sözlük* is the eleventh¹³², and according to *SimilarWeb*¹³³ the , most popular website in Turkey. Unlike some social media channels, such as Twitter and Facebook, *Ekşi Sözlük* is a website that is mainly used in Turkish. Therefore, the subjects that occupy the agenda of *Ekşi Sözlük* generally consist of local or international developments that may attract the attention of the citizens of the country.

The analysis encompassed a period of 2014-2019. To select the to-be-analysed media clips (**step 2**), we used the digital versions of the two newspapers and screened their content for the presence of our key-word "Imam Hatip." After skimming through all the news items featuring the word *Imam-Hatip*, we left out some irrelevant content, including in our analyses (**step 3**) only the news items that focused mainly or exclusively on *Imam-Hatips*. Similar strategy was applied when screening the content of *Ekşi Sözlük*. Having listed all the headings which included the word *İmam-Hatip*, we sorted them (**step 4**) according to the number of entries, their quality (i.e. how conducive they are to the analysis) and potential to represent different opinions. Eventually, the analysis comprised 155 articles from the *Cumhuriyet* and 115 articles from *Sabah* as well as 5 headings (together with 329 entries) from the *Ekşi Sözlük*. The analysis does not include any comments of the media audience: although the news web sites examined within the scope of this research have important positions in terms of the mainstream media of the country, user comments are not allowed on these websites.

5.4. List analysed media clips

Okullara İmam Hatip sınıfları geliyor, Publish Date: August 30, 2014 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/112527/Okullara_imam_Hatip_siniflari_geliyor.html

İmam hatiplerde Türkçe yasaklandı , Publish Date: September 3, 2014 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/114011/imam_hatiplerde_Turkce_yasaklandi.html

MEB'in yeni projesi: 'Genç Bilaller', Publish Date: February 5, 2015 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/206857/MEB_in_yeni_projesi_Genc_Bilaller_.html

Bilal'in hedefine bir yılda varıldı, Published: February 5, 2015 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/252183/Bilal_in_hedefine_bir_yilda_varildi.html

Hollanda'da İmam Hatip, Publish Date: July 13, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/779969/Hollanda_da_imam_Hatip.html

İmam hatibe sınır yok, Publish Date: September 16, 2017 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/824656/imam_hatibe_sinir_yok.html

¹³² <https://www.alexa.com/topsites/countries/TR>

¹³³ <https://www.similarweb.com/top-websites/turkey>

İmam hatip ve açık lise öğrencilerinin sayısı 1 milyonu aştı , Publish Date: September 18, 2017 Monday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/826021/imam-hatip-ve-acik-lise-ogrencilerinin-sayisi-1-milyonu-asti.html>

Erdoğan'ın isminin verildiği okulda dikkat çeken detay

Publish Date: September 19, 2017, Tuesday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/foto/foto-galeri/826995/1/Erdogan-in-isminin-verildigi-okulda-dikkat-cek-en-detay.html>

7 milyon lira harcanarak yapılan İmam Hatip yeni döneme 45 öğrenci ile başladı

Publish Date: September 20, 2017 Wednesday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/827404/7-milyon-lira-harcanarak-yapilan-imam-hatip-yeni-doneme-45-ogrenci-ile-basladi.html>

Spor Toto'nun katkılarıyla imam hatip

Publish Date: September 21, 2017 Thursday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/828354/Spor-Toto-nun-katkilariyla-imam-hatip.html>

ÖSYM'de bir garip imam hatip geleneği

Publish Date: October 5, 2017 Thursday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/838171/OSYM-de-bir-garip-imam-hatip-gelenegi.html>

Manevi Eğitim Bakanlığı

Publish Date: November 30, 2017 Thursday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/876504/Manevi-Egitim-Bakanligi.html>

Bilal Erdoğan imam hatiplilere seslendi: Sizler Erdoğan neslisiniz

Publish Date: January 18, 2018 Thursday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/907742/Bilal-Erdogan-imam-hatiplilere-seslendi-Sizler-Erdogan-neslisiniz.html>

Yönetmeni kızdıran 'küfür' sorusu: Ben İmam Hatip mezunuyum

Publish Date: Wednesday, November 12, 2014

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/139839/Yonetmeni-kizdiran-kufur-sorusu-Ben-imam-Hatip-mezunuyum....html>

Gülen'den alıp İHL yaptılar

Publish Date: Wednesday, August 31, 2016

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/593148/Gulen-den-alip-iHL-yaptilar.html>

Suriyeliler için İmam Hatip projesi

Publish Date: Friday, August 4, 2017

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/795968/Suriyeliler-icin-imam-Hatip-projesi.html>

Velilere 'çocuklarınızı imam hatipe gönderecek misiniz?' sorusu

Publish Date: Wednesday, May 7, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/68911/Velilere_cocuklarinizi_imam_hatipe_gonderecek_misiniz_sorusu.html

Tek yol imam hatip!

Publish Date: Friday, May 9, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/69811/Tek_yol_imam_hatip_.html

Haydi kızlar İHL'ye!

Publish Date: Sunday, June 29, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/88123/Haydi_kizlar_iHL_je_.html

İmam hatiplerden 8000 boş kontenjan

Publish Date: Wednesday, September 2, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/358289/imam_hatiplerden_8000_bos_kontenjan.html

Okulun ilk günü imam hatip isyanı

Publish Date: September 15, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/foto/foto_galeri/119458/1/Okulun_ilk_gunu_imam_hatip_isyani.html

Ünlülerin okulu imam hatip oldu, mezunlar isyan etti

Publish Date: Tuesday, July 7, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/315601/Unlulerin_okulu_imam_hatip_oldu_mezunlar_isyan_etti_.html

Proje okullara 'örtülü imam hatip' modeli

Publish Date: September 12, 2015 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/366733/Proje_okullara_ortulu_imam_hatip_modeli.html

İlkokula imam hatip darbesi!

Publish Date: September 26, 2015 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/376171/ilkokula_imam_hatip_darbesi_.html

Bölgedeki tek ortaokulu imam hatip yaptılar, öğrenciler ilkokula taşındı

Publish Date: Friday, June 17, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/552983/Bolgedeki_tek_ortaokulu_imam_hatip_yaptilar_ogrenciler_ilkokula_tasindi.html

Liselilerden imam hatibe karşı barikat

Publish Date: Tuesday, September 20, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/602818/Liselilerden_imam_hatibe_karsi_barikat.html

Velilerin 'imam hatip' isyanı

Publish Date: Tuesday, October 4, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/foto/foto_galeri/609930/1/Velilerin_imam_hatip_isyani_Bu_karardan_donun.html

Kadıköy'de İmam Hatip protestosu

Publish Date: Monday, August 25, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/110225/Kadikoy_de_imam_Hatip_protestosu.html

Kabataş Erkek Lisesi Müdür Yardımcısı: Bütün okulların imam hatip olma zamanı geldi

Publish Date: Tuesday, October 11, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/613860/Kabatas_Erkek_Lisesi_Mudur_Yardimcisi_Butun_okullarin_imam_hatip_olma_zamani_geldi.html

İmam hatiplere ayrıcalık broşürüne soruşturma

Publish Date: Monday, June 12, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/759441/imam_hatiplere_ayrivalik_brosurune_sorusturma.html

MEB sınır tanımıyor

Publish Date: Sunday, June 25, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/767852/MEB_sinir_tanimiyor.html

İmam hatip kaydı müftülüklerle

Publish Date: Wednesday, July 5, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/774143/imam_hatip_kaydi_muftuluklere.html

MEB, tatil dinlemiyor: Yaz kış imam hatip

Publish Date: July 6, 2017, Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/774996/MEB_tatil_dinlemiyor_Yaz_kis_imam_hatip.html

Valiliklerin imam hatip yetkisi yok, teklifi var

Publish Date: Tuesday, August 15, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/803276/Valiliklerin_imam_hatip_yetkisi_yok_teklifi_var.html

Bir gün savcı olacaklar

Author: Işık Kansu

Publish Date: Wednesday, January 25, 2012

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/315756/Bir_gun_savci_olacaklar.html

İzmir'de imam hatip promosyonu: Öğrenci çekmek için para dağıtacaklar

Publish Date: September 1, 2017, Friday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/815185/izmir_de_imam_hatip_promosyonu_Ogrenci_cekme_icin_para_dagitacaklar.html

Tek seçenek imam hatip lisesi

Publish Date: September 14, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/823135/Tek_secenek_imam_hatip_lisesi.html

Bakan açıkladı: TEOG sınavı yapılmayacak... Artık tüm yollar İmam Hatip'e çıkıyor

Publish Date: September 19, 2017 Tuesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/826632/Bakan_acikladi_TEOG_sinavi_yapilmayacak..._Artik_tum_yollar_imam_Hatip_e_cikiyor.html

Ahret promosyonlu imam hatip

Publish Date: September 21, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/828349/Ahret_promosyonlu_imam_hatip.html

Aslan payı imam hatibe

Publish Date: Wednesday November 8, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/861762/Aslan_payi_imam_hatibe.html

AKP'nin projesi: 'Nitelik'ten İHL çıktı

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 14, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/865516/AKP_nin_projesi_Nitelik_ten_iHL_cikti.html

Yeni liseye giriş raporu: İmam hatip tek seçenek

Publish Date: January 31, 2018 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/916506/Yeni_liseye_giris_raporu_imam_hatip_tek_secenek.html

Öğrenciler, dini içerikli dersleri seçmeye zorlanıyor: 'Artık tüm okullar imam hatip oldu

Publish Date: February 9, 2018, Friday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/922673/Ogrenciler_dini_icerikli_dersleri_secmeye_zorlaniyor_Artik_tum_okullar_imam_hatip_oldu.html

Sahrayıcedid, imam hatip lisesine dönüştürülmek istenen Anadolu Lisesi için buluşuyor

Publish Date: Monday, March 12, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/941346/Sahrayıcedid_imam_hatip_lisesine_donusturulmek_istenen_Anadolu_Lisesi_icin_bulusuyor.html

Gözcübaba Anadolu Lisesi velilerinden tepki eylemi

Publish Date: Saturday, March 17, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/944218/Gozcubaba_Anadolu_Lisesi_velilerinden_tepki_eylemi.html

Zorla İmam-Hatip

Publish Date: March 29, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/950112/Zorla_imam_hatip.html

Kampanya başlatıldı... İstinyeliler imam hatip istemiyor

Publish Date: April 11, 2018 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/956583/Kampanya_baslatildi..._istinyeliler_imam_hatip_istemiyor.html

MEB LGS sınav kılavuzu... Listede 220 Anadolu, 298 İmam Hatip var

Publish Date: April 11, 2018 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/956668/MEB_LGS_sinav_kilavuzu..._Listede_220_Anadolu_298_imam_hatip_var.html

Her yer imam, her yer hatip! MEB imam hatipleri kılavuzda 'nitelikli' yaptı

Publish Date: April 12, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/956785/Her_yer_imam_her_yer_hatip_MEB_imam_hatipleri_kilavuzda_nitelikli_yapti.html

Bakanlık imam hatibe doymuyor

Publish Date: Sunday, April 15, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/958420/Bakanlik_imam_hatibe_doymuyor.html

'Özel'e ve İHL'ye öncelik

Publish Date: June 9, 2018 Saturday

[http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/992835/Ozel_e_ve_iHL_ye_oncelık.html](http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/992835/Ozel_e_ve_iHL_ye_onceлик.html)

AKP, imam hatiplilere verdikçe veriyor

Publish Date: 30 January 2014 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/35469/AKP_imam_hatiplilere_verdikce_veriyor.html

Yeni Türkiye'nin Mayası İmam-Hatip mi?

Author: Ahmet İnel

Thursday, April 30, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/265787/Yeni_Turkiye_nin_Mayasi_imam-Hatip_mi_.html

İmam-hatipten kaçanlar Galatasaray kuyruğunda

Author: Tayfun Atay

Publish Date: May 23, 2018 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/980845/imam-hatipten_kacanlar_Galatasaray_kuyrugunda.html

Anaokulunda 'değerler eğitimi' değil, 'imam hatipliler eğitimi'

Publish Date: October 7, 2017 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/839991/Anaokulunda_degerler_egitimi_degil_imam_hatipliler_egitimi_.html

Hahambaşı'nın torunu 'imam hatip'e

Publish Date: Sunday, August 31, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/112909/Hahambasi_nin_torunu_imam_hatip_e.html

LGS sonrası tartışmalar hızlandı: Yüz binlerce öğrenci kendilerini İmam Hatip ya da Meslek liselerinde mi bulacak?

Publish Date: June 28, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1011856/LGS_sonrasi_tartismalar_hizlandi_Yuz_binlerce_ogrenci_kendilerini_imam_Hatip_ya_da_Meslek_liselerinde_mi_bulacak_.html

AKP'nin imam hatip sevdası: Okulların sayısı arttı kontenjan azaldı

Publish Date: Saturday, June 30, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1013310/AKP_nin_imam_hatip_sevdasi_Okullarin_sayisi_artti_kontenjan_azaldi.html

Burs için imam hatip lisesi şartı

Publish Date: July 12, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1023973/Burs_icin_imam_hatip_lisesi_sarti.html

784 günlük 'dönüştürülme' direnişi kazandı

Publish Date: July 24, 2018 Tuesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1035198/784_gunluk_donusturulme_direnisi_kazandi.html

LGS sonuçlarına öğrencilerden tepkiler: Amacınız imam hatipleri doldurmak ve eğitimden soğutmak

Monday, July 30, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1041117/LGS_sonuclarina_ogrencilerden_tepkiler_Amaciniz_imam_hatipleri_doldurmak_ve_egitimden_sogutmak.html

İmam hatip projesi çöktü: 200 bin öğrenci sistem dışında kaldı

Publish Date: Tuesday, July 31, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1041471/imam_hatip_projesi_coktu_200_bin_ogrenci_sistem_disinda_kaldi.html

AKP'nin imam hatip hassasiyeti: Kıyamadılar

Publish Date: Wednesday, August 8, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1048956/AKP_nin_imam_hatip_hassasiyeti_Kiyamadilar.html

İmam hatip kader değil, Anadolu lisesi istiyorlar

Publish Date: Friday, 17 August 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1057529/imam_hatip_kader_degil_Anadolu_lisesi_istiyorlar.html

MEB'de aslan payı imam hatip ve Bilal Erdoğan'ın TÜGVA'sına

Publish Date: August 18, 2018 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1058585/MEB_de_aslan_payi_imam_hatip_ve_Bilal_Erdogan_in_TUGVA_sina.html

'Müze olacak' diye boşaltıldı, imam hatip yapıldı

Publish Date: Friday, August 24, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1063241/Muze_olacak_diy_e_bosaltildi_imam_hatip_yapildi.html

İHL'den Anadolu'ya akın: MEB açıyor veli kaçıyor

Publish Date: September 9, 2018 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1077513/iHL_den_Anadolu_ya_akin_MEB_aciyor_veli_kaciyor.html

Okul açmak için öğrenci şartı Anadolu lisesinde var, imam hatipte yok

Publish Date: Monday, September 10, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1078947/Okul_acmak_icin_ogrenci_sarti_Anadolu_lisesinde_var_imam_hatipte_yok.html

'İmam hatip ve meslek lisesi tercih etmediğim için yerleşemedim'

Publish Date: Monday, September 10, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1079098/imam_hatip_ve_meslek_lisesi_tercih_etmedigim_icin_yerlesemedim.html

İmam hatip israfı

Publish Date: September 20, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1088032/imam_hatip_israfi.html

Ya imam hatip ya açık lise

Publish Date: September 20, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1088119/Ya_imam_hatip_ya_acik_lise.html

İmam hatip dayatması

Author: Ali Sirmen

Publish Date: Friday, September 21, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/1089267/imam_hatip_dayatmasi.html

Milli Eğitim Bakanı, imamlar ve ötekiler

Author: Özdemir İnce

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 27, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/1152528/Milli_Egitim_Bakani_imamlar_ve_otekiler.html

Hafız ol lisede yerin hazır

Publish Date: July 30, 2014 Wednesday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/99919/Hafiz_ol_lisede_yerin_hazir.html

'Hafız'a sınava girmeden kontenjan kıyağı

Publish Date: Monday, July 11, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/565080/Hafiz_a_sinava_girmeden_kontenjan_kiyagi.html

TÜBİTAK'tan imam hatiplere ödül yağdı

Publish Date: Tuesday, April 25, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/727668/TUBITAK_tan_imam_hatiplere_odul_yagdi.html

YKS'ye İmam-Hatip düzenlemesi

Publish Date: November 11, 2017 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/863854/YKS_ye_imam_hatip_duzenlemesi.html

Anıtkabir'in karşısına imam hatip

Publish Date: Wednesday, November 19, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/143413/Anitkabir_in_karsisina_imam_hatip.html

Konya'da İmam-Hatip dayatması

Publish Date: Tuesday, April 14, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/253737/Konya_da_imam_hatip_dayatmasi.html

İmam hatip lisesinde 'Atatürk posterleri' krizi

Publish Date: Saturday, April 23, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/520857/imam_hatip_lisesinde_Ataturk_posterleri_krizi.html

1 Mayıs'ta İmam Hatip pankartı kriz çıkardı

Publish Date: Sunday, May 1, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/525441/1_Mayis_ta_imam_Hatip_pankarti_kriz_cikardi.html

İmam hatiplere İngilizce hazırlık

Publish Date: Thursday, October 27, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/621959/imam_hatiplere_ingilizce_hazirlik.html

İşte 'Yeni Türkiye'nin eğitim sistemi: Sınıfta slogan atıp tekbir getirdiler

Publish Date: Wednesday, December 14, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/645089/iste_Yeni_Turkiye_nin_egitim_sistemi_Sinifta_slogan_atip_tekbir_getirdiler.html

İmam hatip Müdürü'nden laikliğe küfür: Ne kadar hırsız, p... varsa laiktir

Publish Date: January 5, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/655551/imam_hatip_Muduru_nden_laiklige_kufur_Ne_kadar_hirsiz_p..._varsa_laiktir.html

Laikliğe küfreden İmam hatip müdürü açığa alındı

Publish Date: Monday, January 9, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/657753/Laiklige_kufreden_imam_hatip_muduru_aciga_alindi.html

MEB'e göre bilimin yolu Arapça'dan geçiyor

Publish Date: Tuesday, January 10, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/657822/MEB_e_gore_bilimin_yolu_Arapca_dan_geciyor.html

Ataköy'de spor kulübü yıkılıp yerine imam hatip yapılacak

Publish Date: January 12, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/659052/Atakoy_de_spor_kulubu_yikilip_yerine_imam_hatip_yapilacak.html

‘İmam Hatip müfredatını okuyan genç 2 gömlek sonra potansiyel İŞİD’cidir’

Publish Date: Friday, January 13, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/659800/imam_Hatip_mufredatini_okuyan_genc_2_gomlek_sonra_potansiyel_ISID_cidir_.html

İstanbul Valisi Şahin: İmam hatip neslinde çok fazla radikal nesil çıkmadı

Publish Date: Friday, January 20, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/663159/istanbul_Valisi_Sahin_imam_hatip_neslinde_cok_fazla_radikal_nesil_cikmadi.html

Andımız yasaklandı ama salavat serbest

Publish Date: Monday, May 8, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/735997/Andimiz_yasaklandi_ama_salavat_serbest.html

Medrese gibi imam hatip lisesi

Publish Date: October 8, 2017 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/840112/Medrese_gibi_imam_hatip_lisesi.html

Medreseler diriliyor

Publish Date: Saturday, October 14, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/844313/Medreseler_diriliyor.html

Kavgaları bitmedi... Atatürk için ölüm fetvası çıkaran Şeyhülislamın adını okula verdiler

Publish Date: Wednesday, November 15, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/866168/Kavgalari_bitmedi..._Ataturk_icin_olum_fetvasi_cikaran_Seyhulislamini_adini_okula_verdiler.html

Memur Sen Başkanından Mustafa Sabri tabelasının indirilmesine tepki: Yüreklerden inmez

Publish Date: November 16, 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/867066/Memur_Sen_Baskanindan_Mustafa_Sabri_tabelasinin_indirilmesine_tepki_Yureklerden_inmez.html

Ankara’da bir lise koridorunda “harem-selamlık” uygulama

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 28, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/875232/Ankara_da_bir_lise_koridorunda_harem-selamlik_uygulama.html

Öğretmenler ve öğrenciler askeri kıyafet giyerek sela okudu ve slogan attı

Publish Date: Monday February 19, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/929383/Ogrencilere_askeri_kiyafet_giydirildi_ve_sela_okutuldu.html

Antalya'da skandal görüntüler: Öğrencilere bahçede tekbir getirttiler

Publish Date: Tuesday, February 20, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/930651/Antalya_da_skandal_goruntuler_Ogrencilere_bahcede_tekbir_getirttiler.html

Atatürk maskını depoya attılar

Publish Date: Wednesday, March 21, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/945930/Ataturk_maskini_depoya_attilar.html

Böyle başa böyle basın

Author: Işık Kansu

Publish Date: Monday, September 1, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/koseyazisi/113035/Boyle_Basa_Boyle_Basin.html

MEB'den karma eğitime darbe

Publish Date: Tuesday, September 11, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1079070/MEB_den_karma_egitime_darbe.html

MEB'in bitmeyen tarikat sevdası: Sarıklı cübbeli ders

Publish Date: September 29, 2018 Saturday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1097169/MEB_in_bitmeyen_tarikat_sevdasi_Sarikli_cubbeli_ders.html

Karma eğitimi kaldırdılar!

Publish Date: Thursday, October 4, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1101715/Karma_egitimi_kaldirdilar_.html

İşte okullarda okuttukları and

Publish Date: 4 November 2018 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video_haber/1130937/iste_okullarda_okuttuklari_and.html

İmam hatipler başarı fakiri

Publish Date: Wednesday, March 2, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/490434/imam_hatipler_basari_fakiri.html

5 imam hatipliden 1'i üniversiteye

Publish Date: Wednesday, August 9, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/799205/5_imam_hatipliden_1_i_universiteye.html

CHP'den çarpıcı rapor: İHL dayatması tutmadı

Publish Date: Sunday, November 12, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/864421/CHP_den_carpici_rapor_iHL_dayatmasi_tutmadi.html

Reuters'ten 'imam hatip' dosyası: Öğrenci sayısı 5 kat arttı ama başarı yok

Publish Date: January 25, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/913104/Reuters_ten_imam_hatip_dosyasi_Ogrenci_sayisi_5_kat_artti_ama_basari_yok.html

Hükümetin imam hatip hedefleri çakıldı

Publish Date: Saturday, February 3, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/918759/Hukümetin_imam_hatip_hedefleri_cakildi.html

İHL'de takdir var ama başarı yok

Publish Date: March 4, 2018 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/937287/iHL_de_takdir_var_ama_basari_yok.html

'İmam hatipliler deizme kayıyor'

Publish Date: Tuesday, April 3, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/952691/_imam_hatipliler_deizme_kayiyor_.html

İHL'den toplu kaçış: Tek tek kayıtlarını alıyorlar

Publish Date: Tuesday, August 28, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1066207/iHL_den_toplu_kacis_Tek_tek_kayitlarini_aliyorlar.html

Bu yıl imam hatip yapıldı, öğrenci bulamayınca açılmadı

Publish Date: Monday, September 24, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/1091732/Bu_yil_imam_hatip_yapildi_ogrenci_bulamayinca_aci_lamadi.html

Kız öğrencileri taciz eden şahıs yakalandı

Publish Date: Monday, May 5, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/68353/Kiz_ogrencileri_taciz_eden_sahis_yakalandi.html

İmam hatip lisesi öğretmenine tecavüz suçlaması

Publish Date: Thursday, August 21, 2014

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/108375/imam_hatip_lisesi_ogretmenine_tecavuz_suclamasi.html

Kız imam hatip lisesinde silahlı bıçaklı kavga

Publish Date: Tuesday, March 17, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/232033/Kiz_imam_hatip_lisesinde_silahli_bicakli_kavga.html

İmam hatip lisesinde cinsel istismar skandalı

Publish Date: Thursday, January 21, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/467407/imam_hatip_lisesinde_cinsel_istismar_skandal.html

İmam Hatip yönetimi polisten önce aileyi aradı: Kızınız tecavüze uğradı

Publish Date: Wednesday, March 2, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/490916/imam_Hatip_yonetimi_polisten_once_aileyi_aradi_Kiz_iniz_tecavuze_ugradi.html

İmam Hatip lisesi öğretmeninden öğrencilerine cinsel istismar

Publish Date: Thursday, January 21, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/467407/imam_hatip_lisesinde_cinsel_istismar_skandal.html

İmam Hatip'te çocuk istismarı

Publish Date: Saturday, October 8, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/612421/imam_Hatip_te_cocuk_istismari.html

30 öğrenciye cinsel istismarın üstü örtülüyor!

Publish Date: Monday, November 7, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/627199/30_ogrenciye_cinsel_istismarin_ustu_ortuluyor_.html

İmam Hatip'te gerçekleşen tacizi duyurmak da yasak oldu

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 8, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/627852/imam_Hatip_te_gerceklesen_tacizi_duyurmak_da_yasak_oldu.html

Adıyaman'daki istismar Karaman'ın kopyası

Friday, November 11, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/629602/Adiyaman_daki_istismar_Karaman_in_kopyasi.html

Çanakkale Ayvacık'da imam Hatip öğretmeni, öğrencisine cinsel tacizden tutuklandı

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 15, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/631150/Canakkale_Ayvacik_da_imam_Hatip_ogretmeni_ogrencisine_cinsel_tacizden_tutuklandi.html

Adıyaman'da imam hatip yurdundaki cinsel istismar skandalının detayları ortaya çıktı: 20 öğrenci istismar edildi

Publish Date: Wednesday, November 23, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/634866/Adiyaman_da_imam_hatip_yurdundaki_cinsel_istismar_skandalinin_detaylari_ortaya_cikti_20_ogrenci_istismar_edildi.html

İmam Hatipte 18 çocuğun tecavüzüne göz yuman müdür ve yardımcısının 1 günlük maaşı kesildi

Publish Date: Friday, November 17, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/867763/imam_Hatipte_18_cocugun_tecavuzune_goz_yuman_mudur_ve_yardimcisinin_1_gunluk_maasi_kesildi.html

İmam Hatip Lisesi öğretmeni 17 yaşındaki öğrencisini kaçırdı

Publish Date: Friday, November 17, 2017

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/867763/imam-Hatipte-18-cocugun-tecavuzune-goz-yuman-mudur-ve-yardimcisinin-1-gunluk-maasi-kesildi.html>

İmam Hatip Lisesi öğretmeni Ercan Harmancı, okuldaki beden eğitimi dersine çıkarak kız öğrencileri görünce tahrik olduğunu yazdı

Publish Date: Monday, December 25, 2017

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/893023/imam-Hatip-ogretmeninden-skandal-paylasimlar-Ya-benim-cok-sapik-duygularim-var-ya-da....html>

Sapıkça paylaşım yapan imam hatip öğretmeni görevinden alındı

Publish Date: Wednesday, December 27, 2017

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/893969/Sapikca-paylasim-yapan-imam-hatip-ogretmeni-gorevinden-alindi.html>

Sapıkça paylaşımında bulunan imam hatip öğretmenin kitabını Ensar Vakfı basmış

Publish Date: 28 December 2017 Thursday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/894508/Sapikca-paylasimda-bulunan-imam-hatip-ogretmenin-in-kitabini-Ensar-Vakfi-basmis.html>

Diyarbakır'da cinsel istismar skandalı

Publish Date: January 6, 2018 Saturday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/899817/Diyarbakir-da-cinsel-istismar-skandal.html>

Öğrencisine cinsel istismarda bulunduğunu itiraf eden imam hatip öğretmeni: Şeriata gidelim

January 6, 2018 Saturday

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/899666/Ogrencisine-cinsel-istismarda-bulundugunu-itiraf-eden-imam-hatip-ogretmeni-Seriata-gidelim.html>

Öğrencilere tacizde bulunan kantinciye, 16 yıl hapis cezası

Publish Date: Monday, January 8, 2018

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/900706/Ogrencilere-tacizde-bulunan-kantinciye-16-yil-hapis-cezasi.html>

Öğrencisine cinsel istismarda bulunup 'Şeriata gidelim' diyen imam hatip öğretmene iyi hal indirimi

Publish Date: Tuesday, January 30, 2018

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/916318/Ogrencisine-cinsel-istismarda-bulunup-Seriata-gidelim-diyen-imam-hatip-ogretmene-iyi-hal-indirimi.html>

Hocası yorgandan kendisi eşofmandan tahrik olan imam hatip öğretmeni, memurluğa devam edecek

Publish Date: Friday, March 9, 2018

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/940036/Hocasi-yorgandan-kendisi-esofmandan-tahrik-olan-imam-hatip-ogretmeni-memurluga-devam-edecek.html>

İmam hatipte rezalet... Derste ilahi okuyup, ettikleri küfürleri canlı yayınladılar

Publish Date: Wednesday, March 14, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/video/video/942405/imam_hatipte_rezalet..._Derste_ilahi_okuyup_ettikleri_kufurleri_canli_yayinladilar.html

Öğrencisiyle ilişkisi olan eşini boşadı

Publish Date: Thursday, May 10, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/971795/Ogrencisiyle_iliskisi_olan_esini_bosadi.html

Erdoğan'ın açtığı İmam hatip lisesinde dayak skandalı

Publish Date: Monday, May 23, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/538174/Erdogan_in_actigi_imam_hatip_lisesinde_dayak_skandal.html

İmam hatipte ayrımcılık üzerine ayrımcılık: Önce başını ört

Publish Date: Thursday, October 27, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/621962/imam_hatipte_ayrimcilik_uzerine_ayrimcilik_Once_basini_ort.html

İmam hatip öğrencisi, öğretmenleri erkek arkadaşı olduğunu öğrenince canına kıydı

Publish Date: Friday, December 30, 2016

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/653102/imam_hatip_ogrencisi_ogretmenleri_erkek_arkadas_olduğunu_ogrenince_canina_kiydi.html

İmam hatip müdüründen skandal paylaşım: 28 yetim çocuğa sahip çıkıyoruz. İşte o çocuklar

Publish Date: 23 November 2017 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/871807/imam_hatip_mudurunden_skandal_paylasim_28_yetim_cocuga_sahip_cikiyoruz_iste_o_cocuklar.html

İmam hatip öğretmeni: Zina edecek kadar yaşı büyük evlenmeye geldi mi yaşı küçük

Publish Date: Tuesday, January 9, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/901606/imam_hatip_ogretmeni_Zina_edecek_kadar_yasi_buyuk_evlenmeye_geldi_mi_yasi_kucuk.html

Eğitimci!!! 7 öğrenciyi yuhalattı

Publish Date: March 4, 2018 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/619146/Egitimci_7_ogrenciyi_yuhalatti.html

Taciz sanığı öğretmenden skandal savunma: Şeytan yanılttıysa

Publish Date: Tuesday, November 6, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1133093/Taciz_sanigi_ogretmenden_skandal_savunma_Seytan_yanilttiysa.html

Akit kafası: İmam Hatip artarsa darbecilik azalır

Publish Date: Wednesday, September 12, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/1080284/Akit_kafasi_imam_Hatip_artarsa_darbecilik_azalir.html

İdare mahkemesine OHAL ayarı: İmam hatip atamasını iptal eden hakimın başkanlığı alındı

Publish Date: Saturday, July 15, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/781621/idare_mahkemesine_OHAL_ayari_imam_hatip_atamasini iptal eden hakimın_baskanligi_alindi.html

Erdoğan: Cenaze yıkayacak imam yoktu

Publish Date: Friday, September 29, 2017

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/834522/Erdogan_Cenaze_yikayacak_imam_yoktu.html

'Kraldan çok kralcılar partimize zarar veriyor diyen AKP'li vekil: Talep olmadan imam hatip açmak israftır

Publish Date: October 1, 2017 Sunday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/835646/Kraldan_cok_kralcilar_partimize_zarar_veriyor_diyen_AKP_li_vekil_Talep_olmadan_imam_hatip_acmak_israftir.html

Erdoğan'ın annesinin ismini taşıyan İHL'nin yanındaki yurt binası, bedelsiz TÜRGEV'e verildi

Publish Date: Friday, 9 February 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/cevre/922702/Erdogan_in_annesinin_ismini_tasiyan_iHL_nin_yanindaki_yurt_binasi_bedelsiz_TURGEV_e_verildi.html

ÖNDER'den imam hatip öğrencilerine "Afrin Operasyonu" konulu savaş siyaseti kampı

Publish Date: Wednesday 14 February 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/egitim/926003/ONDER_den_imam_hatip_ogrencilerine_Afrin_Operasyonu_konulu_savas_siyaseti_kampi.html

Muharrem İnce'den Erdoğan'a 'imam hatip' yanıtı

Publish Date: June 7, 2018 Thursday

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/991603/Muharrem_ince_den_Erdogan_a_imam_hatip_yaniti.html

YSK'de imam hatip krizi: Zaten halkın yarısı güvenmiyor

Publish Date: Tuesday, July 31, 2018

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/1041480/YSK_de_imam_hatip_krizi_Zaten_halkın_yarisi_guvenmiyor.html

Kılıçdaroğlu'ndan "İmam hatipleri kapatacak" iddiasına yanıt

Publish Date: Tuesday, April 28, 2015

http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/264345/Kilicdaroglu_ndan_imam_hatipleri_kapatacak_iddiasina_yanit.html

İlker Başbuğ'dan imam hatiplere destek

Publish Date: Monday, May 23, 2016

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/turkiye/538342/ilker-Basbug-dan-imam-hatiplere-destek.html>

Kılıçdarođlu'nu ziyaret eden Genç İmam Hatipliler: Biz hiç kimsenin arka bahçesi değiliz

Publish Date: Thursday, April 19, 2018

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/960908/Kilicdaroglu-nu-ziyaret-eden-Genc-imam-Hatipliler-Biz-hic-kimsenin-arka-bahcesi-degiliz.html>

Bozdağ'dan deizm açıklaması

Publish Date: Saturday, April 21, 2018

<http://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/siyaset/961973/Bozdag-dan-deizm-aciklamasi.html>

“İmam Hatiplerin Önündeki Askeri Okul Engeli Kalkmalı”

Publish Date: August 3, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/08/03/imam-hatiplerin-onundeki-askeri-okul-engeli-kalkmali>

Son Dakika: Tenzile Erdoğan Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'nin mezuniyet töreni

Publish Date: June 20, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/06/20/son-dakika-tenzile-erdogan-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesinin-mezuniyet-toreni>

İmam Hatip'i tercih için neden çok

Publish Date: July 6, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/07/06/imam-hatipi-tercih-icin-neden-cok>

İmam Hatipte geleceğin Bill Gates'lerini yetiştiriyor

Author: Pınar Yıldız Yüksel

Publish Date: November 14, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/pazar/2018/10/14/imam-hatipte-gelecegin-bill-gateslerini-yetistiriyor>

Etlik İmam Hatip her yönüyle örnek

Publish Date: November 10, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2014/11/10/etlik-imam-hatip-her-yonuyle-ornek>

En renkli lise, Author: Mesut Altun

Publish Date: May 11, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/pazar/2014/05/11/en-renkli-lise>

Çocuk üniversitesi imam hatipli mezunlarını Verdi

Publish Date: July 2, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/07/02/cocuk-universitesi-imam-hatipli-mezunlarini-verdi>

Eğitimde Çağ Atladılar

Publish Date: May 27, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2016/05/27/egitimde-cag-atladilar>

İmam Hatip öğrencileri Harvard'dan ders alıyor

Publish Date: October 6, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2017/10/06/imam-hatip-ogrencileri-harvarddan-ders-aliyor>

5 yıldızlı İHL tanıtımı

Publish Date: July 19, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2016/07/19/5-yildizli-ihl-tanitimi>

Tevfik İleri Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'nde "teknolojik eğitim"

Publish Date: January 24, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2017/01/24/tevfik-ileri-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesinde-teknolojik-egitim>

Kahramanmaraş'ta 3'üncü proje imam hatip lisesi

Publish Date: December 15, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2017/12/15/kahramanmarasta-3uncu-proje-imam-hatip-lisesi>

Tenzile annenin emanetlerine Harvard'dan ders

Author: Safure Cantürk

Publish Date: September 10, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/09/10/tenzile-annenin-emanetlerine-harvarddan-ders>

Aydın İmam Hatip Lisesi TÜBİTAK Proje Yarışmalarına İki Proje ile Katılıyor,

Publish Date: March 26, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/aydin/2015/03/26/aydin-imam-hatip-lisesi-tubitak-proje-yarismalarina-iki-proje-ile-katiliyor>

Su altı drone'u barbarous görev bekliyor!

Publish Date: May 5, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/teknoloji/2017/05/05/su-alti-droneu-barbaros-gorev-bekliyor>

Kadrişehir İmam-Hatip Ortaokulu TÜBİTAK Bilim Fuarı Açıldı

Publish Date: April 24, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yozyat/2015/04/24/kadisehri-imamhatip-ortaokulu-tubitak-bilim-fuari-acildi>

İmam Hatipli Öğrenciden Flash Bellekle Çalışan Otomobil

Publish Date: November 11, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/turkiye/imam-hatipli-ogrenciden-flash-bellekle-calisan-otomobil/4>

İmam hatip öğrencilerinin prototip aracı tanıtıldı

Publish Date: December 4, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2017/12/04/imam-hatip-ogrencilerinin-prototip-araci-tanitildi>

Aydın Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'nden büyük başarı

Publish Date: March 1, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egeli/2018/03/01/aydin-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesinden-buyuk-basari>

Adıyaman'daki okullar TÜBİTAK ödülllerinin 7'sini aldı

Publish Date: March 16, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/03/16/adiyamanda-ki-okullar-tubitak-odullerinin-7sini-aldi>

Lise öğrencisinden lazer güdümlü insansız tank prototipi

Publish Date: May 28, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/teknoloji/2018/05/28/lise-ogrencisinden-lazer-gudumlu-insansiz-tank-prototipi>

İmam hatipli mucit

Publish Date: October 21, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2018/10/21/imam-hatipli-mucit>

TEOG'un İmam Hatipli şampiyonları

Publish Date: January 17, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/01/17/teogun-imam-hatipli-sampiyonlari>

Ankara Tefvik İleri İmam Hatip Lisesi üniversiteye öğrenci yerleştirmede yüzde 74 başarılı

Publish Date: September 6, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2018/09/06/ankara-tevfik-ileri-imam-hatip-lisesi-universiteye-ogrenci-yerlestirmede-yuzde-74-basarili>

TEOG'un İmam Hatipli şampiyonları

Publish Date: January 17, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/01/17/teogun-imam-hatipli-sampiyonlari>

Proje müfredat uygulanan İHL'nin başarısı yükseldi

Publish Date: April 15, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2017/04/15/proje-mufredat-uygulanan-ihlnin-basarisi-yukseldi>

İnandı ve başardı

Publish Date: August 19, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2017/08/19/inandi-ve-basardi>

İmam Hatip'li Azra'nın LGS başarısı

Author: Safure Cantürk

Publish Date: June 27, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2018/06/27/imam-hatipli-azranin-lgs-basarisi>

İmam Hatip'ten Rus şampiyon

Author: Safure Cantürk

Publish Date: June 29, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2018/06/29/imam-hatipten-rus-sampiyon>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan'dan Azra'ya tebrik

Publish Date: July 2, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2018/07/02/cumhurbaskani-erdogandan-azraya-tebrik>

Saray İmam Hatip Öğrencileri Kitap Okuyor

Publish Date: November 4, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/tekirdag/2015/11/04/saray-imam-hatip-ogrencileri-kitap-okuyor>

Başarılı İmam Hatip öğrencisi şiir kitabı çıkardı

Publish Date: February 15, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/02/15/basarili-imam-hatip-ogrencisi-siir-kitabi-cikardi>

Taşköprü'de 'Seyyar Okurlar' kitap okudu

Publish Date: November 2, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/11/02/taskoprude-seyyar-okurlar-kitap-okudu>

Kağızman Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi İl Birincisi

Publish Date: March 24, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kars/2015/03/24/kagizman-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesi-il-birincisi>

İmam-Hatip öğrencilerinden Kudüs kareografisi

Publish Date: December 11, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2017/12/11/imam-hatip-ogrencilerinden-kudus-kareografisi>

Şule Mete Tetik İmam Hatip Ortaokulu'ndan Kutsal Emanetler Sergisi

Publish Date: April 20, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kutahya/2015/04/20/sule-mete-tetik-imam-hatip-ortaokulundan-kutsal-emanetler-sergisi>

Samsatlı İmam Hatip Öğrencileri Kutlu Doğumu Coşkuyla Kutladı

Publish Date: April 20, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/adiyaman/2015/04/20/samsatli-imam-hatip-ogrencileri-kutlu-dogumu-coskuyla-kutladi>

Nevşehir Kız İmam Hatip Lisesinden Kutlu Doğum Programı

Publish Date: April 21, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/nevsehir/2015/04/21/nevsehir-kiz-imam-hatip-lisesinden-kutlu-dogum-programi>

İmam-hatiplilere 40 hadis yarışması

Publish Date: June 26, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2016/06/26/imam-hatiplilere-40-hadis-yarismasi>

Dünya birincisi hafız kardeşlere ödül

Publish Date: October 11, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2017/10/11/dunya-birincisi-hafiz-kardeslere-odul>

İmam Hatipler spor oyunlarında muhteşem kapanış

Publish Date: January 12, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/spor/futbol/2018/01/12/imam-hatipler-spor-oyunlarinda-muhtesem-kapanis>

Keykubat Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'nden bir başarı daha

Publish Date: April 7, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kayseri-bolge/2018/04/07/keykubat-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesinden-bir-basari-daha>

Gediz Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi Satranç Turnuvası'nda Birinci Oldu

Publish Date: March 24, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kutahya/2015/03/24/gediz-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesi-satranc-turnuvasinda-birinci-oldu>

İmam hatipten Erasmus rekoru

Publish Date: October 25, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2018/10/25/imam-hatipten-erasmus-rekoru>

İHL Öğretmeninin yazdığı "tasarruf" dilekçesi 81 ilin valiliğine gönderildi

Publish Date: February 4, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/02/04/ihl-ogretmeninin-yazdigi-tasarruf-dilekcesi-81-ilin-valiligine-gonderildi>

İmam hatip lisesli kızlardan 'Atatürk' imzası

Publish Date: November 10, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/karadenizdoguanadolu/2017/11/10/imam-hatip-liseli-kizlardan-ataturk-imzasi>

Arapça münazara şampiyonu Türkiye

Publish Date: April 13, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2018/04/13/rapca-munazara-sampiyonu-turkiye>

İmam hatip lisesi öğrencilerinden sergi

Author: Yaser Çaparoğlu

Publish Date: May 30, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/05/30/imam-hatip-lisesi-ogrencilerinden-sergi>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan İmam Hatiplilerle buluştu

Publish Date: April 28, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/04/28/cumhurbaskani-erdogan-imam-hatiplilerle-bulustu>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan, mezun olduğu okulda konuştu

Publish Date: September 29, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/09/29/cumhurbaskani-erdogan-konusuyor-canli>

Said-i Nursi İmam Hatip Ortaokulu açıldı

Publish Date: March 27, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/turkiye/said-i-nursi-imam-hatip-ortaokulu-acildi>

İmam hatipliler '15 Temmuz' hikayeleri ile yarıştı

Publish Date: September 19, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/09/19/imam-hatipliler-15-temmuz-hikayeleri-ile-yaristi>

Şehit Prof. Dr. Varank'ın adı 'Yamanlar' da yaşayacak

Publish Date: August 4, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/08/04/sehit-prof-dr-varankin-adi-yamanlarda-yasayacak>

FETÖ'cü savcı ve eşinin öğrenciyi darp etme anları kameraya yansıdı

Publish Date: October 18, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/10/18/fetocu-savci-ve-esinin-ogrenciyi-darp-etme-anlari-kameraya-yansidi>

Bağcılar'a 150 kişilik erkek öğrenci yurdu

Publish Date: April 17, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2015/04/17/bagcilara-150-kisilik-erkek-ogrenci-yurdu>

Suriyeli öğrencilere imam hatip lisesi

Publish Date: March 5, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2016/03/05/suriyeli-ogrencilere-imam-hatip-lisesi>

Öğrencilere en değerli eğitim

Publish Date: January 4, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2018/01/04/ogrencilere-en-degerli-egitim>

Çelikhan Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi Hatıra Ormanı Oluşturdu

Publish Date: April 13, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/adiyaman/2015/04/13/celikhan-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesi-hatira-ormani-olusturdu>

İmam hatip öğrencilerinin 'sanki yedim' kardeşliği

Publish Date: January 24, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/aktuel/2017/01/24/imam-hatip-ogrencilerinin-sanki-yedim-kardesligi>

Portakallı birlik mesajı

Publish Date: February 11, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/akdeniz/2017/02/11/portakalli-birlik-mesaji>

Çavdarhisar İmam Hatip Ortaokulu'ndan veli ziyaretleri

Publish Date: December 19, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egeli/2017/12/19/cavdarhisar-imam-hatip-ortaokulundan-veli-ziyaretleri>

Kahta İmam Hatip Lisesi kardeş okuluyla bir araya geldi

Publish Date: January 10, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/01/10/kahta-imam-hatip-lisesi-kardes-okuluyla-bir-araya-geldi>

'Tenzile Ana'nın adı yaşatılacak

Publish Date: February 12, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/02/12/tenzile-ananin-adi-yasat-ilacak>

Ortaokul öğrencilerinden örnek davranış

Publish Date: April 3, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egeli/2018/04/03/ortaokul-ogrencilerinden-ornek-davranis>

İmam Hatipleri Gülen kapattırdı

Publish Date: October 19, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/10/19/imam-hatipleri-gulen-kapattirdi>

"İmam Hatiplerin Önündeki Askeri Okul Engeli Kalkmalı"

Publish Date: August 3, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/08/03/imam-hatiplerin-onundeki-askeri-okul-engeli-kalkmali>

Sözcü'den skandal tweet!

Publish Date: March 16, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/webtv/medya/sozcuden-skandal-tweet>

İmam hatip öğrencisi 2 kız dağa kaçırıldı

Publish Date: June 3, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/06/03/imam-hatip-ogrencisi-2-kiz-daga-kacirildi>

Onedio'dan küstah habercilik: İmam Hatipliler militan

Publish Date: June 14, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/06/14/onediodan-kustah-habercilik-imam-hatipliler-militan>

KKTC'nin ilk İmam-Hatip Lisesi açıldı

Publish Date: October 21, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/10/21/kktcnin-ilk-imam-hatip-lisesi-acildi>

“Yeni bir çalışma başlatıyoruz”

Publish Date: July 5, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/07/05/yeni-bir-calisma-baslatiyoruz>

Sümeyye Erdoğan: İmam-Hatipler yeni Türkiye'nin manifestosudur

Publish Date: April 11, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/04/11/sumeyye-erdogan-imam-hatipler-yeni-turkiyenin-manifestosudur>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan İmam Hatiplilerle buluştu

Publish Date: April 28, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/04/28/cumhurbaskani-erdogan-imam-hatiplilerle-bulustu>

Kurtulmuş: İmam Hatiplerin önü açık

Publish Date: October 7, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/10/07/kurtulmus-imam-hatiplerin-onu-acik>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan, mezun olduğu okulda konuştu

Publish Date: September 29, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/09/29/cumhurbaskani-erdogan-konusuyor-canli>

Beyşehir Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'ne anlamlı ziyaret

Publish Date: November 8, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/konya-bolge/2017/11/08/beysehir-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesine-anlamli-ziyaret>

Mustafa dedenin azmi 28 Şubat'ı yendi

Publish Date: February 21, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/02/21/mustafa-dedenin-azmi-28-subati-yendi>

Son Dakika: Tenzile Erdoğan Anadolu İmam Hatip Lisesi'nin mezuniyet töreni

Publish Date: June 20, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/06/20/son-dakika-tenzile-erdogan-anadolu-imam-hatip-lisesinin-mezuniyet-toreni>

Bekir Bozdağ'dan Muharrem İnce'ye 'eğitim sistemi' cevabı

Publish Date: May 31, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/05/31/bekir-bozdogdan-muharrem-inceye-egitim-sistemi-cevabi>

Çayyolu İmam Hatip'in 'ilk karne' heyecanı

Publish Date: January 21, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2017/01/21/cayyolu-imam-hatipin-ilk-karne-heyecani>

ÖNDER'den imam hatip okulları tartışmasıyla ilgili açıklama!

Publish Date: June 6, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/06/06/onderden-imam-hatip-okullari-tartismasiyla-igili-aciklama>

Kılıçdaroğlu'nun paketinden imam hatip yasağı çıktı

Publish Date: April 19, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/04/19/kilicdaroglunun-paketinden-imam-hatip-yasagi-cikti>

Paralel Yapı 'cami' dedi ama AVM yaptı

Author: Nazif Karaman

Publish Date: June 29, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/06/29/paralel-yapi-cami-dedi-ama-avm-yapti>

"Yeni bir çalışma başlatıyoruz"

Publish Date: July 5, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/07/05/yeni-bir-calisma-baslatiyoruz>

Cumhurbaşkanı Erdoğan'ın okuduğu o okul yeniden açılıyor

Publish Date: June 16, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ekonomi/2017/06/16/cumhurbaskani-erdoganin-okudugu-o-okul-yeniden-aciliyor>

KKTC'nin ilk İmam-Hatip Lisesi açıldı

Publish Date: October 21, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/10/21/kkctcnin-ilk-imam-hatip-lisesi-acildi>

Kimder İmam Hatip lisesini tercih edenlere 4 yıl burs verilecek

Publish Date: July 9, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kayseri/2015/07/09/kimder-imam-hatip-lisesini-tercih-edenlere-4-yil-burs-verecek>

"İmam Hatiplerin Önündeki Askeri Okul Engeli Kalkmalı"

Publish Date: August 3, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/08/03/imam-hatiplerin-onundeki-askeri-okul-engeli-kalkmali>

Celaleddin Ökten Ödülleri sahiplerini buldu

Publish Date: December 28, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/12/28/celaleddin-okten-odulleri-sahiplerini-buldu>

Süper İmam Hatip Okulları'na talep patlaması

Publish Date: November 15, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2014/11/15/super-imam-hatip-okullarina-talep-patlamasi>

Erdoğan'ı ağlatan kızın rüyası gerçek oldu

Publish Date: July 14, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/07/14/erdogani-aglatan-kizin-ruyasi-gercek-oldu>

Anadolu imam hatip liselerinde doluluk oranı yüzde 84

Publish Date: January 7, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2018/01/07/anadolu-imam-hatip-liselerinde-doluluk-orani-yuzde-84>

En çok tercih edilen lise,

Publish Date: February 25, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/kultur-sanat/2016/02/25/en-cok-tercih-edilen-lise>

“Yeni bir çalışma başlatıyoruz”

July 5, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/07/05/yeni-bir-calisma-baslatiyoruz>

Prof. Dr. Hayrettin Karaman İmam Hatip Lisesi Külliyesi'nin temeli atıldı

Publish Date: June 1, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/corum/2015/06/01/prof-dr-hayrettin-karaman-imam-hatip-lisesi-kulliyesinin-temeli-atildi>

“İmam Hatiplerin Önündeki Askeri Okul Engeli Kalkmalı”

Publish Date: August 3, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/08/03/imam-hatiplerin-onundeki-askeri-okul-engeli-kalkmali>

“Yeni bir çalışma başlatıyoruz”

Publish Date: July 5, 2014

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2014/07/05/yeni-bir-calisma-baslatiyoruz>

Bedel ödemededen zafer kazanılmaz

Publish Date: September 30, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/09/30/bedel-odemededen-zafer-kazanilmaz>

Bekir Bozdağ: Deizm iddiaları, kirli bir operasyon

Publish Date: April 22, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2018/04/22/bekir-bozdag-deizm-iddialari-kirli-bir-operasyon>

İmam Hatip Liselerinin kuruluşunun 66. yıl dönümü kutlandı

Publish Date: October 20, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/marmara/2017/10/20/imam-hatip-liselerinin-kurulusunun-66-yil-donumu-kutlandi>

“İmam Hatiplerin Önündeki Askeri Okul Engeli Kalkmalı”

Publish Date: August 3, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egitim/2016/08/03/imam-hatiplerin-onundeki-askeri-okul-engeli-kalkmali>

Kurtulmuş: İmam Hatiplerin önü açık

Publish Date: October 7, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/10/07/kurtulmus-imam-hatiplerin-onu-acik>

Onedio'dan küstah habercilik: İmam Hatipliler militant

Publish Date: June 14, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/06/14/onediodan-kustah-habercilik-imam-hatipliler-militan>

'İHL mezunu olmaktan hep gurur duydum'

Publish Date: December 28, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2016/12/28/ihl-mezunu-olmaktan-hep-gurur-duydum>

KKTC'nin ilk İmam-Hatip Lisesi açıldı

Publish Date: October 21, 2015

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2015/10/21/kkctcnin-ilk-imam-hatip-lisesi-acildi>

Said-i Nursi İmam Hatip Ortaokulu açıldı

Publish Date: March 27, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/turkiye/said-i-nursi-imam-hatip-ortaokulu-acildi>

Celaleddin Ökten Ödülleri sahiplerini buldu

Publish Date: December 28, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/12/28/celaleddin-okten-odulleri-sahiplerini-buldu>

İmam hatipliler '15 Temmuz' hikayeleri ile yarıştı

Publish Date: September 19, 2017

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2017/09/19/imam-hatipliler-15-temmuz-hikayeleri-ile-yaristi>

Şehit Prof. Dr. Varank'ın adı 'Yamanlar' da yaşayacak,

Publish Date: August 4, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/08/04/sehit-prof-dr-varankin-adi-yamanlarda-yasayacak>

FETÖ'nün okulu, imam hatip ortaokulu oldu

Publish Date: August 14, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2016/08/14/fetonun-okulu-imam-hatip-ortaokulu-oldu>

Maltepe'deki FETÖ okulları İmam Hatip oldu

Publish Date: August 18, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/yasam/2016/08/18/maltepedeki-feto-okullari-imam-hatip-okulu-oldu>

Ömer Halisdemir İmam-Hatip'ten anlamlı program

Publish Date: October 27, 2016

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/ankara-baskent/2016/10/27/omer-halisdemir-imam-hatipten-anlamli-program>

Öğrencilerden Zeytin Dalı koreografisi

Publish Date: February 7, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/egeli/2018/02/07/ogrencilerden-zeytin-dali-harekati-koreografisi>

İmam Hatip öğrencilerinden Mehmetçiğe duygusal şiir

Publish Date: February 28, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/guney/2018/02/28/imam-hatip-ogrencilerinden-mehmetcige-duygusal-siir>

Öğrenciler bedenleriyle Afrin yazdı

Publish Date: March 13, 2018

<https://www.sabah.com.tr/karadenizdoguanadolu/2018/03/13/ogrenciler-bedenleriyle-afrin-yazdi>

6. The United Kingdom

6.1. Background information on the debate selected for the analysis: The Trojan Horse controversy

The Trojan Horse controversy erupted in early 2014, spurring a media frenzy and several government investigations touching the lives of students, parents, the accused, Muslim communities and the greater public. The controversy brought to light tensions within society surrounding the integration of Muslims into modern multicultural Britain. It arose within a context of a shift in government policy from “community cohesion” which was popular in the early 2000s to the Prevent strategy against extremism which saw the securitisation of education and an explicit targeting of Muslim youth as vulnerable to radicalisation. Investigations dragged on until May 2017 when cases against several teachers and staff were dropped due to procedural irregularities. The legacy of the scandal lives on and the debate covered in the media touched on several elements of justice, to be discussed in this report. This section will begin with a chronology of events.

In November 2013, Birmingham City Council received an anonymous letter of correspondence between a Birmingham-based “hardline Islamist” and his acquaintance in Bradford. The letter outlined advice on how to overtake schools to create hard-line Islamic ethos, labelling the operation “Trojan Horse”. The Council sent the letter to the Home Office and the Department for Education (DfE) in December. It was also shared with the West Midlands Police who, after an investigation, handed the matter back to the Council as there were no criminal offences found. In 2014, the documents were leaked to the media and news headlines emerged in March about an “Islamic plot” to overtake schools.

Following the media furore, West Midlands Police, Ofsted, the Department for Education and Birmingham City Council investigated 25 schools in total. At the heart of the investigations were five schools in particular – Park View Academy (along with Nansen Primary and Golden Hillock which were part of the Park View Educational Trust), Oldknow Academy, Saltley School, Adderley Primary and Regents Park Primary. Birmingham City Council commissioned former headteacher Ian Kershaw to write a report on his investigations, and the Department for Education commissioned Peter Clarke to also lead an investigation and publish a report on his findings. The latter was a controversial figure because of his counter-terrorism background which quickly framed the controversy as one of security and extremism (Holmwood 2017). Ofsted also led emergency inspections in 21 schools, placed 5 in special measures and controversially changed its 2012 “outstanding” rating of Park View to inadequate and placed it in special measures (Shackle 2017). There was also a Review Group set up of MPs, councillors and faith leaders which was led by Stephen Rimmer, who been director of Prevent at the Home Office (Miah 2014). The National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL)’s Professional Conduct Panel also investigated several teachers for professional misconduct (Iqbal 2017).

After the wave of investigations, which took place amid government infighting between the Home Office and the Department for Education, conclusions rejected claims of radicalisation and extremism. However, the Kershaw and Clarke Reports – from the Birmingham City Council and Department for Education respectively – did find evidence of an effort to “Islamicise” state schools (Shackle 2017), although what this actually meant given the murky waters of the English education system of faith and non-faith schools is up for debate. The NCTL hearings were discontinued due to procedural errors on the side of the Department for Education and its release of witness statements. Consequently, charges were dropped against headteachers Lindsey Clarke and Razwan Faraz and

others (Pells 2017). However, governor of Park View, Tahir Alam, was banned from teaching and former acting headteacher of Oldknow Academy Jahangir Akbar was sanctioned (Homer 2018).

6.2. Media landscapes

The UK media landscape is dominated by a highly partisan mass circulation press, and public service broadcasting of the BBC. The press agenda has a strong influence on broadcast media. We focused on the news media because of our interest in the Trojan Horse controversy which was very much a current affairs issue, covered in the media as such.

While national newspapers have seen a circulation decline of 25% since 2015, their reach via digital outlets has significantly widened. Although new digital news sites have emerged, their traffic is dwarfed by the online traffic of traditional news outlets. No digital news sites figure in the top ten, and the BBC accounts for 74% of the digital news audience (Media Reform Coalition, 2019). However, despite the dominance of the BBC in this regard, the press plays a key role in setting the news agenda. “The online readerships of some newspapers now greatly surpass printed circulation ... A great deal of influence is attributed to the national press in the public sphere... Research provides convincing evidence that the press agenda exerts a strong influence on the broadcasting agenda” (Julie Firmstone, 2019). This has been labelled ‘intermedia agenda setting’ and is of high relevance in the UK context. For example, Cushion et al. (2016) found that structural constraints meant that broadcasters tended to rely on right leaning newspapers for stories.

To navigate the UK media landscape therefore it is necessary to understand the role of the traditional press and its digital outlets. The UK has a comparatively large national press with 11 national newspapers, however, newspaper ownership in the UK is highly concentrated: three companies own 83% of the national newspaper market (News UK, Daily Mail Group and Reach) (MRC, 2019). Local news ownership is little better, and five companies control 80% of local newspaper titles. While print circulation is falling, digital is rising, and the most read newspaper in the UK (print and digital) is the *Daily Mail*.

The top three circulation newspapers – the *Daily Mail*, the *Guardian* and the *Metro* – reflect the political make-up of the press more generally. The *Daily Mail* is a mid-market newspaper whose readership is associated with a socially conservative stance on a broad range of issues. It is read by more women than men and older adults. The *Guardian*, and its sister Sunday paper, the *Observer*, is a liberal paper, and its readership is more than twice as high among middle class than working class (C2D2) people. Like the *Mail* it has a popular online presence, but its print readership is considerably lower than the *Mail*. However, unlike the *Mail* it is growing its online presence. *The Metro* is the UK’s highest print circulation newspaper, but its online presence is much more limited than the either *The Daily Mail* or *The Guardian*. It is a free sheet often handed out at transport hubs on weekdays. While it is owned by the Daily Mail group it does not endorse a political party and claims to be ‘objective’ in its reporting. There is a growing online-only media presence in the UK, though as noted above this continues to be relatively small compared with the legacy press. Online-only may be more overtly ideological. *The HuffPost*, launched in 2011 in the UK for instance is edited from a leftist political perspective.

Class is a key determinant of newspaper readership. Middle class people read one of the four broadsheets (*The Daily Telegraph*, *The Financial Times*, *The Guardian*, *The Independent*, *The Times*), but notably the main mid-market tabloid, *The Daily Mail*, also has a readership skewed towards this category. The 65+ are much more likely to read

the *Daily Telegraph*, *Daily Mail*, *Daily Express* and *Daily Mirror*. Young people (15-24) favour *The Daily Star* and *The Sun*. *The Times*, *The Guardian* and *The Independent* are read by all age groups, but especially by those between 25 and 54 years old.

6.3. Sampling procedure

The media covered by this study were chosen (**Step 1**) based on their ideological profile, target audience and media type. In particular, an effort was made to balance the representation of political views on the left and right end of the spectrum as well as the centre. In the British context, the political centre usually identifies as liberal and the right as conservative. The left comes in a greater variety of ideological stripes, most of them gravitating around the Labour Party. Previous ETHOS research on Muslims and educational justice has shown that perceptions about Islam are ideologically determined, with UKIP and Conservative voters being much more likely than Labour and Liberal Democratic ones to perceive Islam as incompatible with British values. This has important implications for debates around Muslim schools, which have received political support from Labour governments and Liberal Democrats but have been treated with caution by the Conservative-led governments in power since 2010. Attention was paid to the diversity of target audiences in terms of educational level (upper/middle/lower), age, profession (eg researchers, activists, teachers), cultural background and geographical distribution (national/regional/local). The media sample includes both specialised and generalist newspapers, tabloids and broadsheets, dailies and weeklies, online and printed.

The main search strategy used (**step 2**) was a Google search using keywords such as ‘Trojan Horse’, ‘controversy’, ‘scandal’, ‘Muslims’ and ‘Park View Academy’. Given that many articles available on-line included links to videos which enabled multi-modal analysis, we decided to limit our sample of broadcast media to these videos rather than to search through databases of broadcast media which are harder to access. To balance traditional and new types of media we selected five blogs, three of them led by academics (Discover Society, openDemocracy, LSE Blog), a fourth linked to a generalist weekly (The Spectator) and one specializing in educational issues (The Optimus Blog). Governance structures are mainly corporate but also not-for-profit, sometimes linked to the state or universities. Background research was carried out to ensure representation of market leaders and less widely read publications alike. Except in one case (see below) we did not incorporate user comments into the analysis. The reasons for this choice are that the vast majority of the articles did not receive comments and when they did, these did not add much to the ideas already expressed in the article.

A total of 23 media clips were selected and categorised into right, centre and left categories (**step 3**). Selection criteria included direct and extensive engagement with the Trojan Horse scandal, salience of Muslim or Islam as categories of analysis, wealth of normative arguments provided, complementarity of viewpoints and significance of the source in the national media field. The “right” category covered articles from centre-right, neoconservative and populist sources including *The Daily Mail*, *The Birmingham Mail*, *The Sun*, *The Daily Telegraph*, *The Spectator*, *The Sunday Times* and *The Daily Express*. News sources for the “left” included pieces from *The Guardian*, *Huffington Post*, *Open Democracy*, *Discover Society*, *LSE Blog*, and *The Conversation*. The remaining 8 fell under the political “centre” category and covered analysis written by *BBC News*, *The Independent*, *BBC Asia Network*, *Optimus Education*, *Metro* and *The Teaching Times*. The analysis aimed to be multimodal and it covered both the text and the images of the news articles. It also incorporates video interviews and video clips incorporated into the articles,

as well as one which was posted in the Twitter feed of BBC Asia Network. This video is also the only one whose comments (three) were analysed as a whole with a view to identifying the gist and tone.

6.4. List analysed media clips

- @bbcasiannetwork. 2018. "Do You Remember the Trojan Horse Scandal?" BBC Asia Network. July 26, 2018. <https://twitter.com/bbcasiannetwork/status/1022436994906054656>.
- Baxter, Jacqueline. 2014. "Ofsted's Future at Stake after Trojan Horse Scandal." *The Conversation*. May 1, 2014. <https://theconversation.com/ofsteds-future-at-stake-after-trojan-horse-scandal-25936>.
- Clark, Laura, and Lucy Osborne. 2014. "Revealed: Islamist Plot Dubbed 'Trojan Horse' to Replace Teachers in Birmingham Schools with Radicals." *Daily Mail*, March 7, 2014. <https://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2575759/Revealed-Islamist-plot-dubbed-Trojan-Horse-string-schools-Birmingham-self-styled-Jihad.html>.
- Coughlan, Sean. 2014. "'Disturbing' Findings from Trojan Horse Inquiry." BBC News. July 22, 2014. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/education-28419901>.
- Easton, Mark. 2014. "'Trojan Horse' Scandal - Extreme or Diverse?" BBC News. June 9, 2014. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-27766291>.
- Garner, Richard. 2015. "Trojan Horse: Headteacher Received Death Threats for Speaking out against Homophobia." *The Independent*. May 5, 2015. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/education/schools/trojan-horse-headteacher-received-death-threats-for-speaking-out-against-homophobia-10222271.html>.
- Gilligan, Andrew. 2018. "Look: It's Evil Me Slaying Blameless Trojans." *The Sunday Times*, September 2, 2018. <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/trojan-horse-reviewed-by-andrew-gilligan-the-man-who-helped-report-the-scandal-sh966t2sw>.
- Holmwood, John. 2017. "The Birmingham Trojan Horse Affair: A Very British Injustice." *Open Democracy*. December 13, 2017. <https://www.opendemocracy.net/john-holmwood/birmingham-trojan-horse-affair-very-british-injustice>.
- Homer, Alex. 2018. "'Trojan Horse' Hearings against Teachers and Governor Cost £1.27m." BBC News. August 17, 2018. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-birmingham-45060721>.
- Iqbal, Karamat. 2017. "No More Trojan Horses." *The Optimus Blog*. July 6, 2017. <http://blog.optimus-education.com/no-more-trojan-horses>.
- "Is There an Islamic Conspiracy in Birmingham Schools?" n.d. *Teaching Times*. <https://www.teachingtimes.com/articles/is-there-an-islamic-conspiracy-in-birmingham-schools>.
- Mansfield, Katie. 2016. "School Principal Caught up in Trojan Horse Scandal Is BANNED from Teaching for FIVE YEARS." *Daily Express*, January 5, 2016. <https://www.express.co.uk/news/uk/631491/School-principal-Trojan-Horse-scandal-banned-teaching-five-years>.
- Miah, Shamim. 2014. "Trojan Horse, Ofsted and the 'Prevent'ing of Education." *Discover Society*. July 1, 2014. <https://discoversociety.org/2014/07/01/trojan-horse-ofsted-and-the-preventing-of-education/>.
- Murray, Douglas. 2014a. "Save Our Children from the Islamists." *The Spectator*, June 14, 2014. <https://www.spectator.co.uk/2014/06/save-our-children-from-the-islamists/>.
- Murray, Douglas. 2014b. "British Muslims Must Confront the Truth of the 'Trojan Horse' Schools." *The Spectator Blog*, July 24, 2014. <https://blogs.spectator.co.uk/2014/07/british-muslims-must-confront-the-truth-of-the>

trojan-horse-schools/.

- Oldham, Jeanette. 2014. "Trojan Horse Jihadist Plot to Take over Birmingham Schools." *Birmingham Mail*, March 7, 2014. <https://www.birminghammail.co.uk/news/midlands-news/trojan-horse-jihadist-plot-take-6782881>.
- Pells, Rachael. 2017. "'Trojan Horse' Teachers Cleared of Professional Misconduct after Government Lawyers Admit Errors in the Case." *The Independent*. May 31, 2017. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/education/education-news/trojan-horse-teachers-cleared-professional-misconduct-islamify-park-view-educational-trust-a7764901.html>.
- Pollard, Chris. 2016. "Whistle Blowers Who Exposed Islamic Extremism in Schools Fear for Safety after Their Identities Are Outed to 'Ringleaders.'" *The Sun*, January 1, 2016. <https://www.thesun.co.uk/news/2515593/witnesses-who-exposed-islamic-extremism-in-schools-fear-for-safety-after-their-identities-are-outed-to-ringleaders/>.
- Shackle, Samira. 2017. "Trojan Horse: The Real Story behind the Fake 'Islamic Plot' to Take over Schools." *The Guardian*, September 1, 2017. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/sep/01/trojan-horse-the-real-story-behind-the-fake-islamic-plot-to-take-over-schools>.
- The Huffington Post. 2014. "'Trojan Horse' Birmingham School Trustees Quit Following 'Witch Hunt.'" *The Huffington Post*, July 15, 2014. https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/07/15/trojan-horse-trustees-quit_n_5588128.html?utm_hp_ref=uk-operation-trojan-horse.
- Thomas, Paul. 2015. "Are We Failing to 'Prevent' Extremism amongst British Young People?" LSE Blog. January 20, 2015. <http://blogs.lse.ac.uk/politicsandpolicy/are-we-failing-to-prevent-extremism-amongst-british-young-people/#comments>.
- Timothy, Nick. 2018. "It's a Fiction to Suggest That There Was No Plot by Islamist Hardliners to Take over State Schools." *The Daily Telegraph*, August 9, 2018. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2018/08/09/fiction-suggest-no-plot-islamist-hardliners-take-state-schools/>.
- Weale, Sally. 2018. "Play Shines Light on Trojan Horse 'Islamist Plot' to Run Schools." *The Guardian*, July 23, 2018. <https://www.theguardian.com/stage/2018/jul/23/play-shines-light-on-trojan-horse-islamist-plot-to-run-schools>.

Appendices II – Guidelines to Task 4.4

D4.4 Media Screening Request – Preparation for TASK 4.4

This is a screening request for Task 4.4 focusing on the construction of justice in (social) media. The screening note (2-3 pages) should include: case (the to be analysed debate) description, justification of the choice of the to-be-analysed media and description of a sampling procedure you want to apply to select the to be analysed news items/posts/entries/etc.

Case description:

During the meetings in Coimbra we decided to try to keep some continuity within the WP4, expose the interconnectedness of the various tasks and deliverables and make the workload manageable. Therefore, we decided that Task 4.4 shall focus on a discursive event/media debate related to education (you may consider continuity with cases analysed for D4.3). Please include in the screening a short description of the debate chosen for the analysis:

- what is it about?
- what aspects of justice – representation, recognition, redistribution, other – does it touch upon?
- who are the actors involved & whom do they seem to/claim represent?
- what conflicts of interests, if any, are exposed?
- which minority groups (cultural, social and demographic) are the object (and subject!) of the debates?
- to what extent the claims of the various groups are addressed in the debate?
- how does the specific to-be analysed debate relate to the broader social/political debates and justice related concerns? how does it relate to debates analysed for D4.2 and D4.3)?

When selecting the case please focus on a **relatively recent debate** and/or **debate that recurs in the media with some regularity**. Please keep in mind the task description (below), and in particular the goals of the study:

- *to map the media representation of justice claims – recognitive, representative and redistributive – of various cultural, social and demographic groups*
- *to map the discursive representation of conflicts and tensions between different types of claims and claims of different social categories*

Task 4.4 description according to the ETHOS proposal - keep this in mind when searching for information:

Facilitating the understanding of the dominant/popular representations of justice claims

through analysis of national (social) media content by means of qualitative content analysis, frame analysis and discourse analysis. The task will encompass:

- *providing a guideline for the participating countries for **mapping (social) media representation of justice claims - recognitive, representative and redistributive - of various cultural, social and demographic groups** (by the coordinators)*
- *national studies on the (social) media representation of justice claims of various cultural, social and demographic groups, followed by country reports (ALL countries)*
- *preparing a comparative report on (social) media representation of (minority) claims to justice - recognitive, representative and redistributive – **with special focus on the discursive representation of conflicts and tensions between different types of claims and claims of different social categories** and the consequence such framing may have on the capabilities and functionings of the minorities (by the coordinators)*

Possible cases for the NL (may still change – here just as an example)

We are currently hesitating between two cases:

1. *Segregation in compulsory education* – debate that is taking place right now, stirred by a recent report on the state of public education; the debate touches on the issues of inequality between ethnic and socio-economic groups. Whether or not we will focus on it depends on how vivid it will eventually become; what actors will engage and to what extent it will also touch on broader justice related issues (e.g. curriculum; role various groups in shaping the educational goals and programme, etc.);
2. *Diversity in Higher Education* – this is a recurring debate that touches not only on access of various (minority) groups to higher education; but also the position of various groups (incl. women) within Academia – questions of power, position of elites, drive to keep the status quo; and the demands to de-colonize the curriculum (esp. in humanities and social sciences). The debates are very rich and diverge from our focus in D4.3, which may require extra background work.

Choice media:

In Coimbra we decided to combine the analysis of *traditional* and *social* media. For the purpose of the current research, we define social media as digital platforms for the creation and sharing of user-generated content (e.g. Boyd 2014 quoted in Lomborg 2017).

The choice of specific media to be included in the analysis shall be driven/related to their popularity among the different sections of the population and their ideological profile (and/or whom they claim to represent; whose perspective they claim to reflect/take).

In the screening document, please provide information on:

- the (social) media landscape and use in your country;
- the relative reach of the media ‘outlets’ you want to analyse (e.g. readership and circulation in case of newspapers; number of followers in case of a you tube channel/web blog/etc.);
- status as ‘opinion’ leader (i.e. specific outlets can get the status of the most often quoted medium independent of their actual readership/number of follower);
- the ‘ideological’ profile of the media outlets selected;
- the characteristics of the (target) audience following a specific medium.

When selecting the potential media sources please keep in mind their accessibility for research purposes. For example, access to archives might be difficult and/or costly in case of some outlets (e.g. private TV broadcasters).

LexisNexis is a repository of newspaper articles worldwide; most of the university libraries have access to it. Beware of its limitations: what you can retrieve via LexisNexis is the text of an article but no information about its layout, position on the page, context in the form of the photo’s accompanying it and/or other texts surrounding it/ neighbouring it on the same page, all of which might be of relevance for the interpretation of the text analysed.

(NB this does not mean LexisNexis is useless, but that you have to be aware and clear about the limits of your analysis and/or find ways to get hold of the original article in the paper/digital version of the newspaper).

In case of **traditional media outlets**, such as newspapers, check if and how you can access also the **digital versions** of the articles that would allow you to include in the data also the **on-line comments** by the readers (e.g. a few years ago a very short news article describing how the fellow travellers disturbed by a smell of a homeless man forced him to leave a public bus stirred a very lively exchange of comments on the issue of homelessness and public policy related to it).

Among social data, you may think of including specific (thematic) blogs or Facebook pages related to particular topics issues and or specific entries by public figures that stirred a lot of public reaction/controversy. Again, be attentive to the presence of readers/users comments.

For example, in the Netherlands, Facebook and You Tube constitute the most popular social media (preceded only by WhatsApp). We will therefore most likely include in our analysis (a) Facebook post(s) by a leading news outlet and analyse both the post itself and (a selection of) comments it attracted; we will most likely also include posts/articles on a popular weblog and/or popular YouTube channel and (a selection of) comments it attracted).

When choosing various media outlets keep in mind the **issue of ownership**; big media groups usually own a few traditional and on-line titles, which tend to be similar in tone, if not content. Be careful to diversify your sample.

Sampling method

In media analysis the sampling is sometimes most challenging and has to be well accounted for. In your screening document, please specify what selection criteria will (most likely) inform the sampling of specific news items/posts/entries/ etc. as well as the selection of to be analysed users' comments. E.g. the selection of users'/readers' comments can be related to their content (reference to specific groups or issues), their popularity (those comments which themselves attracted most reactions of other users), be random (every 10th comment), etc.

Multimodality

Important in media analysis is attention not only to the text but also the form in the text/message is presented. Try to reflect how, considering your in-house expertise, you are able to account for the interplay between the different (textual and visual) levels of the messages/entries/posts/video's analysed. Think for example about 'attributes' whose presence may strengthen (negative) stereotypes of specific groups and/or direct the attention of the viewer to particular interpretations/dimensions of justice. Some relevant literature tips on multimodal analysis will be send later.

D4.4 Research Guidelines to Task 4.4: Mapping the construction of justice claims in (social) media

In Task 4.4, we focus on *mapping the construction of justice claims in (traditional) news media and social media*. The study rests on the assumption of an active role of the media in the processes of the (re-)establishment of group boundaries and, in consequence, in reinforcing and/or hindering the (societal) inclusion of various categories in the system of justice relations. This is mostly done through (stereotypical) portrayals of specific groups coupled with the presentation of the current norms and values and the image of life in a particular society (cf. Peeters and d’Haenens, 2005). Another presumption relates to the contribution of the media to the societal recognition and social legitimation of social problems, such as specific forms of injustice, and the social mobilization for action on behalf of an issue or group (cf. Hilgartner and Bosk, 1988).

The interest in *news* media is driven by their relative popularity among various population groups, their strong connection with politics, receptiveness of the most pertinent societal debates and effects news stories have on activating public expression and increasing individual involvement in public discussion of major issues of public policy and politics. As observed by King, Schneer and White (2017), exposure to news media encourages people to take public stands on specific issues, join national policy conversations and express themselves publicly.

To ensure continuity with previous WP4 studies, 4.3 in particular, we focus on a discursive event/media debate related to education. Our specific focus is *on the discursive representation of conflicts and tensions between different types of claims and claims of different social categories* (different cultural, social and demographic groups). This implies the choice of a casus that allows for a study of a variety/plurality of justice claims made by different social categories.

Case selection:

When selecting a specific casus/debate to analyse, please:

- try not to be too narrow in your choice to be able to account for tensions between different groups, so not only between an ethnic/racial minority and the majority but also conflicts/ tensions between various minority groups and/or within the supposed majority (e.g. between social classes); this means: do not focus on controversies related to but one group (e.g. Roma);
- try to bring the questions of class back in;
- try not to ‘lose’ the majoritarian claims to justice when focusing on the minority claims;
- try to focus on the parts of the debate that show tensions between various types of claims to justice and not only claims of various groups.

Media and item selection:

Currently most, if not all, news media outlets distribute their content via multiple channels – both traditional (print newspapers and news magazines, and broadcast news editions, talk shows, news analysis, etc.) and ‘new’ media (e.g. in the form of on-line news editions, news blogs). Moreover, most outlets typically promote their content via social media, such as Facebook or Twitter. In addition, ‘new’ news media encompass digital news platforms and a

variety of on-line platforms that offer, for example, investigative journalism, political analysis and/or current-affairs-commentary. An important role in the new media landscape is played by 'social media' understood as digital platforms for the creation and sharing of user-generated content (e.g. Boyd 2014 quoted in Lomborg 2017).

In the current study, we focus specifically on the news media (traditional and new) as well as news-related social media.

The choice of specific media to be included in the analysis shall be driven/related to their popularity among the different sections of the population and their ideological profile (and/or whom they claim to represent; whose perspective they claim to reflect/take). Please try to reach a balance between:

- **media representing different ideological stance** – please be clear what you understand by different 'stance': conservative, leftist, centrist may mean different things to different people and in different countries;
- **mainstream media** and **media addressing a specific target audience** (esp. vulnerable groups) – the popularity per se is not that important for our purposes; what counts more is that the medium reaches certain groups of audience/is popular among certain groups;
- **traditional and social media** (blogs, FB pages of various organisations); if the media market is (ideologically) consolidated, consider alternative channels, focus more on *social* media – think of blogs/forums used by the centrum/opposition; ethnic/minority media; channels of communication used by minority-organisations;

When selecting/sampling specific items (at least 25-30):

- focus on its relevance for the debates – the selection is to be purposeful and not random;
- focus on opinion pieces/editorials, etc. rather than 'items' that constitute a mere ('technical') description of an event;
- include items which use different modes (photo's, graphs, clips, audio podcasts, video reports, etc.)
- include items with users' comments
- **we expect you to analyze at least 25-30 'news items' (including all their multimodal content); the analysis of at least 1/3 of the items should be accompanied by the analysis of users' comments.**

IF you can't meet the sampling target, please get in touch.

When sampling users' comments:

- make accountable choices depending on the total number of comments and their character; in NL we decided to use two different methods for sampling the comments:
 - random (for seemingly low quality comments typical for Facebook and some popular digital news platforms); we scan randomly 15-20% of comments (but we are considering dropping those from the analysis because of their poor quality);
 - first 10 comments (or more until saturation is reached) for comments to high quality-news-items;

Methods of analysis:

The methods written in the project with respect to most of the WP4 research tasks include **qualitative content analysis** with elements of **discourse analysis**. In 4.4 we combine both methods in **frame analysis**.

Frame analysis (sociological approach):

The concept of ‘frame’ comes from the work of Goffman (1974), who saw ‘frames’ as a way of organizing experience. Put simply, ‘frames’ constitute a specific representation of a problem or phenomenon; they are conceptual tools used by both senders (e.g. media) and receivers (individual members of the public) of messages to convey, interpret and evaluate information (cf. De Vreese, 2005). While journalists inevitably ‘frame’ the presented reality in order to simplify it and make it accessible to a broad audience, the audience uses frames to give meaning and structure to the incoming information (Valkenburg et al., 1999). The use of frames invariably entails a consistent selection of what is being communicated coupled with the persistent emphasis on some and the exclusion of other elements of the reality. When reconstructing frames in analysed texts, researchers focus on the reasoning devices and framing devices. According to Van Gorp (2005), reasoning devices correspond to the four functions of frames as defined by Entman (1993): they define/describe the problem, they provide the moral evaluation of the problem, offer (or fail to offer) the causal interpretation of the problem and suggest/recommend a solution or treatment to the problem. Framing devices, on the other hand, encompass lexical choices, metaphors, catchphrases and allusions as well as a (thematic) selection of information, its sources, exemplification, choice of stereotypes and dramatic characters (Van Gorp, 2005).

Since contemporary media, especially social media, apply multiple modes to convey content, such as photographs, cartoons and drawings, maps, graphs, audio and video clips, Twitter posts and/or computer-generated visualizations, the analysis conducted for 4.4. will combine text analysis with the multimodal analysis. The various modes often complement each other. For example, visual modes often convey information that is not present in the linguistic layer of a text, such as racial, gendered, and religious messages. On the other hand, different modes may create some sort of dissonance, for example when a text on ethnically mixed education is accompanied by a photo which presents an ethnically homogenous teacher body. Our focus will be on the combined message sent via the different modes, their salience and likely impact on the audience.

Text analysis will be guided by a set of questions about (interrelated) **reasoning strategies** applied and related to:

- *Definitions – i.e. discursive construction*, explicit and implicit description, of phenomena, concepts, events and actors involved;
- *Causal interpretations*, explanations and/or attributions of responsibility, e.g. for grievances experienced by a specific group (specific minority or majority); presence/absence of agency (who/what is responsible, if anybody/anything?);
- *Solutions* advocated, explicitly or implicitly, e.g. to address the grievances; resolve conflicts; prevent or elevate injustice and/or secure justice;
- *Moral judgments* – including discursive classification of actors, events, phenomena, concepts (positively or negatively) as well as moral arguments evoked to back-up specific standpoints; justify or question the normative rightness of claims.

The analysis will also map some of the **linguistic devices** used, such as:

- *semantic devices* including the choice of words to denote evaluative attributions of positive or negative traits; synonyms and epithets; collocations
- *syntactic devices*, such as impersonal forms (e.g. as a way to refrain from ascribing responsibility);
- *rhetoric devices*, including allusions, metaphors, illustrations, similes, or irony; periphrases (i.e. indirect ways of expressing ideas, e.g. via extensive use of words)

We will pay attention to the **multimodality**, focusing on the **content** of:

- *visual elements*, especially photo's but also graphics, cartoons and drawings, short video's and podcasts;
- *other texts*, e.g. Twitter and FB messages/entries used as an illustration and/or to structure the story;
- *users' comments* to texts/items analysed;

We do not expect a very thorough and systematic linguistic and multimodal analysis, but awareness of how linguistic devices and various modes of communication used in various texts affect their meaning and convey specific meaning.

The analysis will account for the **contexts**, in which a text was produced/evolved as well as the broader social/political/historical/cultural contexts specific for a given country. Important here might be attention to events that triggered reporting on the issues of justice (publication of a report; an act of bullying; an educational success-story of a child from a ghetto). If possible, given the selected study material, try to account for *intertextuality*, i.e. the way texts are linked to other texts, such as references to topics, events, actors and phenomena.

Warning: few texts will include all the topics, reasoning and/or linguistic devices/elements characteristic of a given frame; in most of the cases, they will include or allude to just some elements. Also, specific texts (e.g. parliamentary debates, interviews) may include (elements of) various discourses.

Questions guiding the analysis

*We are interested on how the discourses identified differ on the following dimensions. The list of questions is very elaborate to show what kind of issues we are particularly interested in. **Not all questions, or even dimensions, will be applicable to every text/document** (or even frames identified in the course of analysis). In every document (and every frame) certain issues might be absent/ silenced and others might be given particular prominence. Paying attention to explicit and implicit content and to silences and omissions is a part of the analysis.*

1. Problem definition:

- 1.1. What is being problematized? Why – what is the core of the problem? Are there explicit references to justice? Or is it inferred from the descriptions of injustice/harm? What language is used? What exactly is understood as 'justice' and injustice/harm within the context of the case/issue described? What aspects of justice – representation, recognition, redistribution, other – does it touch upon?
- 1.2. Which minority groups (cultural, social and demographic) are the object (and subject!) of the debates? In what roles?
- 1.3. Who is construed as a victim/loser and who as a perpetrator/intended or unintended winner/beneficiary of injustice that takes/has taken place? What language is used to describe them? How, if at all, are they juxtaposed?

1.4. Is this specific case of injustice/harm presented as a reflection of broader social relations? Such as mistrust between specific social categories or minorities and (educational) institutions? How is it related to broader social/political/historical developments?

2. **(Moral) evaluations & conflicts/tensions**

2.1 Is this experience of harm/injustice contested/doubted/minimised? How? On what moral grounds?

2.2 Is the right/need/demand of the harmed/disadvantaged to change/redress/justice agreed upon/contested? How? On what moral grounds?

2.3 What conflicts/tensions are reflected/exposed in the media content (think about conflicts/tensions between social groups but also between institutions – media, government agencies, political parties, civil society organizations, etc.)? How are the sides of the conflict/tension framed? What is their (moral) evaluation? Are they juxtaposed? On what grounds?

2.4 What is the relative weight of the element of polarization?

2.5 How strong is the appeal to the feelings of insecurity and threat? What kind of insecurity or threat? On what grounds?

2.6 Is culture and/or history given an important place in interpretations of grievances or tensions or other minority issues/problems? Do these problems/tensions, if present, pertain to a particular sub-group within the minority/majority group or are they generalized to the group as a whole? Is there any sensitivity to intersectionality?

3. **Causal & treatment responsibility:**

3.1 What are the causes/sources of injustice/harm? Who/what is considered responsible? Is there discussion of systemic causality, such as institutional discrimination (what kind)? Individualized responsibility? Or is responsibility diffused or unattributed?

3.2 How is the grievance to be repaired? What solutions are being advocated? By whom is it to be repaired - who is presented as responsible for securing justice? [or what would need to be done and by whom to prevent injustice and/or restore justice] On what (moral) grounds?

3.3 Is there reference to sharing

4. **Common good & good life:**

4.1. What are the ultimate goals of addressing harm/injustice, e.g. redress, new social order, societal participation of minority groups? E.g. is inclusive education presented as beneficial for the society as a whole or just the (potentially) excluded groups? Whose (long-term) interests are secured by addressing the harm/injustice? How? Whose (long-term) interests are being endangered? How?

4.2 What vision(s) of common good emerge(s) from the material analyzed?

4.3 How is the role/function of education defined? Whose benefit (e.g. individual vs. specific group/community vs. society as a whole) is prioritized?

5. **Language (please pay attention to at least):**

5.1. What *lexical* items are used to define justice or injustice and to describe various groups of populations (minorities as well as the majority), institutional actors or entities involved (e.g. the government, the state, civil society), conflicts and alliances? (Think, for example, about the choice of words to denote evaluative attributions; synonyms and epithets used)

- 5.2 What syntactic devices are used to denote (lack of) agency, e.g. active/passive; the use of we- vs. they-form)?
- 5.3 What rhetoric devices, including allusions, metaphors, illustrations, similes, etc., are used to define and describe justice or injustice, groups of populations, conflicts and alliances?

6. *Multimodality*

- 6.1 Which modes (photos, audio and video clips, graphs, figures, drawings, twitter messages, etc.) are dominant in establishing the meaning of the text analysed? How? What functions do they have in the text? E.g. do they reinforce/contradict/nuance the meaning that is conveyed by the text? How?
- 6.2 How do the visual elements relate to the issues of justice discussed? E.g. do they focus on specific groups? agent/victim/context of injustice? Or institutions – which ones?
- 6.3 How do the visual elements convey certain racial, ethnic, religious, gender stereotypes? How does the message conveyed this way relate to the main (linguistic) message of the text analysed?
- 6.4 What is the final message sent via the integrated modes?

7. *The context:*

- 7.1 What triggered the reporting/publishing of an item? E.g. a report being published? an incident? Implementation of new law? How does this might affect the (tone of the) message conveyed by the text and, if relevant, the comments it generated?
- 7.2 What references are made to other texts/media output (inter-textuality)? In what character (polemics)?
- 7.3 What is the source/media channel? [this is going to be relevant for the interpretation of the results if discourses differ per ideological profile of the media channel/outlet] Is the item analysed or opinions presented in line with the ideological profile of the medium or rather contrasts with it? [think, for example, about an article in a leftist newspaper that presents very conservative views on Roma education].

8. *(Public) opinion as revealed via comments:*

- 8.1 What is the nature of the comments? Which aspects of the problem definition/evaluation/attribution of responsibility, etc., attract attention/elicit reaction? What kind of reaction – agreement/contestation? Which essential aspect remains without comment/reaction?
- 8.2 What is the moral evaluations of various sides/actors described?
- 8.3 What new dimensions with respect to justice are revealed in the comments?
- 8.4 Are there comments on-justice related issues that attract a longer exchange between media users? What issue is it? What is the bone of contention, if any?

9. *The debate in general:*

- 9.1 To what extent the claims of various groups are addressed in the debate? Whose claims remain undiscussed? Silenced?
- 9.2 What is the nature of the debate: What “actors” participate in the debate (e.g. political parties, governmental bodies, advocacies/NGO’s/grass-root organisations)? What is their status in the debate?
- 9.3 What is the nature of the debate: do actors talk to each other or pass each other (e.g. using independent channels of communication)?
- 9.4 Are the voices/perspectives of specific (minority) groups in question taken into the debate, either directly – their representatives take part in (open) debates or indirectly (they are being referred to in debates)?

9.5 Were there alliances formed around intersecting demands and grievances of different groups?

Auxiliary questions related to specific types of claims – examples: not all might be relevant to your case!

Recognition related claims

- a. What specifically recognitive claims are brought up in the discussions analyzed: persistency of stereotypes? Othering? Group homogenization? Negligence of identity needs? Other, e.g.:
- b. What myths/stereotypes about various groups are appealed to? What myths/stereotypes about various groups are being unmasked/contested? How? By whom? To what purpose (and/or whose benefit)?
- c. What curriculum related tensions are discussed? Are there claims related to non-inclusive curricula/necessity to adjust curriculum due to political correctness issues/presence of minority groups?
- d. Is education/classroom homogenization (e.g. in the form of non-differentiation of the student and/or teacher body in terms of ethnic, race, culture, social-class) addressed/problematised as unjust?
- e. Is othering applied in order to justify segregation/exclusion?
- f. How is intersectionality discussed, if at all? To what end?

Redistribution related claims

- g. What specifically redistributive claims are brought up in the discussions analyzed, e.g.:
- h. What socio-economic barriers to education/barriers to school success, are discussed, if at all? Whom do they apply to?
- i. What socio-economic advantages of education, such as future life choices, are discussed, if at all? Whom do they apply to?

Representation related claims

- j. What participation related claims are made? Whose participation? What kind of participation? What does it involve? E.g. presence of minority parents/working class parents, etc. in school boards; minority/working class representative in curriculum commissions? What is the intended/recommended/demanded scope of that participation? How local/national an issue is at stake? How is this participation (to be) legitimized? How is it (to be) secured?
- k. Is (non-)representation, e.g. of minority parents/ representatives, in decision-making bodies, etc. discussed in terms of “justice”/ “injustice”?

Country reports – preliminary guidelines

- **Length:** 8000 to 10 000 words (excl. appendices)
- **Format:**
 1. Case description (elaborated and adjusted following the comments received for screening), incl. its relevance for justice related debates;
 2. Choice of media – account for all choices made (= why these media sources considering the media landscape in the country?);
 3. Sample and sampling method media items – account for all choices made (= what criteria used to select items for the analysis + structure of the sample?)

4. Results per frames/discourses identified (NOT per medium and/or ideological position of actors involved in the debate); in each frame:
 - a section on understanding of various justice claims
 - a section of the causal and treatment responsibility for (in)justice
 - a section of interplay/tensions/conflicts between various claims and claims of various groups
 - a section on the underpinning vision of society – ideas about common good, good life, inclusion/exclusion
 - a section of linguistic devices and multimodality and their role in conveying the message
 - a section on whose frame it is (i.e. who presents justice in this specific way)
5. Conclusion – linking frames with broader justice debate; discussing the nature of the debate; discussing implications of the specific frames for various (minority) groups
6. Appendices: (1) media landscapes per country (see Dutch screening document as an example): (2) list of analyzed items.

References & recommended readings

- De Vreese, C. (2005) News framing: Theory and typology. *Information Design Journal* 13(1): 51-62.
- Entman R (1993) Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication* 43(4): 51-58.
- Goffman, E. (1974) *Frame Analysis: An Essay on the Organization of Experience*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Hilgartner, S. and Bosk, C. (1988) The rise and fall of social problems: A public arenas model. *American Journal of Sociology* 94(1): 53-78.
- King, G., Schmeer, B. and White, A. (2017) How the news media activate public expression and influence national agendas. *Science* Vol. 358(6364): 776-780. DOI: 10.1126/science.aao1100
- Lomborg, S. (2017) A state of flux: Histories of social media research. *European Journal of Communication* Vol. 32(1) 6-15.
- Peeters, A. and d'Haenens, L. (2005) 'Bridging or Bonding? Relationship between Integration and Media Use among Ethnic Minorities in the Netherlands.' *Communications* 30 (2): 201-31.
- Valkenburg, P., Semetko, H. and De Vreese, C. (1999) The effects of news frames on readers' thoughts and recall. *Communication Research* 26(5): 550-569.
- Van Gorp B (2005) Where is the frame? Victims and intruders in the Belgian press coverage of the asylum issue. *European Journal of Communication* 20(4): 484-507.

(Other) examples frame analysis/ multimodal analysis:

- Cvetkovic, I. and Pantic, M. (2018) Multimodal Discursivity: Framing European Union Borders in Live-Blogs. *Journal of Communication Inquiry* Vol. 42(4) 318-339.
- Kress, G. (2010) *Multimodality: A social semiotic approach to contemporary communication*. New York City, NY: Routledge.

- Kress, G., & Van Leeuwen, T. (1996) *Reading images: The grammar of visual design*. London, England: Routledge.
- Kress, G., & Van Leeuwen, T. (2001) *Multimodal discourse*. New York, NY: Bloomsbury Academic.
- Lepianka, D. (2015) Images of poverty in a selection of the Polish daily press. *Current Sociology* Vol. 63(7) 999–1016
- Coleman, R. (2010) Framing the pictures in our heads: Exploring the framing and agenda setting effects of visual images. In: P. D'Angelo & J. A. Kuypers (Eds.) *Doing news framing analysis: Empirical and theoretical perspectives*. New York City, NY: Routledge: 233–261.
- Messaris, P., & Abraham, L. (2001) The role of images in framing news stories. In: S. D. Reese, O. H. Gandy, & A. E. Grant (Eds.) *Framing public life: Perspectives on media and our understanding of the social world*. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum: 215–226.
- Powell, T. E., Boomgaarden, H. G., De Swert, K., & de Vreese, C. H. (2015) A clearer picture: The contribution of visuals and text to framing. *Journal of Communication* 65: 997–1017.